

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: October 21, 2014

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 7th Floor New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 12:45 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:30 p.m.

Members present: Wayne Troyer, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members Absent:

I. AGENDA

1. Approval of the minutes of the June ARC Meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes with corrections.

By: John Klingman

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

Approval of the minutes of the July ARC Meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes with corrections.

By: John Klingman

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 3137-39 Constance Street:

Application: Construct three-story, multi-family development (one level of off street parking at grade and two levels of residential above) on existing vacant lot

Motion: The ARC reiterated its previous concern that the building is too massive for the site, particularly in light of new information regarding the zoning of the property, which has been determined by the Department of Safety & Permits to be RD-3 and not B1-A, as previously understood. The ARC agreed it could not comment on the response to its previous recommendations at this time because the proposal radically exceeds what is now understood to be the zoning of the property. John Klingman made a motion to defer further review of the project pending resolution of the zoning.

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments: Several members of the public spoke in opposition to the proposal.

3. 832 Bartholomew Street

Application: Construction of thirteen, two-story single family residential buildings on individual lots of record.

Motion: At the 9/23/14 ARC meeting, the ARC had recommended modifying the entry porticos at the front elevations of the proposed buildings along Burgundy Street. The pediments should be simplified and there should be single columns as opposed to double. Full width porches should be added at the front elevations of the proposed buildings along Bartholomew Street. The ganged windows on the side elevations should be changed to single to accommodate the possibility of shutters. There should also be more order to the placement of windows instead of the random and arbitrary placement shown. They should generally be aligned floor to floor. The windows on the first floor of the Burgundy Street buildings are an odd size. They should either extend to the floor with a guard rail or have a 3'-0" sill height. There should be sills beneath windows without aprons.

The roofs should have ridge tiles on sloped ridges as well as top ridges back to ridge vents. The gable-on-hip proportions need to be re-worked. The hip portion is very low. Louvered shutters are more appropriate than the panel shutters shown. Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer the matter and request that the applicant return with revised drawings reflecting the recommendations of the ARC.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments: One speaker spoke regarding the zoning of the site.

4. 2618 St. Thomas Street

Application: Construct camelback, single-family, residence on an existing vacant lot.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level:

- The roof at the front (St. Thomas St.) of the first story should be hipped as shown in the front elevation, not gable-end as shown in the side elevation.
- The overhang at the front of the camelback should be eliminated.
- The window and door on the front elevation are still not correctly spaced; the openings should be centered on their respective bays as determined by dividing the front elevation in half longitudinally and centering the opening in each half, respectively.
- The trim around the doors and windows needs to be correctly detailed, including wider trim boards, a drip edge, and a correctly detailed transom and transom bar above the doors.
- The doors should be single pane over single panel or four-panel.
- Fencing and paving needs to be shown in the final drawings.

Seconded: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

The ARC then took up Item 14 out of order.

14. 3911 Dauphine Street

Application: Construct 280 sq ft 1st floor addition and 376 2nd floor addition.

Motion: Wayne Troyer made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. All finishes and new construction to match existing and new windows shall be double hung.

Seconded: Crystal Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

The ARC then returned to the regular agenda

5. 641 St. Ferdinand Street

Application: Construct new, one-story, 2600 sq ft, single-family residence on existing vacant lot

Motion: The ARC agreed the changes to the roof form at the corner of St. Ferdinand St. and Royal St. are an appropriate response to their previous concerns. Wayne Troyer made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level:

- The corrugated metal siding should have a groove depth greater than 1/2". The ARC suggested a minimum of 1-1/2".
- The awning windows on the St. Ferdinand St. elevation should be moved higher in the opening and may not open over the public right of way. The ARC also suggested two awning windows in each opening for a four part division.
- The gutter downspout(s) and/or leader(s) should be located to the interior of the property.
- The ARC suggested operable clerestory windows on the Royal Street elevation to increase the opportunity for passive ventilation.

Seconded: Rick Fifield

Result: Beth Jacob

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 921 Race St:

Application: Conversion of 7-unit apartment building to three units and one garage; addition of 2nd Floor.

Motion: Wayne Troyer made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 2505 Carondelet Street

Application: Partial demolition and construction of rear addition

Motion: The ARC agreed that as much of the existing material of the front portion of the building to be retained should be restored and preserved as possible. The ARC agreed that without clear evidence indicating the openings on the first floor of the front facade had been widened, they should not be altered. The three individual awnings should be repaired or rebuilt, as necessary, to match existing. The scalloped metal hoods above the clerestory windows should be retained and restored. The existing concrete stoop should be retained across the face of the building. The existing single-hung windows should be restored to allow for egress as required, or could be restored to the plate glass windows shown in the historic photograph.

The ARC agreed the revisions to the addition and connection are an appropriate response to their previous recommendations. The ARC agreed the board and batten siding at the third floor is not appropriate, and the siding should be weatherboards or metal. The ARC agreed the extension of the overhang at the third floor is atypical and does not seem to serve the intended purpose of shading the fenestration due to the orientation of the building, and recommended shortening the overhang. Additionally, the ARC questioned the structural feasibility of having the wall of the third floor extend past the wall of the second floor below, but not to the edge of the building.

John Klingman made a motion to recommend the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC and the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 1919 Burgundy Street

Application: Addition of rooftop deck to penthouse addition previously granted conceptual approval.

Motion: The ARC agreed the proposed changes are minimally visible and John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level, provided a fascia is added around the edge of the roof over the lower deck to conceal the slope of the roof and mimic the clean, rectilinear geometry of the building.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 628 Elysian Fields Avenue

Application: Addition of new metal facade to existing building.

Motion: The ARC agreed the parapet addition is appropriate; however, the metal siding is not appropriate and should instead be stucco. The ARC suggested a more intentionally designed handrail at the ramp. John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 3316 Prytania Street

Application: Demolition of existing building and construction of a new, three-story, 5118 sf single-family residence.

Motion: The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The floor to ceiling heights should be increased to 12'-0" at both floors.
- The front entry door needs further study. The door may be inset. The trim around the door should be more substantial. The applicant should refer to similar, historic Greek Revival buildings for the appropriate proportions, dimensions, and detailing.
- The depth of the front gallery should be increased to at least 6'-0".
- The bay windows on the left (Toledano St.) side elevation do not make sense architecturally because they overlook a narrow alley with the adjacent building and should be eliminated. The

ARC suggested mirroring the building in the same location so that the bays could overlook the landscaping and the driveway on the right (Louisiana Ave.) side of the property. The ARC also suggested a two-story bay, similar to the one on the property across the street, 3313 Prytania Street.

- The windows on the right side elevation appear low and narrow. The windows should have an approximately 1:2 ratio, such as 3'-0"x6'-0", and a standard sill height of 32"-36". The windows at the side elevations should typically be 6/6.
- The aprons below the window sills should be eliminated.
- The horizontal trim band between the first and second floors on the side elevations should be eliminated.
- The entablature of the front porch should extend past the edges of the roof and terminate on the sides of the building. Refer to 3313 Prytania St. for appropriate detailing and proportions.

Beth Jacob made a motion to defer further review of the project pending incorporation of the ARC recommendations.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time Elliott Perkins left the meeting.

11.1221 Orange Street

Application: Construct a 2-story accessory structure with 2-car garage on 1st floor (no plumbing) and art studio on 2nd floor.

Motion: The ARC recommended reconfiguring the floor plan of the proposed accessory building to allow more space between it and the main building. By decreasing the width of the accessory building and articulating it in a carriage house vocabulary, it will read less like a suburban residential building. The ARC agreed that the proposal with the shallow roof form behind a parapet would be more successful .

Crystal Mitchell made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the proposed changes and the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 2538 N. Rampart Street

Application: Construct three-story, 2300 sq ft, single-family residence on existing vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC agreed the overall massing and siting of the building is appropriate; however, the proportions, quantity, and detailing of the architectural elements in general need further study. The ARC expressed specific concern about the front entry sequence, noting the exposed recess at the front (N. Rampart St.) entry before the gates presents a security risk. Furthermore, since a historicized design language has been chosen, the entry should emulate typical recessed entries on similar historic townhouses in the Marigny local historic district, and recessing the gates to create a three part entry sequence is not typical. The iron gates should be relocated to the front of the entry and must open inward. An entry in the side wall along Music St. is not necessary; however, the wall should be in the same plane as the walls of the main building and the garage.

The ARC also specifically noted the size of the windows and pattern of fenestration and dimensions of the balcony likewise should emulate the proportions and patterns found in the local historic district. The windows should have an approximately 1:2 ratio, such as 3'-0"x6'-0"; 4'-0" is atypically wide. The small window and truncating the balcony on the front facade at the bathroom is not appropriate. The openings should be evenly spaced into three-bays and the balcony should extend the full width of the front facade; if a full-height window is not desired at the bathroom, a faux opening with shutters in the closed position is appropriate. One or two windows need to be added at the second floor of the main building on the Music St. facade.

Beth Jacob made a motion to defer further review of the project pending incorporation of the ARC recommendations. The ARC also recommended making an appointment to meet with Staff to review the proposal prior to returning to ARC.

Seconded: Wayne Troyer

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

13.717 Soraparu Street

Application: Installation of new columns and two (2) new windows.

Motion:

By:

Seconded:

Result:

In favor:

Opposed:

15.3430 St. Claude Avenue

Application: Complete construction of an existing "gazebo" structure in backyard. Work begun without CofA.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the peaked portion of the structure should be removed and the existing gabled roof form should be extruded across the existing footprint. The opening on the street facing side should be removed and continuous siding installed. Wayne Troyer made a motion to recommend retention with the recommended changes.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

16.1924 Burgundy Street

Application: Demolition of existing rear structure and construction of two (2) single unit structures and one 3 unit structure.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result:

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

17.1922 Burgundy Street

Application: Camelback addition to existing raised basement residence.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Wayne Troyer, Beth Jacob, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

At this time, there was no further business to discuss, and the meeting was adjourned.