

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Meeting Minutes

Date: December 12, 2014

Location: City Council Chamber, 1300 Perdido Street, New Orleans, LA

Called to order: 9:00 a.m

Adjourned: 11:30 a.m.

Commissioners present: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin
Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Jeanne Nathan

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Katye Fayard

Commissioners absent: Matthew Lindsay

I. Minutes

A. Minutes of the November 13, 2014 meeting

Motion: Approve the meeting minutes.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Ed de Montluzin

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

II. CONSENT AGENDA

- A. 2536-2540 N Rampart St: Jane B Rinck, applicant; John L Royes, Jane B Rinck, owner; Construct three-story, 2300 sq ft, single-family residence on existing vacant lot.
- B. 2721 N Rampart St: Robert Cangelosi, Jr., applicant; Tierney A Kelley, owner; Camelback addition to existing residential building.
- C. 833 N Villere St: Perle Construction Material, LLC, applicant; James Jr Andrews, owner; New construction of a 1511 s.f. single family dwelling.
- D. 1517 Terpsichore St: Julie Simpson, applicant; Petite Urbana, LLC, owner; Camelback addition to an existing residential building.
- E. 3300-3302 Constance St: Jessica O'Dell, applicant; Timothy S Mehok, owner; Construction of 550 sq. ft. camelback addition.
- F. 332 Vallette St: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Phillip E Croan, owner; Construct 558 sf garage and 472 sf cabana with outdoor kitchen in rear yard.
- G. 715-717 2nd St: Geoffrey Burnett, applicant; Geoffrey R Burnett, owner; Restoration of side gallery and 525 sf addition to rear of building.
- H. 3019 St Thomas St: Charles Berg, applicant; Edward J Franklin, owner; Demolition of existing rear additions and construction of new, one-story rear addition.
- I. 832 Bartholomew St: Greg Fuselier, applicant; , owner; Conceptual review of thirteen, 2-story, 1900 sq ft single family residential buildings on thirteen individual lots of record (property to be subdivided).
- J. 501 Andry St: Ray Croft, applicant; Willie Sr Bell, owner; New construction of a 1700 square foot residential building on existing vacant lot.

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda.

By: Calvin Alexander

Second: Jenna Burke

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, Katy Fayard arrived.

III. NEW BUSINESS WORK APPLICATIONS

A. 721-23 Eliza Street

Application: Remove existing slate roof and install architectural grade asphalt shingles.

Motion: Conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Heather Szapary

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Jeanne Nathan, Katy Fayard

Opposed:

B. 904-906 4th Street

Application: Removal of existing window on left side elevation (second window from front).

Motion: Deny the application to remove a historic window and install a stove vent.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Jeanne Nathan, Katy Fayard

Opposed:

C. 720 Jackson Avenue

Application: Install nine (9) cellular antennas on bell tower.

Motion: The Commission agreed that the schematic drawings provided were not adequate for them to fully understand the proposal. Greg Hackenberg made a motion to defer action on the matter until the next Commission meeting so that the applicant could provide more detailed information that should address the following concerns:

- Provide graphic and written description of all equipment that will be visible from the public right of way including precise sizes and locations.
- Revised drawings should be less schematic and technical and should be easier to comprehend.
- Provide information about any modifications to the existing building including penetrations to existing masonry required to accommodate equipment, conduit, etc.
- A 3-D model was requested for review showing to scale all visible equipment.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: John Deveney

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Jeanne Nathan, Katy Fayard

Opposed:

Comment: The Commission requested that the staff pursue a violation case for the antennas installed in deviation of the drawing.

D. 5450 Dauphine Street

Application: Installation of highly visible solar panels.

Motion: Deny application.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Ed de Montluzin

Result: Passed.

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Jeanne Nathan, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

E. 1712 Louisa Street

Application: Demolish existing residential building; construct new single family residential building.

Motion: Grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Jeanne Nathan, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

F. 1235 Constance Street

Application: New construction of a single family residential building.

Motion: Conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Ed Demontluzin

Seconded: John Deveney

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Jeanne Nathan, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

IV. OLD BUSINESS DEMOLITION APPLICATIONS

A. 822-24 1ST Street

Application: Demolition of existing building and construction of new, two-family, camelback residence.

Motion: Allow demolition and grant conceptual approval with details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc

Opposed: Jeanne Nathan, John Deveney, Jenna Burke, Katye Fayard

Comment: Grace Hill, a neighbor spoke against the demolition. Ramsay Marcello, a neighbor spoke in opposition to the demolition. Joel Ross spoke in opposition to the demolition. Sidney Terry spoke in opposition to the demolition.

V. NEW BUSINESS DEMOLITION APPLICATIONS

A. 2600 Ursulines Avenue

Application: This item was withdrawn.

B. 535 Caffin Avenue

Application: Demolition.

Motion: Defer matter to the January meeting

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Jeanne Nathan, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

C. 2322 St. Thomas Street

Application: Demolition.

Motion: Defer matter to January meeting.

By: Dwight Norton

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Jeanne Nathan, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

At this time, Jeanne Nathan left the meeting.

VI. OLD BUSINESS RETENTION APPLICATIONS

A. 921 Atlantic Avenue

Application: Retention of four (4) surface mounted vinyl windows on left side elevation with wood screens added; work completed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of the vinyl windows provided the windows are recessed and appropriate wood screens are installed, with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Heather Szapary

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

B. 1131 Columbus Street

Application: Retention of dormer addition.

Motion: Defer action to January meeting.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Dwight Norton

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

VII. NEW BUSINESS RETENTION APPLICATIONS

A. 1512 St. Philip Street

Application: Retention of Bermuda shutters and box columns installed without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: This item was withdrawn.

B. 524 Delery Street

Application: Retention of wind turbines installed on roof in violation of HDLC Guidelines.

Motion: This item was withdrawn.

C. 1522 St. Bernard Avenue

Application: Retention of an ATM installed without Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of the ATM as installed as there is not another location to where it could be practically and securely moved.

By: John Deveney

Seconded: Katye Fayard

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Katye Fayard

Opposed: Calvin Alexander

Comments:

D. 2834-2836 Annunciation St

Application: Retention of inappropriate security doors.

Motion: Defer matter to January meeting.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 2830 Annunciation Street

Application: Retention of vinyl window installed at side elevation without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny the application for retention of the window as installed, but allow a window that complies with the Guidelines with details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Katye Fayard

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 426 Bouny Street

Application: Retention of front windows and side overhangs.

Motion: Defer matter to January meeting.

By: Heather Szapary

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Ed deMontluzin, Heather Szapary, Jenna Burke, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Katy Fayard

Opposed:

Comments: