

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Meeting Minutes

Date: October 8, 2015

Location: City Council Chamber, 1300 Perdido Street, New Orleans, LA, 70112

Called to order: 1:10 p.m.

Adjourned: 6:00 p.m.

Commissioners present: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Jeanne Nathan

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Calvin Alexander

Commissioners absent: Katye Fayard, Andrew P. Sanchez, Paul Harang, Jennifer Greene, Dwight Norton

I. Minutes of the September 10, 2015 meeting

Motion: Approve the meeting minutes.

By: Tony French

Seconded: Jeanne Nathan

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time Calvin Alexander arrived

II. CONSENT AGENDA

- A. 1432 3Rd St: Gene Guidry, applicant; M Blackburn, owner; New Construction of a single family residential building. **Withdrawn**
- B. 1008 Delaronde St: Douglas Mayo, applicant; Henrik A Larsen, owner; New Construction of a single family residential building.
- C. 1023 Patterson St: Douglas Mayo, applicant; Old Algiers Properties LLC, owner; New Construction of a single family residential building.
- D. 1223 Barracks St: Phyllis Scarsons, applicant; Historical Happenings LLC, owner; New Construction of a single family residential building.
- E. 1612 St Philip St: Louis Charbonnet, applicant; Home Charbonnet-Labat Funeral, owner; New construction of a one story shed.
- F. 816 8Th St: Jacqueline Case, applicant; Michael Anthony Carter, owner; Camelback addition to a single family residential building.
- G. 2401 St Claude Ave: Douglas Mayo, applicant; Arcadia Court LLC, owner; Construct new single story addition to an existing residential building.
- H. 528 1St St: Rachel Davis, applicant; Turnbull Bakeries, Inc of La., owner; New Construction of a single family residential building.

- I. 2841 Livaudais St: Rachel Davis, applicant; Alan D Brock, owner; New Construction of a single family residential building.
- J. 731 Harmony St: Kristine Shull, applicant; John Jr Manuel, owner; Camelback addition to single family residential building.
- K. 2901 Annunciation St: Robert Pell, applicant; La3 Holdings LLC, Leese Properties LLC, owner; New construction of a single family residential building.
- L. 512 Washington Ave, 512-514: Charles Davis, applicant; Vyntrella B Menzies, owner; Renovate building, rear addition and new roof configuration.
- M. 915 Franklin Ave: Samuel A Bavido, applicant; Christine M Lehmann, owner; Two story addition to a single family residential building.
- N. 1353 Magazine St: JC Carroll, applicant; Summit Nola Iii, LLC, owner; New construction of a two family townhouse.
- O. 1355 Magazine St: JC Carroll, applicant; Summit Nola Iii, LLC, owner; New construction of a two family townhouse.
- P. 1925 Esplanade Ave: Kim Finney, applicant; Glen D Miller, owner; Modification of and rear addition to an existing side hall residential building.
- Q. 1502 Elysian Fields Ave: Douglas Mayo, applicant; Scott E Veazey, owner; Addition of a guardrail, stair and wheelchair lift on a designated landmark.
- R. 1823 Burgundy St: Leland Vandeventer, applicant; Liddell H Hemeter, owner; Construct camelback addition.

Motion: Suspend the rules.

By: Renee Lapeyrolierie

Seconded: Anne Redd

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolierie, Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Jeanne Nathan, Calvin Alexander

Opposed:

Comments:

Motion: Remove Item D to the regular agenda.

By: Renee Lapeyrolierie

Seconded: Ed de Montluzin

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolierie, Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Jeanne Nathan, Calvin Alexander

Opposed:

Comments:

Motion: Reinstate the rules.

By: Renee Lapeyrolierie

Seconded: Ed de Montluzin

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolierie, Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Jeanne Nathan, Calvin Alexander

Opposed:

Comments:

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda.

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Seconded: Jeanne Nathan

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Jesse LeBlanc, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Jeanne Nathan, Calvin Alexander

Opposed:

Comments:

III. DISCUSSION OF SOLAR PANEL GUIDELINES

Motion: Keep existing guidelines but add provisos that all installations must be rectilinear and the Staff shall reassess the guidelines in one year.

By: Ed deMontluzin

Seconded: Anne Redd

Result: No action

In favor: Anne Redd, Tony French, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin

Opposed: Jeanne Nathan, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander

Comments: Michael Murphy and David Denny, representatives of the solar panel industry, spoke in favor of the proposed changes.

Motion: Defer action to the November meeting.

By: Jeanne Nathan

Seconded: John Deveney

Result: No action

In favor: Jeanne Nathan, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Tony French, John Deveney,

Opposed: Anne Redd, Ed deMontluzin

Comments:

Motion: Approve proposed guidelines changes provided highly visible installations still require Commission approval.

By: Ed de Montluzin

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Jeanne Nathan, Calvin Alexander

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time John Deveney left the meeting.

IV. OLD BUSINESS WORK APPLICATIONS – SOLAR PANELS

A. 2459 Burgundy Street

Application: Install highly visible solar panels.

Motion: Approve solar panels on right side elevation but not on left side elevation due to its visibility.

By: Ed de Montluzin

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: No action

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander

Opposed: Jeanne Nathan

Comments:

The Commisison then returned to Item I D, 1223 Barracks Street

B. 1223 Barracks Street

Application: New Construction of a single family residential building.

Motion: Grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Renee Lapeyroterie

Seconded: Jeanne Nathan

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Jeanne Nathan, Calvin Alexander

Opposed:

Comments:

The Commission then returned to the regular agenda.

B. 1222 Clouet Street

Application: Install highly visible solar panels.

Motion: Deny application.

By: Tony French

Result: Calvin Alexander

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 3519 Burgundy Street

Application: Install highly visible solar panels.

Motion: Deny the application due to the visual prominence of the proposed location for solar panels

By: Tony French

Result: Anne Redd

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

V. NEW BUSINESS SOLAR PANEL APPLICATIONS

A. 1858 Burgundy Street

Application: Install highly visible solar panels.

Motion: Deny application.

By: Tony French

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 820 Deslonde Street

Application: Install highly visible roof panels.

Motion: This item was withdrawn.

C. 1707 2nd Street, Apt. 5

Application: Install highly visible solar panels.

Motion: Approve the application due to lack of visibility from the public right-of-way.

By: Ed deMontluzin

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 1707 2nd Street, Apt. 1

Application: Install highly visible solar panels.

Motion: Approve the application due to lack of visibility from the public right-of-way.

By: Ed deMontluzin

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 620 Spain Street

Application: Install highly visible solar panels.

Motion: Approve the application provided the proposed panels can be located on the roof as per the HDLC Guidelines.

By: Ed deMontluzin

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

VI. OLD BUSINESS WORK APPLICATIONS

A. 2501 St. Claude Avenue

Application: Demolition of vacant structure and construction of new commercial building.

Motion: Defer application to november meeting.

By: John Deveney

Second: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Comments: After discussion, John Deveney withdrew his motion and Renee Lapeyrolerie withdrew her second.

Motion: Grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the ARC and Staff level.

By: John Deveney

Seconded: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

VII. NEW BUSINESS WORK APPLICATIONS

A. 2616 Royal Street

Motion: Addition of two dormers to roof of an existing single family residential building.

By: This item was withdrawn.

B. 3316 Prytania Street

Application: Demolition of building and construction of a two-story double.

Motion: Defer application to November meeting to allow time for applicant to meet with the neighborhood association and for the building inspector to perform an interior inspection.

By: Anne Redd

Seconded: Tony French

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 2837 Livaudais Street

Application: Demolition and new construction of a single family residence.

Motion: Conceptual approval of the application for demolition and new construction with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Anne Redd

Seconded: Ed deMontluzin

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

VIII. OLD BUSINESS DEMOLITION APPLICATIONS

A. 436 Tupelo Street

Application: Demolition of building.

Motion: Defer action on the application until the December commission meeting so that the applicant can provide redevelopment plans or place the building on the market for sale.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Jeanne Nathan

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 820 Vallette Street

Application: Demolition of building.

Motion: Deny application.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, the Commission recessed for ten minutes.

IX. NEW BUSINESS DEMOLITION APPLICATIONS

A. 1405 Clouet Street

Application: Demolition of building.

Motion: Approve application.

By: Tony French

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 1831 St. Ann Street

Application: Demolition of building.

Motion: Approve application

By: Renee Lapeyroterie

Seconded: Ed deMontluzin

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 408 St. Maurice Avenue

Application: Demolition of building.

Motion: Deny application

By: Jeanne Nathan

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

During discussion of the motion, the applicant, William McGowan requested a deferral. Calvin Alexander withdrew his 2nd for the motion. Mrs. Nathan did not withdraw her motion. Mr. French then seconded the motion.

Result: No action

In favor: Tony French, Jeanne Nthan, Anne Redd, Ed de Montluzin

Opposed: Ed de Montluzin, Greg Hackenberg, Calvin Alexander, Renee Lapeyroterie

Comments: Maryanne Miller of the PRC and neighbor John Koerfel spoke in opposition to the application.

Motion; Defer matter to the December meeting.
By: Calvin Alexander
Seconded: Ann Redd
Result: Passed
In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan
Opposed:
Comments:

X. OLD BUSINESS RETENTION APPLICATIONS

A. 1233 Ursulines Avenue

Motion: Deny the retention of the window on the Treme Street elevation, but voted to grant retention of the windows on the rear elevation.
By: Rene Lapeyrolerie
Seconded: Jeanne Nathan
Result: Passed
In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan
Opposed:
Comments:

B. 200 Opelousas Avenue

Application: This item was withdrawn.

C. 1016 Independence Street

Application: Retention of vinyl windows and removal of ridge tiles.
Motion: Deny the application for retention.
By: Tony French
Seconded: Renee Lapeyrolerie
Result: Passed
In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan
Opposed:
Comments:

D. 623 Frenchmen

Application: This item was withdrawn.

E. 800 Louisiana Avenue

Application: This item was withdrawn.

F. 200 Opelousas Street

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting to provide the chance for the applicant to work with HDLC Staff to determine the best way to bring the deck into compliance with the Guidelines.
By: Heather Szapary
Seconded: John Deveney
Result: Passed
In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan
Opposed:
Comments:

X. NEW BUSINESS RETENTION APPLICATIONS

A. 4209 Burgundy Street

Application: Retention of vinyl windows.

Motion: Deny the application for retention but grant six months to bring the building into compliance with HDLC Guidelines

By: Tony French

Seconded: Jeanne Nathan

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolierie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 500 Tupelo Street

Application: Retention of vinyl windows.

Motion: Deny the application for retention but grant six months to bring the building into compliance with HDLC Guidelines

By: Tony French

Seconded: Jeanne Nathan

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolierie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 701 Congress Street

Application: Retention of installation of inappropriate windows, wood grained Hardie Plank and "R" panel fencing.

Motion: Deny the retention of the R-panel fencing and allow retention of the windows and wood grained Hardieplank siding provided an additional opaque fence is installed to mitigate visibility of this condition.

By: Tony French

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolierie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 342 Elmira Avenue

Application: Replace 21 windows in single family residential building with vinyl.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the November commission meeting so that a site visit to a property with the proposed LAS windows can be conducted.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Jeanne Nathan

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolierie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

- E. 4425 St. Charles Avenue
Application: Retention of window replacement.
Motion: This item was withdrawn.
- F. 1015 Kerlerec Street
Application: Retention of modifications to front elevation.
Motion: Defer action on this application until the November meeting.
By: Tony French
Seconded: Calvin Alexander
Result: Passed
In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan
Opposed:
Comments:
- G. 3411 N. Rampart Street
Application: Retention of through-wall AC units installed without CofA.
Motion: Approve the application for retention. However, when the AC units require replacement, through-wall equipment will not be permitted. New equipment must be compliant with HDLC Guidelines
By: Tony French
Seconded: Jeanne Nathan
Result: Passed
In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan
Opposed:
Comments:
- H. 824 Orange Street
Application: Retention of chimney removal.
Motion: Defer item to November meeting.
By: Calvin Alexander
Seconded: Renee Lapeyroterie
Result: Passed
In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan
Opposed:
Comments:
- I. 3300 Magazine Street
Application: Retention of aluminum window and balcony.
Motion: Deny the application for retention. The vinyl window should be replaced with a 6/6, true divided light, wood window and the handrail corrected to match HDLC detail.
By: Greg Hackenberg
Seconded: Ed deMontluzin
Result: Passed
In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan
Opposed:
Comments:

J. 1032 Marais Street

Application: Retention of construction of a residential building in deviation of approved plans.

Motion: Defer matter to November meeting.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

K. 2532 N Rampart Street

Application: Retention of removal of full length windows, installation of inappropriate windows including painted on muntins, installation of gable window, AC units of roof, wind turbines and modification of existing openings on a residential building.

Motion: Defer matter to November meeting.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

L. 1612 St. Philip Street

Application: This item was withdrawn.

M. 3901 Marais Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate fan light door.

Motion: Defer matter to November meeting.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Tony French

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

N. 1229 Desire Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate doors, windows, railing and removal of transom.

Motion: Deny the application for retention but grant one year for to complete the work.

By: Tony French

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyroterie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

O. 934 Desire Street

Application: Retention of work done without, or in deviation of, a CofA.

Motion: Defer matter to November meeting.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Tony French

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

P. 1563 Chippewa Street

Application: Retention of windows installed in deviation of approved drawings.

Motion: Grant retention of the windows as installed provided appropriate window trim is added as directed by the HDLC Staff.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

Q. 2820 St. Claude Avenue

Application: Retention of horizontal board fencing installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny application.

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: No action

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander

Opposed: Jeanne Nathan

Comments:

R. 2706 St. Claude Avenue

Application: Retention of exterior conduits installed without C of A.

Motion: Defer Application to November meeting.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anne Redd, Greg Hackenberg, Tony French, Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

There being no further business to attend to, to meeting was adjourned.