

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission  
Architectural Review Committee  
Meeting Minutes

Date: July 23, 24

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, LA, 70112.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Members present: Daniel Zangara, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Jonathan Tate

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting: Cynthia Dubberley

Members absent:

---

**I. Roll Call**

**II. Minutes of Tuesday June 18<sup>th</sup>, 2024 meeting**

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Daniel Zangara, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Jonathan Tate

Opposed:

Comments:

Cynthia Dubberley arrived

**III. Regular Agenda**

A. 420-450 Celeste St, 1770 Tchoupitoulas St, 441 Nuns St

Application: Changes to the elevations of the new construction of a 75,515 SF four-story, multi-family commercial building at a Landmark.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Daniel Zangara, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: Johnathan Tate recuses self for this vote

B. 1622 Toledano St

Application: New construction of a 10,300 SF three-story, multi-family residential building including demolition of an existing Contributing rated one-story, single-family residential building to grade.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval of the massing and site plan, with the final details of the façade composition and fencing to return for additional ARC review once further developed. The ARC agreed that:

- The overall appearance of the building has improved, and the current design appears more subdued and more compatible with the surrounding context.
- The proposed front yard fencing and gates appear to be appropriate for the overall site plan, particularly because this allows for the removal of the previous garage doors and enhances the ground-floor pedestrian experience.
  - o However, the picket metal fencing appears to be too traditional for the overall building design and could be more contemporary in appearance and detailing. The ARC noted that a shorter version of the proposed horizontally banded gates could work.
- The composition and proportions of the façade should be further studied and developed so that there is more balance and symmetry.
  - o The vertical columns on the façade appear to be a bit too wide, and the horizontal beams a bit too tall (particularly at the top parapet), giving the overall building a “squatty” appearance. The proportions of these elements should be further refined.
  - o The applicant should consider opening the right-side balconies in the same manner the left-side are shown so that the open and closed spaces of the façade are more balanced.
  - o The applicant should consider installing simple metal screens at the sides of the left and right-side open balconies. These simple screens can mimic or relate to the proposed contemporary fencing at the front yard, so that this material and design element are more integrated with the overall building.
- An updated context drawing, and renderings should be provided for the next ARC review.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Daniel Zangara, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Jonathan Tate

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 613-615 Elmira Ave

Application: Massing review only for a 2,100 SF garage/residential building, 866 SF accessory building, and camelback addition at a Contributing-rated, two-story residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer this application for additional review. The ARC stated that the massing of the third-floor addition at the existing building is still problematic and acontextual. The ARC stated that the study room pop-up should be removed, and the vented attic space removed from the office, to lower the ceiling height. The ARC agreed that the elevator shaft should be incorporated into the massing of the new addition or the existing building, as it currently stands out too much as its own element. The hyphen piece between the new addition and existing building should be further simplified.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Daniel Zangara, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Jonathan Tate

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 137 Delaronde St

Application: New construction of a three-story, restaurant with rooftop bar on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer this application for additional review. The ARC stated that the overall height of the building was out of proportion with the context. The foundation should be lowered to the BFE requirement of 3' and the floor-to-ceiling heights of the first and second floors should be lowered. As proposed, the gallery posts are too thin and tall; the ARC recommended removing the posts and cantilevering the balcony. The ARC felt that the previous proposal was more successful in the contemporary nature of the building and stated that the openings, especially at the front façade, should be simplified and do not need to reference historic fenestrations. It was also suggested that you not try to so closely emulate traditional building typology as this is a commercial building and not a residence or fishing camp. This is a great opportunity to create something original.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Daniel Zangara, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Jonathan Tate

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 513 Opelousas Ave

Application: Renovation and new construction of 800 SF garage accessory building with exterior stair and 350 SF roof deck at main building at a Contributing rated, two-story, commercial building.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC agreed that the revised proposal was the most successful. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The carport should be more rectilinear to match the rest of the new addition, this can be achieved by adding a fascia or squaring off the roof slope.
- The garage door should have a more vertical emphasis, rather than horizontal.
- The banding at the top of the garage addition should be removed and replaced with a simple parapet capping.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Daniel Zangara, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Jonathan Tate

Opposed:

Comments:

F. 218 Pelican Ave

Application: Detail review of revisions at the front facade of a new construction of 3,000 SF two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC stated that the new office should be integrated into the rear of the second-floor massing where there is an opening or on the ground floor level. If the second-floor option is used, the roof can become a hipped roof with a flat top, to prevent the roof from changing in shape or massing.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Jonathan Tate

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Daniel Zangara, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Jonathan Tate

Opposed:

Comments:

G. 2366 Annunciation St

Application: Request to install highly decorative metal handrails at front porch of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building as part of a renovation of the front porch.

Motion: The ARC recommended that the new handrails be simplified, but can be moderately decorated, like the example at 819 Second St. The newel posts are not appropriate and should be removed from the proposal. As long as the buildings use is residential, the handrail height should be 36”.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Jonathan Tate

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Daniel Zangara, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Jonathan Tate

Opposed:

Comments:

H. 5012 Dauphine St

Application: Demolition of an existing rear lean-to for construction of a new 640 SF one-story rear addition and construction of new side covered porch at an existing Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the final details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- The proposed column at the new side entry porch should be simplified with standard flat trim.
- The proposed new porch access stair should be centered on the porch to align with the existing door opening. This may require modifying the previously installed permeable pavers at this area.

By: Jonathan Tate

Second: Daniel Zangara

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Daniel Zangara, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Jonathan Tate

Opposed:

Comments:

I. 3142-44 N Rampart St

Application: Renovation of an existing Contributing rated one-story, two-family residential building including demolition of an existing rear lean-to for replacement with a new 655 SF one-story rear addition.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the proposed rear addition is appropriate for the existing historic building. The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the final details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Daniel Zangara, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Jonathan Tate

Opposed:

Comments:

J. 1359 Magazine St

Application: Application to apply a smooth plaster wainscot to the front and left side of building only in an effort to preserve the existing brittle brick. The height of the wainscot shall be 54" tall.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Daniel Zangara, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Jonathan Tate

Opposed:

Comments:

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.