New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes

Date: Friday, October 17, 2025

Location: City Council Chamber

Called to order: 1:00PM

Commissioners present: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg

Hackenberg, Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Commissioners arriving after the beginning of the meeting:

Commissioners absent: Adero Lewis, Shawanda Poree, Jennifer Greene

I. Roll Call

II. Minutes of the Wednesday, September 3, 2025, meeting.

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Tim Lupin

Second: Ross Karsen

Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

III. CLG Review of 5 South Roadway Street

Motion: Defer to next meeting.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

IV. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the consent agenda.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Annie Clark

Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

V. Old Business Demolition Applications

A. 4717 Saint Charles:

Application: Application: Removed from agenda. Item was not heard.

VI. New Business Work Applications

A. 739 Elysian Fields:

Application: Renovation of a Contributing rated, two-story commercial building including demolition of a Non-Contributing rated, one-story, commercial building and Non-Contributing rated, two-story, rear accessory structure to grade for new construction of a 3,600 SF three-story addition.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade of the Non-Contributing rated one-story commercial building fronting Elysian Fields Avenue and the Non-Contributing rated two-story rear accessory structure visible from Dauphine Street, and ratify the ARC recommendations for conceptual approval of the proposed renovation and new addition, with the proviso that the Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition shall not be issued until the redevelopment CofA is ready to be issued simultaneously.

By: Ross Karsen Second: Jim Ashbee Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

B. 1410 Jackson Ave:

Application: Appeal the ARC recommendations for the new proposal for elevator enclosure at right side of Landmark, residential building.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting to provide the chance for the architect to submit more details drawings of the elevator and how it connects to the historic building.

By: Jim Ashbee Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

C. 1516 Erato St:

Application: Appeal of the ARC recommendations for the new construction of a 33,664 SF, five-

story, hotel on a vacant lot.

Motion: Deny the appeal of the ARC recommendations.

By: Jim Ashbee Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

D. 1622 Toledano St:

Application: Appeal of ARC recommendation for denial of installation of garage doors as part of a previously approved new construction of a 10,300 SF three-story, multi-family residential building. Motion: Approve the request for the installation of garage doors at the three (3) townhouse structures, with the provisos that the doors shall be simple, plain sectional types without windows, designed to complement the contemporary character of the new construction, and installed recessed from the plane of the exterior wall by at least the wall's thickness so they appear more visually subordinate at the front elevation.

By: Jason King Second: Jim Ashbee Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Annie Clark, Annie

Irvin

Opposed: Greg Hackenberg

Comments:

E. 821-823 Fourth St:

Application: Appeal the ARC recommendations for the renovation and construction of a second-story addition at a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the appeal of the ARC recommendations.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg, Annie Clark,

Annie Irvin

Opposed: Ross Karsen

Comments:

F. 911 Jackson Ave:

Application: Appeal the ARC recommendations for the new construction of a 2,200 SF two-story addition to a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residence.

Motion: Deny the appeal of the ARC recommendations.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

G. 1023 Bartholomew St:

Application: Removed from agenda. Item was not heard.

H. 2518 N Rampart St:

Application: Request to remove existing roof ridge tiles for installation of a continuous ridge vent as part of a Fortified Roof installation at a Contributing rated one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the request to remove the existing barrel-style roof ridge tiles due to the HDLC Design Guidelines, which state that roof ridge tiles are important decorative and functional elements that should be retained. Additionally, new or replacement English-V ridge tiles that meet Fortified Roof program requirements are available to substitute for the existing tiles, and any desired roof ventilation can be achieved through low-profile power or static roof vents rather than the proposed continuous ridge vents. Approval of this request could also set a negative precedent for future applications, given the increasing number of Fortified Roof replacement proposals.

By: Tim Lupin Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

I. 302 Delery St:

Application: Removed from agenda. Item was not heard.

VII. Old Business Demolition Applications

A. 203 Walnut St:

Application: Removed from agenda. Item was not heard.

VIII. New Business Demolition Applications

A. <u>1235 Piety St:</u>

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition to grade based on the condition of the structure today and because much of the original character-defining exterior architectural details remain and the building continues to contribute its type, style, massing and roof form to the surrounding local historic district.

By: Tim Lupin Second: Jason King Result: Denied

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

B. 1029 Hillary St:

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure at a Contributing rated, one-

story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Annie Irvin Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

C. 1531 Governor Nicholls St:

Application: Removed from agenda. Item was not heard.

D. 717-719 Louisiana Ave:

Application: Demolition of a Non-Contributing rated, 1-1/2 story, single-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition, with the caveat that the Certificate of

Appropriateness will not be issued until the new construction drawings have been approved.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Jim Ashbee Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

E. 2815 Conti St:

Application: Demolition of a 1,063 SF Non-Contributing rated, one-story accessory structure to

grade.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition.

By: Annie Clark Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

F. 2831 Livaudais St:

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, multi-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting to provide the chance for the applicant to conduct an interior demolition and reinspection by an HDLC Inspector.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Annie Irvin Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

G. 518 Spain St:

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building to grade with the retention of the front façade to be incorporated into new construction replicating the massing, type, and details of the existing building.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade with the proviso that the Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition shall not be issued until redevelopment plans have been submitted, recommended for approval by the ARC and Commission, and the CofA for redevelopment is ready to be issued simultaneously. Additionally, the front façade should be retained if the current building setbacks can be maintained; otherwise, the applicant shall make every feasible effort to salvage and incorporate as much of the original historic material as possible into the redevelopment, including doors, windows, brackets, and drop-lap siding.

By: Ross Karsen Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

H. <u>2830 Octavia St:</u>

Application: Removed from agenda. Item was not heard.

I. <u>5947 Annunciation St:</u>

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Tim Lupin

Second: Jim Ashbee Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

J. 4025 Baudin St:

Application: Demolition of Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition.

By: Annie Clark Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

IX. New Business Retention Applications

A. <u>4854 Camp St:</u>

Application: Retention of the demolition to grade of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness and in deviation of the Commission and City Council motions.

Motion: Deny the retention of the demolition to grade with the proviso that any new construction would have to replicate the building that was demolished, would be under full control and go through the Architectural Review and Commission process before any permit is issued by the Department of Safety and Permits. The Commission also voted to levy a fine of \$25,000.

By: Tim Lupin Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

B. <u>1115-1117 Independence St:</u>

Application: Retention of two flush mounted windows with half screens on both side elevations at a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approval with the proviso that the existing windows be recessed and fitted with full screens to reduce the visibility of the internal muntins.

By: Ross Karson Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

C. <u>2361-2363 Saint Thomas St:</u>

Application: Retention of several items at a Non-Contributing rated, two-story, two-family residential building in deviation of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Grant retention of the exterior egress stair.

Deny retention of the inappropriate windows at the façade, decorative handrails supports, and the excessive light fixtures.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Ross Karsen

Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

D. 428 Elmira Ave:

Application: Retention of inappropriate window replacement at a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of inappropriate windows with the proviso that either of the following alterations are made:

- 1. Replace the four (4) windows (two on each side elevations) of the original one-story, double shotgun structure with new wood or metal clad wood windows. Replacement windows to fit existing openings and match the original wood windows in size, shape, configuration, operation, dimension, and relief. Remove the half-screens on existing windows at the front and side elevations of camelback addition. The original wood windows at the front façade to remain as-is.
- 2. Remove the half-screens and install full screens at all windows, excluding the windows at the front façade.

By: Ross Karsen Second: Jim Ashbee Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Clark, Annie Irvin

Opposed: Comments:

E. <u>2277-2279 Saint Claude Ave:</u>

Application: Retention of installation of inappropriate flood lights and string lights installed on a Non-Contributing rated one-story commercial building without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Motion: The Commission made the following motions:

- Approve the request for retention of both signs fronting St. Claude Avenue and Mandeville Street, with the provisos that the corrections noted below must be implemented to bring both signs into compliance with the HDLC Design Guidelines, and that the Zoning Department of Safety and Permits confirms one or both signs meet the CZO requirements or that a BZA variance is obtained for any sign(s) that do not.
 - The "Smoke Supply" sign must have the inappropriate raceway removed, and the channel letters must be mounted directly to the building wall without visible conduit or junction boxes.
 - The "Phone Repair" sign must have the cell phone portion depowered so that it is no longer an inappropriate internally illuminated box sign, and all exposed conduit and junction boxes must be removed.
- 2. Deny the request for retention of the inappropriate LED strip lights installed on the building walls and windows without approval because they are not an appropriate decorative fixture type for the building or the surrounding historic district, and they are visually prominent along the heavily trafficked St. Claude Avenue corridor.
- 3. Deny the request for retention of the flood lights installed at the underside of the eave overhang fronting Mandeville Street due to poor installation quality, the fixtures and light intensity being inappropriate for a street-facing elevation, and the presence of visible conduit and junction boxes. However, the Commission included a proviso that the flood lights may be replaced with appropriate recessed eave can lights or simple, minimal downlight wall packs to provide the desired level of security lighting.

By: Ross Karsen Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Irvin Opposed: Comments:

F. 605-607 Bartholomew St:

Application: Retention of installation of inappropriate gable window as part of the new construction of a 340 SF one-story rear accessory garage structure in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny the request for retention of the inappropriate octagonal gable window at the rear accessory garage structure because its type and shape are not consistent with the age and style of the principal historic building, it is visually undersized relative to the surrounding gable wall area, the alteration was not submitted for review and approval in advance, and because it is prominently visible from Bartholomew and Chartres Streets.

By: Ross Karsen Second: Jim Ashbee Result: Passed In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Irvin Opposed: Comments:

G. 909 Atlantic Ave:

Application: Removed from agenda. Item was not heard.

H. 2738 Saint Charles Ave:

Application: Removed from agenda. Item was not heard.

I. 318 Oliver St:

Application: Removed from agenda. Item was not heard.

J. 4025 Saint Claude Ave:

Application: Removed from agenda. Item was not heard.

X. Ratification of Architectural Review Committee and Staff actions since the Wednesday, September 3, 2025, meeting.

Motion: Approve the ratification of ARC and Staff actions.

By: Tim Lupin Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In Favor: Ross Karsen, Jim Ashbee, Tim Lupin, Jason King, Jennie Cannon West, Greg Hackenberg,

Annie Irvin Opposed: Comments:

XI. HDLC Reports and Communications