

VIEUX CARRÉ COMMISSION ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE

Mitchell J. Landrieu
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Lary Hesdorffer
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

Architectural Committee meeting of **Tuesday, July 14, 2015**

Committee Members Present: Rick Fifield, Daniel Taylor, Nick Musso

Committee Members Absent: George Hero, Dennis Brady

Staff Present: Lary Hesdorffer, Director; Renee' Bourgogne, Architectural Historian; Nicholas G. Albrecht, Plans Examiner; Erin Vogt, Plans Examiner; Erika Gates, Building Inspector; Allison Church, Intern

Staff Absent:

Others Present: Elizabeth Magner, Roger Drake, Robert Cangelosi, Gunner Guidry, Richard Albert, Earl Weber, Hank Smith, John Williams, Katherine Harmon, Freddie Boothe, Rodney Ratliff, Joey Murray, Lacey Wotring, Jamie Saxon, R. Ramsey, James Farr, Randall Meyer, Richard Choate, Sidney Torres, Ralph Long, Ray Hostetter, Tommie Aysenne, Donald Maginnis, Don Schwander, Betty Norris

AGENDA

Old Business

215 N Peters St: Rodney Ratliff, applicant; Brooke Cameron LLC, 209 N Peters LLC, New Orleans Properties Group, LLC, Edward S Back, Richard P Kosow, Kristopher K Anderson, Gerald R Kirk, Stephen M And Carol A Cassiani, owners; Proposal to construct new rooftop platform, per application & revised materials received 08/28/14 & 07/06/15.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Ratliff representing the application. Mr. Musso inquired the reason the deck was moved forward. Mr. Ratliff stated the deck moved closer to the parapet would allow for better sight lines from the roof.

Mr. Taylor hesitant of allowing the use of the Trex decking material. Mr. Ratliff stated he would have no problem with changing the decking material.

Mr. Musso moved for **conceptual approval** if the previously approved setback is restored and with submission of the proposed decking material, with final details to be handled by staff. Mr. Musso continued the motion stating if the applicant wishes to move the deck location and use the Trex material the motion would be for **deferral**. Mr. Fifield seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

500 Burgundy St: Digna Aguilar, applicant; 937 St Louis LLC, owner; Proposal to apply stucco over exposed brick, per application & materials received 01/30/15 & 06/05/15, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Smith present to represent the application. Mr. Musso stated they generally do not approve the application of stucco over brick. Mr. Fifield stated he would have difficulty approving stucco over brick, especially when the brick is functional. Mr. Fifield stated that if stuccoed the detail of the brick material would be lost.

Mr. Smith stated that two of the sides are stuccoed and allowing stucco on the other two sides would unify the look of the building.

Betty Norris in the audience stated that previous similar proposals to stucco over brick have been denied.

Mr. Fifield stated that he was not enthusiastic about allowing for stucco over brick. Mr. Taylor stated he was in favor of stucco over brick in this instance.

Mr. Musso moved for **approval** of stucco application but **denial** of the proposed paint scheme. Mr. Taylor seconded and the motion passed with affirmative votes from Mr. Taylor and Mr. Musso. Mr. Fifield voted against.

910 Royal St: Lacey Wotring, applicant; Princess Of Monaco, LLC, Royal Alice Properties, LLC, Johnson N II Barrett, Princess Of Monaco LLC, Katherine K Fugate, Johnson N II Barrett, owner; Proposal to install new

elevator at rear service wing, per application & drawings received 02/03/15 & 06/29/15, respectively.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff report with Mr. Williams and Ms. Wotring representing the application. Mr. Fifield asked how this submittal was different from previously seen proposals. Ms. Wotring stated that they were not different but the full Commission sent the application back to the Architectural Committee to choose a design. Mr. Musso clarified that the Committee had already seen all of these design options. Mr. Williams was of the opinion that the chosen location of the proposed elevator would allow for the lift to be easily removed, and materials could be used to hide the elevator. Mr. Fifield moved for **denial** of the elevator installation. Mr. Musso seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

916 Governor Nicholls St: Robert Cangelosi, Jr., applicant; Michael W Wagner, owner; Proposal to renovate building, including removal of c. 1930s masonry, per application and drawings received 03/26/15, 04/08/15 & 07/05/15.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Mr. Cangelosi and Judge Wagner present as applicants. Mr. Cangelosi stated that he was working on finalizing design development details with the State Department Division of Historic Preservation. Mr. Musso moved to **approve** the staff recommendation, with the project to return to the Committee at the design development phase. Mr. Fifield seconded. Before the Committee members voted, Mr. Cangelosi explained that he expected to return within a matter of weeks, as the design development stage is being reviewed by the State Dept. Judge Wagner stated that the State was requesting that the transom above the carriageway be removed, and that the balcony be simple, unornamented iron. The motion was restated for the record, and passed unanimously.

210 Decatur St: Kay Champagne, applicant; Noah Grace LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate building in conjunction with **change of use** from *vacant* to *commercial/residential*, per application & materials received 04/14/15, 06/16/15 & 07/10/15, respectively.

Deferred at applicant's request.

417 Burgundy St: Albert Architecture, applicant; Thomas B Edwards, owner; Proposal to make various structural repairs including the installation of a total of four tie rods and various helical ties, per application & materials received 04/15/15.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Messrs. Albert and Saxon present to represent the application. Mr. Musso stated he would be comfortable with the proposal and moved for approval with the requirement of follow up inspections performed by staff. Mr. Fifield stated this should only be a single approval and not a blanket approval of this technique. Mr. Fifield continued that the results and long term effects of the work may not be known for years to come and this should be considered a test case.

Mr. Musso restated the motion for **approval** of the application with the requirement of follow up inspections. Mr. Fifield seconded with the condition that this was not a blanket approval. The motion passed unanimously.

730 Esplanade Ave: Carimi Construction & Development LLC, applicant; 730 Esplanade LLC, owner; Proposal to install in-ground swimming pool in front courtyard, per application & materials received 05/13/15 & 06/30/15, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Messrs. Choate and Torres present to represent the application. Mr. Musso stated he was comfortable with the proposal.

Mr. Fifield moved for **approval** of the pool installation with the fountain to be located in the front yard.

Betty Norris, speaking from the audience, noted that this was the last of only two front yard gardens, of which she was aware, and that they will both now have swimming pools.

Without further discussion, Mr. Musso seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

917 Conti St, 923 Conti: Harry Baker Smith Architects, applicant; Donna W Levin, owner; Proposal for renovation and partial demolition in conjunction with **change of use** from *commercial* to *residential*, per application & materials received 05/25/15, 06/16/15 & 07/08/15.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Mr. Smith representing the application. Mr. Smith state that they did change the proposed density from 18 to 16 units. Mr. Musso stated that he felt the property could support the 16 units, but that he had spoken with the city attorney and the proposed covenant lacked

protection against using the units as short term rentals. Mr. Fifield inquired about the pool sections. Mr. Smith clarified that the pools are to be no more than 30" dipping pools. Mr. Broussard, the lawyer representing the developer, discussed the prohibition of short term rentals, and the covenant that would be included in the condo association. Any owner would be obligated to enforce the covenant against other condo owners. Mr. Fifield wanted to more closely analysis the streetscape impact, while Mr. Taylor had height concerns, and Mr. Musso was concerned about the building's massing. Both Mr. Taylor and Mr. Fifield had no problem with the proposed density or demolition. Mr. Fifield requested streetscape renderings. Mr. Taylor commented on the lack of interaction on the proposed first floor with the public. Mr. Fifield stated his concerns over the contemporary design and size of the proposed building, and stated that the developing team had responsibilities to sell the idea and provide the committee with an overall visual impact from around the square. Mr. Fifield moved for **deferral**. Mr. Musso seconded with the caveat that density of 16 units was acceptable and the motion passed unanimously.

927 Orleans Ave: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Westbrook Orleans LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate building in conjunction with a **change of use** from *vacant* to *residential* (4 units), per application & revised materials received 05/25/15 & 06/19/15, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Ms. Harmon present to represent the application. Mr. Fifield asked about eliminating the dormers from the proposal. Ms. Harmon stated they would like to keep the dormers. Mr. Hesdorffer asked about consideration of skylights. Mr. Fifield stated that he would prefer to see skylights. Mr. Musso stated he would prefer dormers in this instance.

Mr. Fifield asked the applicant about the comments made about the proposed St. Ann elevation. Ms. Harmon stated they would have no problem widening the openings or adding shutters.

Mr. Fifield moved for **conceptual approval** in regards to the front building, with the proviso the openings are widened. Mr. Musso seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Musso then moved for **deferral** in regards to the rear building. Mr. Fifield seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

831 Decatur St: Tommie Aysenne, applicant; Ingram Family Trust, owner; Proposal to alter first floor fenestration, per application & materials received 06/05/15, 06/11/15 & 07/08/15, respectively.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff report with Mr. Aysenne representing the application. Mr. Aysenne presented two separate design options for the proposed millwork to be installed as the new first floor doors and windows. Mr. Fifield complimented Mr. Aysenne on his drawings. Mr. Aysenne stated that his clients preferred Option 2. Mr. Fifield questioned the appropriateness of Option 2, given the questionable original conditions at the building. However, he moved for **approval** with the proviso that the transom will be altered to have four lights rather than the two shown in the submitted drawings, and that revised drawings be submitted to staff for final review and permitting. Mr. Musso seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

New Business

715 Dauphine, 900 Orleans Ave: Ray Hostetter, applicant; 715 Dauphine St La, LLC, owner; Proposal to install new paneled garage door, per application and materials received 03/23/15 & 06/30/15, respectively.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff report with Mr. Hostetter representing the application. Mr. Musso expressed disdain for the existing garage door and stated a preference for taller, more vertically proportioned panels. Mr. Hesdorffer inquired about the depth of the garage and available space. Mr. Hostetter responded that it is an extremely tight space with only enough room for his truck due to a steel beam (header) and a low ceiling. Mr. Hostetter stated that he only wished to obtain a new door and decorative molding. Mr. Fifield moved for **deferral** to allow for a site visit from staff. Mr. Musso seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

922 St Louis St: Schwander Hutchinson Roofing, Inc., applicant; M J Falgoust Inc, owner; Proposal to install new slate roof, apply elastomeric paint to area of metal roof, and construct new rooftop mechanical platform, per application & materials received 06/29/15.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff report with Messrs. Meyer and Schwander present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated they would need more specific, detailed information in order to approve such a proposed platform and that he would like to see it designed to be sturdier than what is initially indicated by the sketch submitted.

Mr. Fifield asked if they had considered a metal platform. Mr. Musso added he would insist on the new

platform being metal.

Mr. Musso moved for **conceptual approval** with a drawing to be submitted to staff for final approval. Mr. Musso stated he has no problems with the application of elastomeric paint to the metal roof. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

726 -728 Barracks St, (Units 726A, 726B, 728A, & 728B): Dennis S Almeida, applicant; Legacy Realty Properties, LLC, owner; Proposal to install four (4) ductless mini split HVAC units on courtyard wall, per application & materials received 06/19/15 & 05/22/15, respectively.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Mr. Farr representing the application. Mr. Musso was apprehensive about the higher location of the four ductless mini-split HVAC units. Mr. Musso preferred a lower location. Mr. Fifield stated that the new units were very small and quiet so the noise to the neighbors would not be a problem. Mr. Musso and Mr. Fifield discussed the mounted steel bracket. Mr. Fifield moved for **approval** of the higher location of the mini-splits. Mr. Musso seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

1122 Royal St: Robert Cangelosi, Jr., applicant; 618-20 Gov. Nichols, LLC, owner; Proposal to install new pedestrian gate in parking lot wall, Royal side, per application & materials received 06/25/15.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Mr. Cangelosi representing the application. Mr. Musso moved for **approval** of the pedestrian gate. Mr. Fifield seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

823 Dauphine St: Donald Maginnis, applicant; Aaa Dauphine House LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate rear building including new stairs and shed, per application & materials received 06/23/15.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff report with Mr. Maginnis representing the application. Mr. Musso said that he does not see the need to remove the double hung windows from the St. Ann elevation. Mr. Maginnis stated that the windows are the cause of the bowing of the wall and not constructed in a historically accurate way.

Mr. Fifield moved for **conceptual approval**, including the three provisos noted in the staff report be included, that 1) accurate open space measurements and calculations are provided; 2) additional details for the new storage shed are submitted for staff review and approval prior to issuance of a permit; and 3) drawings should include revised French door details. Mr. Musso seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

546 St Peter St: Donald Zimmer, applicant; The City Of New Orleans, owner; Proposal to modify ground floor millwork, per application & materials received 06/25/15.

Deferred at applicant's request.

200 Decatur St: Ralph Long Architect (Agent), applicant; 200 Levee Street LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate building to include restored openings and roofed balcony on Decatur and Iberville elevations, per application & materials received 06/30/15.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff report with Mr. Long representing the application. In discussing the proposal, Mr. Long said that the work could include lowering the mechanical platform, depending on requirements in the mechanical code.

Mr. Fifield questioned the size of the structural members that would be needed to support a 6' cantilevered balcony. Mr. Long replied that further research would be done regarding the structural needs for the balcony. Without further comments, Mr. Fifield moved to grant **conceptual approval** for the balcony addition. Mr. Musso seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

730 Esplanade Ave: Richard Choate, applicant; 730 Esplanade LLC, owner; Proposal to stucco over existing brick walls of main building and perimeter fence, per application & materials received 07/07/15.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Messrs. Choate and Torres present to represent the application. Mr. Choate presented an old photo that had been included in the Friends of the Cabildo book entitled *New Orleans Architecture: The Esplanade Ridge* which seems to show the building's masonry covered in stucco cement plaster.

Mr. Musso stated he was comfortable with the application of stucco to the exterior wall and suggested analyzing the millwork for clues of the possibility the millwork was installed at a depth to allow for stucco and asked for photographs of any remaining stucco remnants.

Mr. Musso moved for **approval** of the stucco walls and **deferral** of application to the building pending submittal of millwork profiles and photographic evidence of remnants on the building. Mr. Fifield seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

336 Decatur St: Mark Thomas, applicant; Joseph C Paciera, owner; Proposal to demolish existing structure and construct new three-story building with rooftop terrace, per application & materials received 07/04/15.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff report with Mr. Guidry representing the application. Mr. Musso stated he has some concerns with the proposed density of the restaurant and that he is unsure about the use of the pointed arches.

Mr. Fifield expressed his desire to see more graphic representation of the proposed building.

Mr. Fifield moved for **deferral** to allow the applicants to respond to the comments of the staff and the Committee. Mr. Musso stated he finds the elevations a little monotonous and that he would like to see some differences between the different elevations. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

810 Conti St: H Freddie Boothe Jr Architect, applicant; Johnny Provenza, owner; Proposal to demolish existing building and construct new four-story building, per application & materials received 07/07/15 and 05/26/15, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Boothe present to represent the application. Mr. Boothe stated the new building would connect to the neighboring 327 Bourbon and that it is already considered a common path by the fire marshal.

Mr. Musso stated the configuration of massing appropriate. Mr. Musso moved for **conceptual approval**. Mr. Fifield seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

834 N Rampart St: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Kirk E Coco, Corey Driver, Rees LLC, Lgo Properties LLC, Condo Master Owner, Dexter T Fields, owner; Proposal to construct new service bar in courtyard, per application & materials received 06/30/15.

This application was withdrawn at the applicant's request prior to the meeting.

Appeals & Violations

305 Chartres St: Louis A Hernandez, Sr., applicant/owner; Proposal to retain unpermitted changes to cornice, per application received 12/6/14. [Notice of Violation received 11/14/14]

Complete Minutes Needed.

1017 Conti St: Diane Hickman, applicant; Charles F Griffin, Tst Rental Properties, LLC, Robert E Sanders, owner; Proposal to modify and retain skylights installed without benefit of VCC review or approval, per application & materials received 02/10/15 & 07/07/15, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Long representing the application. Mr. Musso stated he is not a fan of the skylights, but since they are already in place, his position is somewhat neutral. Mr. Taylor suggested moving one of the bathroom skylights.

After brief discussion, Mr. Fifield moved to **approve** the retention of skylights 2, 3, and 4 (as noted on the plans) and the removal of skylights 1 and 5. Mr. Musso seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

615 Ursulines Ave: Maurice L Robert, LLC, applicant/owner; Appeal of staff denial of proposal to install new canvas valence awning beneath Ursulines façade balcony, per application rec'd 06/05/15.

There was no applicant present to represent the application. Due to this fact, Mr. moved for **denial** of the new canvas valence awning. Mr. Fifield seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

511 Bourbon St: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Brevort Enterprises LLC, owner; Proposal to address outstanding violations with modifications to existing courtyard structures, per application & materials received 06/09/15.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Ms. Harmon present to represent the application. Mr. Musso stated he would still like to visit the site with members of the Architectural Committee. Mr. Musso stated

the VCC has worked with bars to meet their desires for courtyard features.

Mr. Musso moved for **deferral** pending a site visit. Mr. Fifield seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

819 Conti St: Shantel Wempren, applicant; 819 Conti LLC, owner; Appeal of staff denial of proposal to install 12'-0" x 3'-0" double-faced, aluminum and neon sign, per application & materials received 6/26/15.

Ms. Bourgogne gave the staff presentation with Mr. Young representing the application. The committee expressed a desire to work with the applicant in order to find a sign that is more appropriate for the building, that better fit its character, and that reflected the sophistication of the restaurant and the diner. The committee that the applicant could return at a later date with a revised proposal. Mr. Fifield moved for **denial** of the proposed sign. Mr. Musso seconded and the motion passed unanimously.
