

VIEUX CARRÉ COMMISSION ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE

Mitchell J. Landrieu
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Lary Hesdorffer
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR

Architectural Committee meeting of **Tuesday, January 12th, 2016**

Committee Members Present: Daniel Taylor, Nick Musso, Rick Fifield,

Committee Members Absent: Dennis Brady, George Hero,

Staff Present: Lary Hesdorffer, Director; Renee' Bourgogne, Architectural Historian; Nicholas G. Albrecht, Plans Examiner; Erin Vogt, Plans Examiner; Erika Gates, Building Inspector; Jennie Garcia, Intern; Erin Cook, Intern

Staff Absent:

Others Present: Charles Ransdell, L. Katherine Harmon, Hank Smith Robert Pell, Ryan Mayer, Greg App, Frances Swigart, Theodore Pierre, Larry Jaubert, Brian Rodrigue, Charles Berg, Toni Dimaggio, Clifton James, Eric Person

AGENDA

Old Business

937 Dauphine St: Charles Ransdell, applicant; Gregory P Jones, owner; Proposal to renovate building with changes to exterior openings per application & revised drawings received 02/27/15 & 01/08/16, respectively.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff report with Mr. Ransdell present on behalf of the application.

Mr. Musso stated that the drawings were satisfactory for the proposed structural work, but that the elevation notes should be refined before permitting. Mr. Fifield pointed out that some of the proportions were inconsistent in elevation drawings, and that dimensions should be provided on millwork details. Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the application. Mr. Fifield seconded and the motion passed unanimously.

508 Bourbon St: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Anglade 500 Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to revise previously approved treatment of courtyard landings, to remove/replace courtyard doors, per application & materials received 06/15/15 & 12/29/15, respectively.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff report with Ms. Harmon representing the application.

Ms. Harmon stated that she submitted an application to address the ongoing violations. Mr. Musso moved to **defer** action until corrections could be made per the staff recommendations. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

618 N Rampart St: Harry Baker Smith Architects, applicant; 616 N Rampart LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate building in conjunction with a **change of use** from *vacant* to *residential*, per application & materials received 12/08/15 & 12/29/15.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff report with Mr. Smith representing the application.

Mr. Fifield commented that he liked the façade being split with two different visual characters to the elevation, and asked if the existing building would be demolished. Mr. Smith said that the structure would be retained except that portions would be demolished to create the new courtyard spaces on the site and that the existing façade would be completely removed to install new elevation design. Mr. Musso also felt that creating visual separation between the units was an improvement, but that the third unit needed a balcony at the second floor. There were also concerns over the size and design of the garage door, and further development was recommended in order to deemphasize the door. Mr. Musso suggested further development of the scheme, as well as development of a secondary scheme that is more contemporary.

Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the application. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

816 St Philip St: Charles Berg, applicant; Harold R Jr Neitzschman, owner; Proposal to remove existing HVAC rack and install new blinds in the recess, per application & materials received 12/14/15 & 12/21/15, respectively.

Ms. Bourgogne gave the staff presentation with Mr. Berg present on behalf of the application.

Mr. Hesdorffer asked the applicant the origin of the recess. Mr. Berg stated that the room behind is used to be a bathroom with stained glass in the current window opening. Mr. Berg stated that it dated back to the 1970s when this building housed seven apartments. Mr. Berg then stated that originally this was a door. Mr. Hesdorffer addressed the committee and explained that this was why staff wanted it to look like the other openings.

Mr. Fifield made a motion to adopt the staff's recommendation for **approval**. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

New Business

620 Decatur St: Clifton James, applicant; The Iff LLC, Condo Master Owner, Raymond R Morris, Charles F Post, Stephen J Schmidt, DMK Group Three LLC, 820 Decatur LLC, Ms Jane Ann's Quarter Quarters, LLC, The Spruce Pine Trust, The Penthouse At Jax LLC, William S Everitt, Iberia Tigers, LLC, 416 Bourbon St LLC, Bosco Enterprises LLC, Jeanette B Ogden, Rachael C Kinberger, Micheal D Krochak, L & L Investment Group LLC, New Jax Commercial LLC, Roy Investments Properties LLC, Friday Properties New Orleans LLC, owner; Proposal to remove existing awning and construct one story addition, per application & materials received 05/27/14 & 07/09/15, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Messrs. James and Person present on behalf of the application. Mr. Hesdorffer noted that any addition would require BZA approval due to the insufficient amount of open space.

Mr. Person stated that the Commission has previously granted conceptual approval. Responding to the staff report, Mr. James noted that the mechanical equipment would be located in the roof and that they would be willing to utilize an alternative door style.

Mr. Person noted that the proposed construction would remove a violation. Mr. James noted that having the space finished would prevent unauthorized after hours uses.

Mr. Fifield enquired about the mechanical equipment. Mr. James responded that his was all contained in one unit located within the roof. Mr. Musso stated that more specifics on the units would be needed. Mr. James stated that they had engineer's drawings available.

Mr. Musso stated that he has some concerns about the open space and also the fact that this is one of the more dense developments of the area. Mr. Musso continued, commenting on the choice and operation of the doors as overhead or folding.

Mr. James responded that the space would be more open when the doors disappear. Mr. Musso stated that overhead doors are either open or closed but other door options present varying degrees of openness.

Mr. James stated that the design of the addition was to create an open, canopy feel. Mr. Fifield commented that it seems like unfinished construction. Mr. Hesdorffer commented that the rest of the building is very castle-like and a formidable building.

Mr. Person commented that the coffee shop currently operating in the space does quite well and that the use of the space would remain the same.

Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application. Mr. James requested specifics on the things that should be addressed. Mr. Fifield stated that the deferral was consistent with the staff recommendation and the comments made during the review. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1117 Decatur St: William Sonner, applicant; 1117 Decatur LLC, owner; Proposal to raise existing gallery railing, per application & materials received 12/17/15.

Ms. Bourgogne read the staff report with Mr. Sonner present on behalf of the application.

Mr. Fifield questioned the need for the two new gallery brackets proposed as well as the manner in which the gallery railing would be raised. Mr. Sonner explained they would cut a horizontal bar and add a new piece. Mr. Fifield asked if the material would be solid steel. Mr. Sonner stated that the bar would be made of solid steel and that the idea was to take the whole railing up and add a solid steel bar to the bottom. Mr. Fifield motioned for **approval** of the proposal as shown with the elimination of the two new brackets. Mr. Musso concurred and the motion passed unanimously.

Following the vote Mr. Fifield asked Mr. Sonner if he was prepared to talk about the illegal walk-in cooler still present in the courtyard. Mr. Sonner stated that they had started the BZA application, but were stalled. He stated that he would talk it over with the owner.

1128 Decatur St: Toni DiMaggio, applicant; Capricorn Ventures LLC, owner; Proposal to remove balcony and construct gallery on Decatur elevation and to remove canopy and construct balcony on French Market Place elevation, per application & materials received 12/23/15.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Ms. DiMaggio present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that at least two members of the Architectural Committee had seen a proposal similar to this one before and that he finds the fixed canopy acceptable but would entertain a balcony because of the changing nature of French Market Place.

Ms. DiMaggio stated that she included the Sanborn maps that indicate some kind of overhang on the French Market Place elevation. Mr. Musso suggested looking for additional documentation of what may have previously existing in this location.

Mr. Fifield noted that the building has evolved but the application is not really dealing with the historic condition. Mr. Hesdorffer noted that this application falls into a grey area because the building has been so altered. Mr. Fifield stated that an awning was the most historically appropriate condition.

Mr. Taylor stated he could not envision the balcony on the French Market Place elevation. Ms. DiMaggio stated that the French Market Place balcony was included on the application for discussion. Mr. Musso stated that he would like to see the existing canopy renewed on the French market Place elevation. Ms. DiMaggio stated that the priority was the restoration of the gallery.

Mr. Fifield moved to adopt the staff recommendation of **conceptual approval** for the gallery on the Decatur elevation and **deferral** of the proposed balcony on the French Market Place elevation. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1029 Bourbon St: Farr + Huson, applicant; Gurry Bros Supply Corp, owner; Proposal to replace deteriorated window headers as needed, install new trim, and repair brick and plaster on front façade, per application & materials received 12/29/15.

The application was deferred at the request of the applicant.

306 Chartres St: Ryan Mayer, applicant; Kerry H Vix, owner; Proposal to replace wood balcony decking with "Aeratis Heritage" composite decking, per application & materials received 12/29/15.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Mr. Mayer present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that the material could be approvable with the caveat that the success or failure of the material would be evaluated at the end of a fixed period, and that permanent retention would not be guaranteed by the Committee or Commission.

Mr. Fifield moved to **approve** a test period of sixty (60) months, at which time the material will be reevaluated for appropriateness. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

210 Chartres St: Duff Waterproofing Co Inc, applicant; 212 Chartres Street LLC, owner; Proposal to add six (6) structural wall ties to the main building, Decatur elevation, per application & materials received 12/30/15.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Rodrigue present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that he concurred with the staff and moved for **approval** of the plates as per the drawing provided an engineer's report is submitted to staff and with cutting the extraneous portions of the existing rods that project from the building. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion with the amendment that the plates and exterior portions of the rods to be painted to match the

adjacent surface. The motion passed unanimously.

Appeals & Violations

723 Ursulines Ave: 723 Ursulines LLC, applicant; Maison D'hoover LLC, owner; Proposal to remove unpermitted HVAC condenser & platform from front roof slope & relocate to rear roof slope, per application & materials received 04/20/15 & 12/21/15, respectively. [**Notice of Violation sent 6/04/14**]

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Mr. App present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that he agreed with staff provisos, and recommended deferral for resubmittal of materials. Mr. App objected, concerned that removing the cap flashing would require walking on slate.

Mr. Fifield voiced concern over the location of the HVAC platform, noting both the projection extending past the rear dormer, as well as the additional load placed on the dormer by the platform. Mr. Musso also noted that the platform should attach to the side of the party wall, not the center line.

Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the application, including the staff provisos, and requiring submittal addressing additional violations. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1113 Decatur St: Neal Bodenheimer, applicant; 1113 Decatur LLC, owner; Proposal to retain unpermitted walk-in cooler in rear courtyard, per application & materials received 12/09/15. [**Notice of Violation sent 11/16/15**]

At the request of the Committee, Ms. Bourgogne gave the staff report despite the absence of a representative for the application.

Mr. Musso questioned the applicant's need for more cooling capacity and expressed his desire that the applicant find another location in the building. Mr. Musso then moved for **deferral** in order for the applicant to return with an explanation for the new cooler and its current location. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

1014 Royal St: Donna F Steg, applicant/owner; Proposal to correct/repair structural fault in façade wall, installing new tie-backs, per application & materials submitted 12/22/15. [**Notice of Violation sent 06/26/15**]

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Ms. Swigart, Mr. Pierre, and Mr. Jaubert present on behalf of the application. Mr. Taylor asked the applicant to submit current structural engineering reports of the entire building.

Mr. Musso moved for **conceptual approval**, pending the report submittal. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

1100-06 N Rampart St, 1041-43 Ursulines St: Russ Walker, applicant; 1100 N Rampart, LLC, owner; Proposal to retain unpermitted asphalt roof, per application & materials received 12/29/15.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Mr. Walker present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that the Committee may find TPO or another type of roofing material approvable, but that the asphalt shingles could not be retained. Mr. Musso also felt that slate would not be best for the installation, due to the low roof slope.

Mr. Musso moved to **deny** the application to retain, and to **defer** the roof replacement for the applicant to consider other materials. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

941 Bourbon St: Charles Berg, applicant; Lafitte Blacksmith Shop Inc, owner; Proposal to retain mechanical equipment installed without benefit of VCC review or approval and to add louvered screening, per application & materials received 12/29/15. [**Notice of Violation sent 10/09/15**]

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff report with Mr. Berg present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that he did not see the need for the amount of equipment present on the flat roof and that he believes better systems are available that would require fewer pieces of equipment and be more efficient.

Mr. Berg noted several other aspects of the application and asked if those items could be permitted separately. Mr. Musso stated he would be comfortable with separating the items if the applicant

returned with separate applications at the next meeting.

Mr. Musso moved to **deny** the use of any screening device, that the applicant revisiting the existing equipment and see if there is alternate equipment or solution and to **defer** on the other proposed work. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

918 Dauphine St: Robert Pell, applicant; Mark W Seale, owner; Proposal to retain HVAC unit and tankless water heater installed without benefit of VCC review or approval, per application & materials received 12/30/15. **[Notice of Violation sent 04/03/14]**

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff report with Mr. Pell present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso inquired about the many window units installed around the building. Mr. Musso also asked if the existing tankless water heater was gas or electric. Mr. Pell replied that the unit was gas.

Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the application to allow the applicant to explore alternatives. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

Other Business

With no other business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at approximately 3:24 PM.

Next AC Date: Tuesday, January 26, 2016

Upon request, a sign language interpreter for the hearing impaired will be available at the meeting. To place a request for sign language interpreter services, please call TDDY at (504) 658-2059 or 1-800-981-6652.