

VIEUX CARRÉ COMMISSION ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE

Mitchell J. Landrieu  
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Bryan Block  
DIRECTOR

Architectural Committee meeting of **Tuesday, September 13th, 2016**

**Committee Members Present:** Daniel Taylor, Nick Musso, Rick Fifield,

**Committee Members Absent:** Dennis Brady, George Hero,

**Staff Present:** Bryan Block, Interim Director; Nicholas G. Albrecht, Plans Examiner; Erin Vogt, Plans Examiner; Erika Gates, Building Inspector; Reneé Bourgogne, Architectural Historian

**Staff Absent:**

**Others Present:** John Williams, Danny Taylor, David McMurphy, Awadalla, Corbett Scott, Loretta Harmon, L. Dow Oliver

## AGENDA

### Old Business

336 Decatur St: Mark Thomas, applicant; Joseph C Paciera, owner; Review of conceptually approved application to construct new four story building, per application and materials received 07/04/15 & 09/06/16.

The application was **deferred** with no one present to represent the application.

---

810 Esplanade Ave: Daniel Zangara, applicant; Ibu And Bapak LLC, owner; Proposal to install new service wing window as part of a previously approved renovation, per drawings & materials received 03/28/16 & 08/29/16, respectively.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff report with Mr. Zangara present on behalf of the application. With no discussion necessary, Mr. Fifield moved to **approve** the proposal. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

---

916 Governor Nicholls St: Robert Cangelosi, Jr., applicant; Michael W Magner, owner; Proposal to revise previously approved courtyard renovations and new pool installation, per application & materials submitted 05/16/16 & 09/06/16, respectively.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff report with Mr. Cangelosi present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that the shape of the pool as proposed could be approvable. Mr. Cangelosi noted the alterations to the alley elevations and additional electrical requirements. Mr. Musso moved to **approve** the alterations as submitted by the applicant, per staff recommendations. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

---

1220 Dauphine St: Sarah Busch, applicant; Barda Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to modify previously approved plans with the installation of a raised mechanical rack, per application & materials received 06/21/16 & 08/16/16, respectively.

The application was **deferred** due to insufficient submitted material.

---

1036 N Rampart St: Corbett Scott, applicant, Itamar Levy, owner; Proposal to renovate building, including providing new accessibility and installing rooftop mechanical equipment, in conjunction with a **change of use** from *vacant* to *restaurant*, per application & materials received 07/06/16 & 08/18/16, respectively.

---

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Scott present on behalf of the application. Mr.

Musso noted that he would add one additional caveat to those listed by staff, requesting that the applicant submit the specs for the sound levels of the proposed equipment. Mr. Musso continued that regarding the synthetic decking for the ramp, the VCC was evaluating different decking types and recommended that the applicant submit a sample of the proposed material.

Mr. Fifield noted that he would be more inclined to review a synthetic material in this instance due to the non-historic location. Mr. Fifield inquired if the applicant had tried to minimize the equipment. Mr. Scott responded that he was told that screening was generally discouraged and noted that the equipment would be surrounded on three sides by a commercial building. Mr. Taylor inquired about the size and tonnage of the units. Mr. Scott provided approximate dimensions and noted that the units were 5, 4, and 4 tons.

Mr. Fifield noted that when buildings go to more intense use the VCC and applicants need to look at the effect on roofscapes. Mr. Fifield noted that screening may be something to consider in this instance. Mr. Musso noted that screening could be effective but noted that it should be designed, not simple lattice off the shelf.

Mr. Fifield inquired about the location of the exhaust. Mr. Scott noted that the exhaust needs to be 10' from the property line. Mr. Fifield noted that the applicant could consider the courtyard side of the roof.

Regarding the ramp material, Mr. Taylor encouraged the applicant to explore the synthetic material that has been approved by the National Park Surface.

Mr. Musso moved to **approve** all aspects of the application except for the mechanical and screening which would be **deferred**. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

---

717 Ursulines Ave: Steve Finegan, applicant; Louisiana Historic Holdings, LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate main building and dependency, and to construct a new pool house in rear courtyard, in conjunction with a **change of** use from *vacant* to *residential*, per application & materials received 07/18/16 & 08/29/16, respectively.

*The item was **deferred** due to a lack of representation on behalf of the application.*

---

620 Decatur St: Robert Cangelosi, Jr., applicant; Josephine Paciera Prop Inc, owner; Proposal to demolish clock/sign pylon and construct new ticket kiosk, per application & materials received 07/22/16 & 09/06/16, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Taylor present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso noted that the other violations may not be the applicant's to control. Mr. Taylor, the applicant, stated that the Jax Brewery has an agreement in place for the kiosk. Mr. Fifield noted that it is an obligation of the condo association to reach an agreement for the entire building. The business owner, Stevie Garcia, in the audience, stated that they have a ten year lease with the building.

Mr. Fifield stated that it was the responsibility of the applicants to address the violations and moved to **defer** the application. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

---

504 Bourbon St: Awadalla Awadalla, applicant; Sol Owens, Chris S Owens, owner; Proposal to convert existing folding door system to new storefront system, per application & materials received 08/11/16 & 09/06/16, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Awadalla present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that he agreed with the staff regarding taking inspiration from the windows above. Mr. Musso noted that the current proposal is not a throwback to the time of the original

---

construction of the building.

Mr. Fifield noted that the submitted materials offer a very narrow view of the building. Mr. Fifield noted that it was the responsibility of the applicant to sell the proposal. Mr. Fifield stated that they are not seeing the existing conditions or the rest of the building. Mr. Fifield also suggested that the door lock rail be aligned with the stucco band.

Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application to allow for the applicant to submit more information. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

---

## **New Business**

1136-1138 Decatur, 43-45 French Market Pl: Ray Palazzolo, applicant; Gold Leaf Investments LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate building and repair fire damage, including the removal of an existing cupola and installation of new rooftop mechanical equipment, per application & materials received 08/04/16 & 08/17/16, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Messrs. Oliver and Palazzolo present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso noted that the mechanical equipment was so encapsulated that they do not need acoustic information in this instance. Mr. Fifield inquired about the height of the exhaust. Mr. Oliver stated that it would terminate about 4' above the party wall.

Mr. Musso moved to accept the staff's presentation for **approval** of all elements except the mechanical equipment. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

Mr. Musso moved to add to the motion that the revised exhaust fan could be approved at the staff level. Mr. Fifield seconded that motion which passed unanimously.

---

935 Dumaine St: John C. Williams, applicant; Miller Family Trust The, 935 Dumaine, LLC, owner; Proposal to repair door and window openings, install HVAC condensers and screening on dependency roof in conjunction with exterior maintenance, per application & materials received 08/10/16 & 08/31/16.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Messrs. Williams and Stephens present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield asked how the applicant proposed to meet mechanical codes for the rooftop installation. Mr. Williams stated that he would meet with the Board of Building Standards & Appeals and request a roof hatch, as the available courtyard space is limited.

Mr. Fifield noted that the proportions of the laundry room doors were unusual and would need to be revised. Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

---

811 St Peter St: John C. Williams, applicant; Evelyn R Sahuque, 811-13 St. Peter, LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate building including the installation of new rooftop mechanical equipment and the installation of decorative light fixtures, per application & materials received 08/23/16 & 08/30/16, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Messrs. Williams and Stephens present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that lighting the front façade from above would be far superior, especially if the shutters are opened. Mr. Musso noted that the proposed fixture was inappropriate.

Mr. Fifield moved for **approval** of the mechanical equipment as submitted and for the lighting to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Musso added the caveat that the proposed screening would be eliminated from the proposal and seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

---

1103 Royal St: Robertson Roofing and Siding, Inc., applicant; Rita G Zerr, owner; Proposal to repair roof of main building and service building including covering the existing roofing material in a silicone coating, per application & materials submitted 08/11/16.

Ms. Bourgogne gave the staff report with Mr. Robertson present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that while the applicant's request to use a silicone coating was not unprecedented, he would prefer to see the roof patched in phases if that was more economically feasible. Mr. Fifield stated that there was definitely a solution to the problem and that perhaps the Commission needed to be advised of the owner's hardship. Mr. Block concurred that there was in fact a financial hardship on the owner of the property.

Mr. Musso again stated that in the past in situations such as this, the Committee has allowed a job such as this to be completed in phases with a time limit placed on total completion. Mr. Taylor stated that the current proposal was simply a "band-aid," and not likely to last long into the future. Mr. Robertson explained to the Committee that a whole new roof would cost \$160,000, while the current proposal would only cost \$32,000.

Mr. Musso stated again that he would like to see the work completed in phases within a reasonable time frame. He went on to say that he wanted staff to make an inspection prior to making a final decision.

Mr. Musso made a motion to **defer** based on additional information and a strategic plan. Mr. Fifield amended the motion to include evidence of financial hardship on the part of the owner. The amended motion passed unanimously.

---

1201-23 Chartres St, 609 Gov. Nicholls St: Robert Bodet, applicant; James Scott, Christopher M White, Maris L P Stella, James C Bellina, John C III Moris, James D Conway, Harry J Shearer, The Millennium Group I LLC, Christine L Cowen, Bruce V Schewe, George W Stendell, Southern Veranda LLC, Vernan J Carriere, Lori S Mitchell, Albert M Gutierrez, Charles H Wilson, Evelyn R Wilson, Christine L Cowan, Thomas C Cooper, The Millennium Group II LLC, Lori S Mitchell, Gerda M Stendell, owner; Proposal to remove and replace deteriorated dormer windows, per application & materials received 08/30/16.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Mr. Bodet present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved for **approval**, consistent with staff recommendations with final review and approval to be completed by staff. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

---

600 Decatur St: Steve Olson, applicant; Jackson Brewery Millhouse LLC, Jackson Brewery Millhouse LLC, owner; Proposal to modify four existing openings on the ground floor of the Decatur elevation, per application & materials received 08/30/16.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Messrs. ?? and ?? present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso noted that the building has minimal references to the historic conditions.

Mr. Fifield moved to **approve** the proposal in concept as submitted with final review to be completed by staff. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

---

222-224 Decatur St, 231 Clinton: Kirk Fabacher, applicant; 214 Decatur Street Development, LLC, 214 Decatur Street Development, LLC, owner; Proposal to add tie rods to the Decatur and Clinton elevations, per application & materials received 08/31/16.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Fabacher present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield inquired if the plate material would be galvanized. Mr. Fabacher responded that a material choice has not been made yet. Mr. Taylor noted that the plates should be galvanized and painted an appropriate color.

---

Mr. Fifield moved for **approval** of the application provided the plates are galvanized and painted. Mr. Musso seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

---

### **Appeals & Violations**

1212 Bourbon St: Merry J Mcswain, applicant; Swain Norman E Jr Mc, owner; Proposal to retain existing unpermitted paint colors, per application & materials received 07/20/16.

#### ***Complete Minutes Needed.***

---

435 Bourbon St: Ed Kimball/ Work Construction Company, Inc, applicant; Copping Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to address outstanding violations by installing new eyebrow windows on front elevation and replacing unpermitted balcony railing extension with VCC approved railing extension, per application & materials received 08/02/16. **[Notice of Violation sent 05/06/16]**

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation despite a lack of representation on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved to **conceptually approve** the proposal, consistent with staff recommendations, with final review and approval to be completed by staff. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

---

435 Bourbon St: Richard Sahuc, applicant; Copping Properties LLC, owner; Appeal to retain the installation of fans, exterior ice machine and courtyard awning installed without benefit of VCC review or approval, and to address outstanding violations, per application & materials received 08/03/16. **[Notice of Violation sent 05/06/16]**

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Mr. Sahuc present on behalf of the application.

#### ***Complete Minutes Needed.***

---

922 St Philip: Donald Maginnis, applicant; Koi Pond, LLC, owner; Appeal to retain storage shed installed without benefit of VCC review or approval, and to install new windows in conjunction with the renovation of "Building D," per application & materials received 08/12/16. **[Stop Work Orders posted 03/11/16, 03/14/16 & 03/23/16]**

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Mr. Maginnis present on behalf of the application. Mr. Maginnis stated that the windows would be installed solely to provide additional light in the bedroom and bathroom, and that he would be willing to alter the size or type. Mr. Fifield moved to **approve** the appeal to retain the shed, and to install an HVAC condenser and new windows. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed.

---

826 St Louis St: Bobby Delaughter, applicant; Darleen J Levy, owner; Appeal to retain new 42' x 10' brick courtyard wall, installed without benefit of VCC review or approval after collapse of previously existing wall, per application & materials received 08/15/16.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Messrs. Delaughter and Barry present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso noted that the brick used for the wall was inappropriate for the Vieux Carré. Mr. Barry stated that the bricks were hand-matched to an adjacent building on the site. Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the application for the applicant to work with staff towards a resolution. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

---

730 Esplanade: Loretta Harmon, applicant; 730 Esplanade LLC, owner; Proposal to correct or retain numerous violations of work without permits including rooftop mechanical equipment and skylights, modification of window and door openings, and constructing a new courtyard enclosure wall, per application & materials received 08/16/16 & 09/09/16, respectively. **[STOP WORK ORDER posted 07/27/16]**

---

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Ms. Harmon and Mr. Carimi present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso began his comments with the stable building, noting that he could not view the mechanical equipment from the ground and therefore he did not have a problem with the mechanical equipment in this instance. Mr. Musso continued that he proposed removal of two of the skylights was appropriate and that the modification to the window was acceptable.

Mr. Musso continued with comments regarding the roof of the main building, suggesting that seven of the skylights should be removed. He continued that he was concerned about the routing of air conditioning ducts above the roof and stated that the proposal needs to be truncated and cleaned up. Mr. Musso continued that the lower hatch on the balcony should be removed.

Regarding the courtyard dividing wall, Mr. Musso stated that he did not think it needed to be completely removed but that it should be cut back to around 16' and that he did not like the idea of having inserts in the wall. Mr. Musso stated that he agreed with the staff that the modified French doors need to return to three lights over a single panel. Regarding the change to the paving pattern, Mr. Musso stated that he was ok with the proposed pattern change.

Mr. Musso stated that he did agree that a deferral was warranted at this time. Mr. Fifield moved for **deferral** of the application. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

Following the vote Mr. Fifield stated that the applicants need to demonstrate a hardship as to what makes the waving of the guidelines necessary. Ms. Harmon stated that there was nowhere else to put the ductwork [which was installed on the roof]. Mr. Fifield noted that much of the work was done in a way that would have the lowest impact on the owner and the most impact on the exterior of the building. Mr. Fifield noted that the interior of the building was no longer historic due to the amount of work that had been done. Mr. Fifield continued that the guidelines state that mechanical equipment should be at grade. Mr. Fifield noted that the applicant has addressed the concerns of the staff but that there was no rationale for the initial work.

Mr. Fifield stated that he wanted to know how and why this all happened. Mr. Fifield requested that the staff provide a hierarchy of concerns and consideration of what's going on with the building in a global fashion.

Mr. Fifield stated he was ok with allowing the modification of the paving.

Due to the loss of a quorum Mr. Fifield moved to **adjourn** the meeting. The motion, seconded by Mr. Taylor passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at approximately 3:24 PM. The remaining items on the agenda were automatically deferred to the next meeting and Mr. Block noted those items would be placed at the beginning of the agenda for that meeting.

---

711 Bourbon St: Loretta Harmon, applicant; Seven-Eleven Bourbon, LLC, owner; Proposal to correct various violations and install new rooftop mechanical exhaust and additional plumbing in rear loggia, per application & materials received 08/23/16. **[Notice of Violation sent 03/30/16]**

The application was **deferred** due to the loss of a quorum.

---

537 Toulouse St: Mike T Kenney, applicant; Shane Hannabury, Michael L Dawson, James A Murphy, Irina Stoilova, James G Washburn, Mark D Parsons, 537 Toulouse Street LLC, owner; Proposal to retain two exterior mechanical vents installed in transom windows without benefit of VCC review or approval, per application & materials submitted 08/17/16 & 08/24/16, respectively.

The application was **deferred** due to the loss of a quorum.

---

600 Ursulines Ave: Robert Bodet, applicant; Robert J Tusa, owner; Appeal to retain metal bars and shutters installed in Ursulines side driveway gate without benefit of VCC review or approval, per

---

application & materials received 09/01/16. **[Notice of Violation sent 08/16/16]**

The application was **deferred** due to the loss of a quorum.

---

431-39 Dauphine St: Jo Anne Ferrara-Mo, applicant; Jo-Jo Holdings LLC, owner; Appeal to retain plywood installed in transoms and plexiglass installed on French doors, per application & materials received 09/06/16. **[Notice of Violation sent 08/01/16]**

The application was **deferred** due to the loss of a quorum.

---