VIEUX CARRÉ COMMISSION ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE

Mitchell J. Landrieu MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Architectural Committee meeting of Tuesday, January 30th, 2018

Committee Members Present:	Daniel Taylor, Rick Fifield,
Committee Members Absent:	Nick Musso, Dennis Brady,
Staff Present:	Bryan Block, Director; Nicholas G. Albrecht, Plans Examiner; Erin Vogt,
	Plans Examiner; Reneé Bourgogne, Architectural Historian;
Staff Absent:	Erika Gates, Building Inspector; Anthony Whitfield, Building Inspector
Others Present:	John Williams, Richard Choate, Lacey Wotring, Meg Lousteau, Bev Falk,
	Jenna Burke, Mark Heck, Mary Hewes, Charles Berg, Ryan Moran, Eric
	Torres, Henry Moore,

AGENDA

Old Business

533-35 Iberville St, 537 Iberville: 17-34312-VCGEN; Joseph Lantz, applicant; 817 Hickory Avenue LLC, owner; Proposal to construct rooftop addition and modify existing elevations in conjunction with a resubdivision and change of use from *vacant* to *residential (multi-family)*, per application & materials received 10/10/17 & 01/17/18, respectively. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=734071

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Mr. Choate present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield stated that the drawings had responded to previous concerns and moved for **conceptual approval** consistent with staff recommendations, with the application to return to Committee if any issues aris during permitting. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<u>907-17 Governor Nicholls St & 1211-15 Dauphine St</u>: 16-12007-VCGEN & 16-16729-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; 913 Governor Nicholls LLC, owner; Review of gallery panels at 1211-15 Dauphine, per application & materials received 04/13/16 & 01/24/18, respectively. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=587219

Mr. Block presented the staff report with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. Mr. Block stated that the staff wished for the Committee's feedback on using simple cast iron panels for the gallery overhang instead of pipe columns. Mr. Fifield moved for conceptual approval of the panels, stating that he was comfortable with staff level review and approval, with the design to return to the Committee if staff found it necessary. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<u>626 Bourbon St:</u> 17-06727-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; Grace T Granger LLC, owner; Proposal to modify door and window openings, lower the floor level to grade, infill arched openings with masonry, and add roof deck, per application & materials received 02/24/17 & 01/16/18. [STOP WORK ORDER posted 09/27/17]

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=706178

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Ms. Wotring and Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. Ms. Wotring stated that they would revise the rear door to be a true set of French doors. Mr. Fifield moved for **conceptual approval** with final review and approval to be completed by staff, with the application to return to the Committee only if necessary. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<u>515 Barracks St</u>: 17-12587-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; Jules L Cahn, owner; Proposal to construct new iron fence with vehicular and pedestrian gates at Barracks St. property line, per application & materials received 04/11/17 & 11/07/17, respectively. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=712237 Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved to adopt the staff recommendation for conceptual approval of the application. The motion, seconded by Mr. Taylor, seconded unanimously.

229 Royal St: 17-27261-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; 229 Royal Street LLC, owner; Proposal to restore façade elements & to construct new rooftop pool and deck, per application & materials received 08/08/17 & 01/16/18, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=726961

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. Mr. Williams noted that they have received permission from the neighboring property owner to completely remove the fire escape. Mr. Williams also noted that they have received a height waiver for the proposed elevator override, the only element of the addition that would extend above the existing height of the building.

Mr. Fifield noted that the proposed addition is within the envelope of the building. Mr. Fifield noted the unique character of the building and the setting and moved for conceptual approval of the addition provided that the fire escape was completely removed. Mr. Taylor second the motion, which passed unanimously.

800 N Rampart: 17-40402-VCGEN; Michael Rouchell, applicant; J & R Rental Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to install a gallery on the N. Rampart elevation, and a metal awning on the St. Ann elevation, and to modify existing door and window openings, per application & materials received 12/01/17 & 01/23/18.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=740386

Ms. Vogt presented the application with Mr. Williams & Ms. Champagne present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield stated that the photographs provided of the exterior of the building do not conclusively show the previous existence of an awning or gallery. Mr. Block added that the proposal is not a recreation of the awning as seen in the plan book drawings. Mr. Fifield pointed out that the location of the brick scarring shown in photographs aligns with the gutter above and does not match the rendering. Mr. Fifield asked staff to coordinate their research and review with the State Historic Preservation Office.

Mr. Fifield stated that there are other concerns with the proposal, including the removal of doors and windows. Mr. Taylor added that the applicant is requesting the new awning and gallery based on interpretations of historic drawings, but that the rest of the building does not match; he added that elements of the building are being cherry picked, and that the proposal to add the gallery is not part of a larger scale renovation that would restore the building accurately. He reiterated that the applicant should look for interior brick scarring to indicate that the gallery or awning existed on this building, as renderings and Sanborn maps are not a substitute for physical evidence.

Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application with the applicant to complete additional research. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

New Business

<u>1031 Orleans Ave</u>: 17-42763-VCGEN; Certified Construction Professionals LLC, applicant; 1031 Orleans LLC, owner; Proposal to repair deteriorated millwork and other minor repairs in conjunction with a **change of use** from *residential (single family)* to *residential (two family)*, per application & materials received 12/19/17 & 01/04/18, respectively. <u>https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=742589</u>

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Messrs. Williams and Jelich present on behalf of the application. With no discussion necessary, Mr. Fifield moved for **conceptual approval** of the proposed work and change of use, with the application to be forwarded to the Commission for review. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1301-1305 Burgundy St: 17-43564-VCGEN; Charles Berg, applicant; Richard H Jr Pipes, Martin K Dimitrov, Jeffrey D Sopko, 1303 Burgundy Street Unit 10 LLC, Douglas R Schmidt, Dane S Boue, David C Fairfield, Mary L Bohlke, J & Carole Follman Living Robert, Trent R Haines, Linda L Thompson, John F Landrum, Margaret Mccabe, owner; Proposal to rebuild rooftop cupola to match existing, per application & materials received 01/03/18 & 01/11/18, respectively. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=743422

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Berg present on behalf of the applicant. Mr. Berg noted that the structure would be constructed using metal framing rather than wood.

Mr. Fifield moved for conceptual approval of the application with the applicant to work with staff on final details. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<u>739-41 Bourbon St</u>: 18-00764-VCGEN; Max J Begue, applicant; Max J Begue, Max J Begue, owner; Proposal to paint exposed brick wall of rear, two-story building, per application & materials received 01/08/18.

The application was deferred with no one present on behalf of the application.

1228 Royal St: 18-02886-VCGEN; Russ Kreller, applicant; Earleen Boisdore, Edward W Gernon, Joseph W Suttner, William W Pouzar, Ellis Robert J, Jr, Joseph W Suttner, Brett S Moskowitz, P & P Properties Of Metairie LLC, Renick P Sr Webb, owner; Proposal to replace existing deteriorated galvanized chimney caps with new copper caps, per materials & application received 01/16/18.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Torres present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved to support the staff recommendation of denial of the application with the applicant to use an alternative material, with details to be finalized at the staff level. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<u>934 St Louis St:</u> 17-35233-VCGEN; Scott Daigle, applicant; Alternatives Media Inc, Charlie Lynn Adams, Scott J Daigle, owner; Proposal to install two (2) decorative, wall mounted, gas-light fixtures on the St. Louis elevation, per application & materials received 11/10/17. <u>https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=745564</u>

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation although no one was present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield inquired why gas fixtures were needed on this building.

Mr. Fifield moved to defer the application to allow for an applicant to be present on behalf of the application. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1031 Chartres St: 18-03168-VCGEN; Kimberly Girvan, applicant; Samuel P Girvan, owner; Proposal to repair deteriorated masonry wall at rear of dependency, per application & materials received 01/28/17.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report, with Mr. Anthony present on behalf of the application. Mr. Anthony stated that he had found a non-asphaltic material that was used with a copper fabric sheet at the recent Cabildo renovation. Mr. Taylor asked if the wall would be rebuilt; Mr. Anthony stated that it would be rebuilt on the 1031 side, with through-wall flashing. Mr. Fifield moved to **approve** the non-asphaltic material, with the applicant to work with staff on the final details prior to permit. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1005 St Philip St, 1009 St. Philip Street: 18-01001-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; Balentine Carbondale Holdings LLC, owner; Proposal to increase the height of orange-rated dependency, and to install a generator and condenser units, per application & materials received 01/09/17. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=744603

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Ms. Wotring present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for **conceptual approval**, consistent with staff recommendations, with details to be worked out at the staff level unless further AC review is needed. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

Appeals & Violations

<u>326 Chartres St</u>: **18-01087-VCGEN;** John C. Williams, applicant; 326-30 Chartres St LLC, owner; Appeal to retain rooftop addition and deck constructed on rear slope of gable roof without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 01/10/18 & 01/24/18, respectively. [Notices of violation sent 05/05/09 & 11/30/16] https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=744955

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Mr. Williams and Ms. Champagne present on behalf of the application. Mr. Williams stated that the current owner bought the property at auction from the city eighteen months prior and wished to retain the unpermitted roof deck.

Ms. Lousteau addressed the Committee, stating that a search of the City Assessor's website showed that the property was purchased by the owner from Gary Landrieu in 2010. She noted that the deck is inappropriate for the building based on the VCC Design Guidelines and seems to be damaging the structure.

Mr. Taylor stated that it is clear the deck has caused damage to the building. Mr. Fifield commented that nothing presented a convincing argument for retention of the deck. Mr. Block echoed staff requests for full scale plans, an engineer's report, and proposed details for roof penetrations. Mr. Fifield noted that the submitted materials did not address how to fix the systemic problems that make the building uninhabitable. Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application to allow the applicant to return to the Committee with a comprehensive proposal and all materials as requested by staff. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. Mr. Taylor also requested that any chain of title questions be clarified.

533 Toulouse St: 17-38691-VCGEN; 533 Toulouse LLC, applicant/owner; Proposal to retain rooftop deck and hot tub installed of roof of two-story building, per application & materials received 11/13/17. [Notices of Violation sent 04/11/14, 12/04/14, 02/12/15, 03/29/16, 12/01/16] [Stop Work Order posted 04/03/14]

The application was deferred with no one present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield instructed staff to compel the owner to come to the next meeting.

1035 Bourbon St: **17-43109-VCGEN;** West End Bourbon LLC, applicant/owner; Appeal to retain rooftop deck on the rear structure, and to retain modifications to rear dormer of main building used to access rooftop deck, per application & materials received 12/21/17. **[Notice of violation sent 12/14/17]**

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=742932

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Mr. Magee present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application to allow investigation into the concerns raised by staff, with permitting to be handled at staff level. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

623 Ursulines Ave: **18-40560-VCGEN;** ARC Roofing, applicant; Ursulines-New Orleans LLC, owner; Proposal to correct violations on the rear service building including replacing inappropriate windows & doors, modifying existing railing, removing metal staircase, and installation of new HVAC equipment, per application & materials received 01/03/18. **[NOTICE OF VIOLATION sent 11/04/16]**

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=743617

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Moran present on behalf of the application. Mr. Taylor stated that the use of French doors would be a good idea. Mr. Moran stated that they were willing to do whatever the Architecture Committee recommended.

Mr. Fifield recommended looking closely at the shop drawings for consistency and accuracy. Mr. Fifield inquired about the building code requirements for the building and if it was or would be sprinklered. Mr. Moran that it was not sprinklered.

Mr. Fifield moved for conceptual approval based on the staff recommendation with details of the millwork including French doors to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

Mr. Fifield moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at approximately 3 PM.