

VIEUX CARRE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

LaToya Cantrell
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Bryan Block
DIRECTOR

Architectural Committee meeting of **Tuesday, October 23, 2018**

Committee Members Present: Rick Fifield, Daniel Taylor, Nick Musso

Committee Members Absent: Dennis Brady

Staff Present: Bryan Block, Director; Renee Bourgoigne, Architectural Historian; Erin Vogt, Plans Examiner; Nick Albrecht, Plans Examiner

Staff Absent: Tony Whitfield, Inspector
Marguerite Roberts, Inspector

Others Present: Benjamin Tulman, Joe Paciera, Shea Trahan, Mary Hewes, Kate Bishop, Richard Bishop, Hank Smith, Ross Karsen, JC Paciestsa, Gunner Guidry, Charles Ward, Joey Carlson, Ryan Mayer, Meg Lousteau, John Williams, Alfred Hayes, Sharonda Williams, Leo Duvernay

AGENDA

Old Business

211-15 & 217-219 Royal St: 16-32063-VCGEN; John Guarnieri, applicant; Royal Condominium Developments LLC, owner; Proposal to reconstruct first floor storefront pilasters with cast stone instead of cast iron, per application & materials received 12/07/16 & 10/16/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=16-32063-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Karsen present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield stated that he found the change of material from cast iron to cast stone suitable and moved for the **approval** of the application. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

829 Dumaine St: 17-33284-VCGEN; Alex Tefel, applicant; Jeanne Poorman Revocable Trust The, Jeanne Poorman Revocable Trust The, owner; Proposal to install Boral bevel siding in lieu of natural wood weatherboards on rear service building as potential material test case, per application & materials received 09/28/17 & 09/17/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-33284-VCGEN>

Mr. Block read the staff report with no one present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved for the **approval** of the installation of Boral synthetic siding as a test case on the rear service buildings of 829 Dumaine Street as long as there is an inspection after every year for a total of five years with the caveat that the synthetic siding must be replaced with natural wood if it is determined to not meet VCC standards. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

929 St Peter St: 18-10396-VCGEN; Benjamin Tulman, applicant; Kerry P Foley, owner; Proposal to renovate multi-family dwelling including enclosure of rear staircases, per application & materials received 03/27/18 & 10/17/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=756057>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Tulman present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that he was comfortable with any remaining detailing being handled at the staff level. He concurred with the staff report and moved for **approval** of the application with the details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1026 St Louis St: 18-17211-VCGEN; Andrea Hendrickson, applicant; John W Stubbs, owner; Proposal to renovate an existing 4-bay creole cottage including replacing existing French doors with new single leaf doors, in conjunction with a change of use from vacant to standard restaurant, per application & materials received 05/22/18 & 10/11/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=762970>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Trahan present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that a full height guardrail would be a prudent thing to include at the elevated courtyard and that he agreed that the French doors on the St. Louis elevation should remain. Mr. Fifield noted the adjacency of the now proposed masonry ramp to the wood framing of the building and that it could potentially create a place for termites. Mr. Fifield requested that details be provided for how these materials would interact.

Mr. Trahan stated that both the doors and the elevated courtyard were results of the fire marshal review and that the fire marshal would have otherwise required a ramp down into the courtyard space.

Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application to allow the applicant to consider modifications to the proposal. Mr. Musso seconded the motion with the caveats that the comments on the doors and ramp flashing details be incorporated into the revised proposal. The motion passed unanimously.

616 St Peter St: 18-19734-VCGEN; Gabriel Viridure, applicant; Petit Theatre Du Vieux Carre Le, 616 St Peter St LLC, owner; Proposal to install wraparound canopy with cast iron panels over second floor gallery, per application & materials received 06/18/18 & 10/16/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-19734-VCGEN>

The application was deferred prior to the meeting at the applicant's request.

336 Decatur St: 18-28151-VCGEN; Jordan Gargas, applicant; Joseph C Paciera, owner; Proposal to construct new three story building for restaurant use featuring open roof terrace at the third floor and wraparound galleries at the second floor, per application & materials received 08/24/18 & 10/16/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=775008>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Ward present on behalf of the application.

Mr. Musso stated that he finds the proposal to be moving in the right direction. However, he did find the seating count shown to be indicative of a larger restaurant than expected which could present problems for the site. The egress conditions shown would not be adequate for this occupancy load. He also finds the proposed exterior to be a somewhat non-descript, generic modern building. There are opportunities here for the building to be more "playful".

Mr. Fifield expressed that he finds the proposed building to be "believable" but with little excitement. There is still little apparent depth to the cladding. The pilaster elements which house the downspouts do not work to indicate structure and are therefore rather dishonest. These problems stem from the use of stucco veneer which further indicates an opportunity to explore another cladding system and material.

He once again stated that there is a "mis-match" in the presentation of a 19th century gallery element (a more residential vocabulary) with a 20th century warehouse building (commercial vocabulary). That is not to say that one does not find this type of combination on our historic buildings but they are a result of adaptive reuse typically whereas this new construction lends itself to presenting a false history.

Size of columns should be studied further. The visual uniformity of doors configurations belies the fact that they do not actually all function the same. There should be some visual cues as to where the building entrance is located. If the building is to be clad in stucco there should be an indication of lintel detailing. As currently proposed the windows will not adequately shed water. He went on to state that the third floor open-air dining has the potential to be a very interesting space. He thought that the vertical "fin" elements shown at each gallery post was a step in the right direction towards a more appropriately contemporary detailing. This should be extended further to other elements of the design.

Mr. Taylor agreed that the proposal is currently too historicist in nature but was ok with the flat roof over the gallery. Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the matter so that the architect can respond to these concerns and study an alternate cladding system and materiality. The motion passed unanimously.

928 St Ann St: 18-28545-VCGEN; Gunner Guidry, applicant; Aura LLC, owner; Proposal to install iron alcove security gate, per application & materials received 08/28/18 & 10/16/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-28545-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Guidry present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for **conceptual approval** but asked the applicant to restudy the vertical and horizontal elements and to bring the transom bar height down a bit. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

1025 St Peter St: 18-28687-VCGEN; Rob Kemp, applicant; Rory Panepinto, owner; Proposal to construct new two story building along rear property line, per application & materials received 08/28/18 & 10/09/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=774798>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Kemp present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield noted the problem of the mismatch between the shotgun main building and the proposed service building. Mr. Musso, noting the small size of the courtyard, suggested removing the proposed projecting balcony, possibly in favor of Juliette balconies. Mr. Kemp inquired if the building would be better clad in wood siding rather than stucco. Mr. Fifield stated that the building type was consistent with stucco but that the details were inconsistent with those of stucco construction.

Mr. Fifield moved for a **deferral** in order for the applicant to return with a modified design for the rear building. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

New Business

1104 Dauphine St: 18-19046-VCGEN; Samara Poche, applicant; Edward L Selby, owner; Proposal to reconstruct and reinforce Ursulines-side parapet, per application & materials received 06/07/18 & 10/04/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-19046-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Ms. Poche and Mr. Pierre present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for **approval** of the proposed parapet reconstruction with the applicant to submit a section of the parapet that details the denticulated cornice prior to final approval and permit. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

533 Governor Nicholls St: 18-30495-VCGEN; Ryan Mayer, applicant; The Screening Room LLC, owner; Proposal to replace existing ground floor louvered and paneled shutters with new louvered shutters eliminating the top row of panels and proposal to replace wood elements of existing alleyway gate with new metal elements, per application & materials received 09/13/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=776421>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Mayer present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso concurred with the staff report and moved for **conceptual approval** of the replacement of the existing ground floor louvered and paneled shutters with new louvered shutters eliminating the top row of panels and the replacement of the wood elements on the existing alleyway gate with new metal elements, with the details to be handled at the staff level. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

327 Exchange Pl: 18-31158-VCGEN; Harry Smith Jr, applicant; Chartres Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to install kitchen hood and mechanical equipment on rear roof slope in conjunction with a **change of use** from *office* to *restaurant*, per application & materials received 09/20/18 & 10/16/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-31158-VCGEN>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Smith present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso concurred with the staff report and moved for **conceptual approval** with the details to be handled at the staff level. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

334 Decatur St: 18-31661-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; D B C Inc, owner; Proposal to install new hood vent and make up air ducts on roof, per application & materials received 09/24/18 & 10/16/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-31661-VCGEN>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved for the **approval** on the new hood vent with the details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

926 Chartres St: 18-34467-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; Chartres Empire LLC, owner; Proposal to install composite decking on recently approved and permitted new gallery construction, per application and materials received 10/10/18.

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved to **approve** the use of synthetic decking on the newly constructed gallery as long as the spacing of the sleepers was correct, the material was painted and a separate paint permit was issued for the painting. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Appeals and Violations

522 Chartres St: 17-17790-VCGEN; Greg Eckert, applicant; Supreme Court Parking LLC, owner; Proposal to install bollards in parking area to prevent vehicular damage to masonry walls, per application & materials received 05/23/17 & 10/16/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-17790-VCGEN>

Mr. Vogt read the staff report with Ms. Williams and Mr. Eckert present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield stated that the proposed dowels in the historic wall are problematic. Ms. Williams stated that the engineer prefers Option 1, and was concerned Option 2 would strike the wall. Mr. Musso stated that he worried that the brick corbel footing of the wall would not be able to take the weight of the concrete footing, and that the concrete could eat away at the historic brick. He did not want the wall system to be involved in supporting the bollards. Ms. Williams noted that an 18" offset may have an impact on the parking capacity. Mr. Musso stated that the wheel stops were shown too close to the bollards, and that they should be tied down with steel dowels.

Mr. Musso moved to conceptually approve Option 2, with the wheel stops to be moved back. After some discussion regarding parking capacity, the motion died without a second. Mr. Fifield stated that the applicant had agreed at previous hearings that the spaces would be limited to compact cars. Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the proposal until the applicant could provide a more detailed parking plan, including cars, bumpers and wheel stops. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1309 Dauphine St: 17-36492-VCGEN; John Campo, applicant; Second Quarter LLC, owner; Proposal to restore millwork removed without benefit of VCC review and approval, address various demolition by neglect and work without permit issues, and appeal to retain false doors and windows, per application & materials received 11/09/17 & 10/17/18, respectively. **[STOP WORK ORDER posted 04/05/17. Notice of Violations sent 08/08/14, 04/27/15, & 12/07/16.]**

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Campo present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield stated that it was important to restore true, fully operable and detailed millwork. Mr. Musso stated that the building style is rather rare and should be protected. He further stated that the number of units must be within zoning requirements and must be sprinkled. He also recommended that the fire escape be removed as it could ultimately do more harm than good. He moved for a **deferral** of the application in order for the applicant to address all deficiencies, as detailed in the staff report. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

906 Royal St: 18-31092-VCGEN; Leo Duvernay, applicant; Gregory D Tilton, H & H 906 LLC, Mark J Rochon, Royal Alice Properties LLC, Mark J Rochon, owner; Proposal to retain second floor gas lights installed without benefit of VCC review or approval, per application & materials received 09/24/18. **[Notice of Violation sent 09/06/18]**

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Duvernay present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that he would be more sympathetic if there was consistency in the lighting throughout the entire row. Mr. Taylor

suggested that the applicant use the larger fixtures at grade with the smaller fixtures higher up on the building. Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the application in order for the applicant to work with staff to develop a comprehensive lighting plan. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

931 St Louis St: 18-32498-VCGEN; Jorge Anchissi, applicant; William Anderson Mudd, owner; Proposal to retain keyless entry door hardware on the St. Louis elevation, per application & materials received 10/01/18.
<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=778638>

This item was deferred as there was no one present on behalf of the application.

With no business left to discuss, Mr. Fifield moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at approximately 3:20 PM.