

VIEUX CARRE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

LaToya Cantrell
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Bryan Block
DIRECTOR

Architectural Committee meeting of **Tuesday, October 9, 2018**

Committee Members Present: Rick Fifield, Daniel Taylor, Nick Musso

Committee Members Absent: Dennis Brady

Staff Present: Bryan Block, Director; Rene Bourgogne, Architectural Historian; Erin Vogt, Plans Examiner; Nick Albrecht, Plans Examiner

Staff Absent: Tony Whitfield, Inspector
Marguerite Roberts, Inspector

Others Present: Kate Bishop, Richard Bishop, Benjamin Tulman, John C. Williams, Bridget Balentine, Joseph Paciera, Freddie Boothe, Ross Karsen, Megan Tagesen, Ron Martinez, Gunner Guidry, Heather Little, Lacey Wotring, Nairne Frazar, Vincent Currenti, L. Katherine Harmon, Brooks Graham, Helen Williams, Sandra Contreras, DeShawn Daupre, Marion Lanasa,

MEETING MINUTES

Other Business

400 Royal St: Review of proposed roof repairs to the State Supreme Court building for a non-binding recommendation, per materials received 09/13/18.

Mr. Block read the staff report with Ms. Tagesen and Mr. Martinez present on behalf of the application. Mr. Martinez noted the problems experienced with leaks around the perimeter of the building. Mr. Taylor inquired about the color of the roofing. Mr. Martinez noted that it would be white. Mr. Musso noted that although white is not typically approved, that as the existing roofing is white he has no opposition to the new material being white.

Mr. Fifield moved for approval of the work as submitted. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

Old Business

211-19 Royal St: 17-22503-VCGEN; John Guarnieri, applicant; Royal Condominium Developments LLC, owner; Proposal to add new guardrail at rear roof deck and review of proposed changes to second floor doors and windows on main building, per application & materials received 06/28/17 & 10/02/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-22503-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Karsen present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for the approval of option 2 with conceptual approval of the new rail, only if the stone cap presented in the previous proposals was maintained, with details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

1005-09 St Philip St: 18-01001-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; Balentine Carbondale Holdings LLC, owner; Proposed revisions to previously-approved renovation of existing buildings, including the addition of an electric gate opening mechanism, roof exhaust, and mechanical condenser, and to modify the roof of the Burgundy-side rear alley infill, per application & materials received 01/22/18 & 10/02/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-01001-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Williams and Ms. Wotring present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield asked if the mechanical was being installed in an existing location; Ms. Wotring stated that the location was previously approved but different units were being proposed. Mr. Musso stated that the decibel level was too high for roof installation. Mr. Musso also stated that step flashing must be used at the kitchen parapet rather than cutting a reglet. Mr. Fifield moved for **approval** of the proposals, consistent with staff recommendations, with the proviso that the mechanical units must be 60 dBA rather than 70. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1240 Royal St: 18-21292-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; 1240 Royal LLC, owner;

Proposal to modify and increase the height of the existing wood fence located at the Gov. Nicholls property line, per application & materials received 06/28/18 & 09/26/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=767296>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield stated that there was a question of whether the height of the fence should be raised at all and that he did not see any compelling reason to increase the height of the opaque fence. Ms. Wotring stated that it was a matter of security for the building owner. Mr. Block noted that as this fence was only 6' tall it may be more easily scaled than a 7' fence and that 7' fences were fairly typical. It was noted that if a 7' fence were desired that the entire fence would need to be rebuilt rather than receive an addition. Mr. Fifield noted that once the building is actually occupied that the problems currently experienced may dissipate significantly. Mr. Musso suggested approving a fence at 7' but that the design would have to be reviewed and approved.

Mr. Fifield moved to allow a 7' tall fence with the details to return to the Architecture Committee for approval. Mr. Musso added the caveat to the motion that if a taller fence was required by the owner, that the applicant would need to resubmit the proposal with all of the rationale for the request. Mr. Musso seconded the amended motion and the motion passed unanimously.

922 St Peter St: 18-04752-VCGEN; Loretta Harmon, applicant; Paul Verrette, owner;

Proposal to demolish approximately 24' of property line wall and install new metal fencing with sliding gate between the properties, per application & materials received 02/08/18 & 09/26/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=748550>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Ms. Harmon present on behalf of the application. The applicant stated that the need for the revised proposal was due to the fact that the owner could not open his car doors in the driveway. She asked the committee if a sliding seven board fence would work. Mr. Musso stated that he was not opposed to a sliding seven board fence. Mr. Musso moved for a deferral in order for the applicant to get permission from the adjacent owner. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

929 St Peter St: 18-10396-VCGEN; Benjamin Tulman, applicant; Kerry P Foley, owner;

Proposal to renovate multi-family dwelling including proposal to enclose rear staircases, per application & materials received 03/27/18. <https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=756057>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Tulman present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for a deferral in order for the applicant to restudy the location and design of the access panel, the design of the door and possibly the transom as well. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

810 Conti St: 18-24866-VCGEN; Raymond Palazzolo, applicant; Johnny Provenza, owner;

Review of proposed mechanical and sound abatement plans for conceptually approved new bar/live music venue, per application & materials received 07/26/18 & 10/02/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=770667>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Palazzolo and Mr. Boothe present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield noted that the proposed mechanical equipment presented a great opportunity to keep the roof clear. Regarding the Conti elevation millwork, Mr. Musso stated that he would want to see something that looks more 1920s-1950s given the industrial nature of this building.

Mr. Fifield moved for the approval of the sound plans and the mechanical, as long as the mechanical was kept on the interior and not on the roof and for the deferral of the millwork for future review. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

336 Decatur St: 18-28151-VCGEN; Jordan Gargas, applicant; Joseph C Paciera, owner; Proposal to construct new three story building with the use to be determined featuring open roof terrace at the third floor and wraparound galleries at the second floor, per application & materials received 08/24/18 & 10/02/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=775008>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Ms. Little present on behalf of the application.

Mr. Musso expressed concern that the floor plans still do not indicate a kitchen especially as the footprint of the building is so compact and this is to be a three story restaurant. It is also vital that information be provided about prospective tenants. As this will require a Change of Use hearing by the VCC these issues must be addressed during the preliminary design review in order to achieve a recommendation of conceptual approval. It has been the experience of this commission that buildings can be designed as a standard restaurant only to be used as fast food, something that is not permitted as per the CZO. The floor plan is also important in how it will dictate the placement of exterior exhaust equipment, not just because of VCC visibility concerns, but also for the Fire Marshal Requirements. The arrangements of furniture will help determine occupancy requirements. Exterior furniture on the gallery and the somewhat open-air third floor must be indicated for review. These issues will also have an impact on acoustics review and must be addressed.

Mr. Musso agreed that the proposed 3rd floor windows were an improvement from the previous iteration but that he was not 100% satisfied with them as currently indicated. They should be operable windows.

Mr. Fifield raised some concerns regarding a perceived volumetric mis-match between gallery detailing and fenestration arrangement of a warehouse vs. a traditional 19th century building of some sort in terms of general massing. Previous AC comments were intended to work towards bringing those things more into alignment. This iteration is not succeeding at this quite yet.

Paired doors with side-lites are interspersed with accordion doors on the first floor. There should be details which unify these elements. The second floor is all accordion doors which seems to imply that this floor could be completely open which could raise some acoustic concerns.

How is water directed from the open third floor and off of the second floor gallery roof? The third floor windows appear to have a low sill height. How are life safety concerns addressed if these windows are to be operable, as recommended?

A larger concern is that this building is proposed to be clad in stucco but is indicated to be of frame construction instead of true masonry. As such the walls are quite thin which is apparent at parapets and fenestration, giving the game away. For example, the dentilated parapet will have a rather “pasted on” appearance unless detailed with proper depth and thickness. Windows and doors must be recessed deep within the walls with correct masonry detailing or they will not have adequate shadow lines and the entire building will not be successful.

The committee agreed that this is an extremely visible site which has proven difficult to develop. Taking material design cues from the adjacent historic masonry architecture is potentially difficult to render in modern building materials and methods. It was suggested that contemporary detailing and materials might be a better alternative, perhaps cladding the building in metal panels. But it is critical that this be handled in a very sensitive manner. This building needs to be of a high quality design.

The committee voted to defer the matter until these concerns are adequately addressed.

928 St Ann St: 18-28545-VCGEN; Gunner Guidry, applicant; Aura LLC, owner; Proposal to install new balcony awning, cornice, and mechanical equipment, per application & materials received 08/28/18 & 10/02/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-28545-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Guidry present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that he would be open to the idea of decomposed granite held within a framework. It was also his opinion that area beneath a parked car should be counted as open space as a car is movable equipment. The recommendation, however, was for flagstone paving on a sand bed.

Mr. Fifield moved for conceptual approval with details to be refined and reviewed at the staff level for cornice detailing (should be more angled, less blunt), wood paneled carriage gate, HVAC equipment, returning to the AC with revised paving proposal and a “map” of required brickwork. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

New Business

524 St Philip St: 18-25948-VCGEN; Vincent Currenti, applicant; Emma D Lerille, Diane L Simoneaux, St Philip Living Trust, Red Lerilie, Robert Chester Harzinski, Paul F Koenig, Arthur J, Jr Maloney, Jane F Krug, Rodney R Bradley, Arthur J Jr Maloney, Kirby O Price, owner;

Proposal to renovate building including structural repairs to termite damaged elements, per application & materials received 08/06/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=777506>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Currenti present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield stated that he had a problem with adding steel sistering in this location noting that it would repair the structural deficiency but would leave visible steel. Mr. Musso stated that he would like to see the dimensions remain the same.

Mr. Fifield moved to defer the application to allow the applicant to consider a wood repair detail. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

816 St Ann St: 18-30139-VCGEN; Helen Williams, applicant; Helen Williams, Jeanne M Broom, Charles B Currier, Clinton H Smith, owner; Proposal to add iron gates to front entry stoops, per application & materials received 09/26/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-30139-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Ms. Williams present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for conceptual approval of the gate with the caveat that the department of Safety and Permits must also approve for code compliance prior to final approval at the staff level. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

81 French Market Pl: 18-30456-VCGEN; Ryan Moran, applicant; Sandra Property Group LLC, owner; Proposal to replace roofing system including the retention of mechanical equipment installed and modified without benefit of VCC review or approval.

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Ms. Contreras and Mr. Daupaz present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for the approval of the new roof as long as the hood vent would be replaced with an inline system with details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Musso amended the motion to include the review of new AC units to be reviewed by staff as well. Mr. Fifield seconded the amended motion and the motion passed unanimously.

533 Governor Nicholls St: 18-30495-VCGEN; Ryan Mayer, applicant; The Screening Room LLC, owner; Proposal to replace existing ground floor louvered and paneled shutters with new louvered shutters eliminating the top row of panels and proposal to replace wood elements of existing alleyway gate with new metal elements, per application & materials received 09/13/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=776421>

The item was deferred as there was no one present on behalf of the application.

1124 Decatur St: 18-31170-VCPNT; Jordan Pollard, applicant; Justin W Phillipott, owner; Proposal to paint exposed graffitied brick at the first level only of both the Decatur and French Market elevations, per application received 09/20/18.

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Kodi present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield stated that the graffiti should be removed immediately to prevent a future problem. He moved for the approval of painting the Decatur elevation from the second floor down to the street level. He further stated that the French Market elevation should remain unpainted and that the Committee should adopt the staff recommendations. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

225 Chartres St: 18-31246-VCGEN; Brooks Graham, applicant; 225 Chartres Owner LLC, owner; Proposal to install new recirculating fountain, planters and decorative elements in rear courtyard, per application & materials received 09/20/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-31246-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Graham present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that the area in which the new fountain and planter was proposed was visually unobtrusive and that the suggestions of staff were appropriate given the situation. He also stated that he was OK with the planting pots. Mr. Fifield stated that he completely agreed with staff and Mr. Musso and moved for conceptual approval with the final details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Appeals and Violations

1209 Decatur St: 17-43280-VCGEN; Marion Lanasa, applicant; Riso Decatur Sproperty LLC, owner; Proposal to correct or retain various violations throughout the property including the installation of new catenary light system, per application & materials received 01/22/18 & 07/17/18, respectively. **[Notice of Violation sent 11/10/17]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=745557>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Lanasa present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved to approve the proposed catenary system as presented with final details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

831 Dauphine St: 18-13486-VCGEN; Donald Maginnis, applicant/owner; Appeal to maintain copper cap flashing and electrical conduits, per application & materials received 04/23/18. **[Notice of Violation sent 02/01/18]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-13486-VCGEN>

The item was deferred at the applicant's request prior to the meeting.

91 French Market Pl: 18-30267-VCGEN; MiamiNola Enterprises LLC, applicant; James & Richard Realty, owner; Proposal to retain work completed in deviation of approved permit including stain on exterior doors and trim in lieu of approved paint, per application & materials received 09/12/18. **[Notice of Violation sent 05/03/17]**

The item was deferred as there was no one present on behalf of the application.

1039 Burgundy St: 18-31734-VCGEN; Douglas Matthews, applicant; Courtney S Katzenstein, owner; Appeal to retain vinyl storm door and barbed wire installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 09/25/18. **[Notice of Violation sent 01/05/18]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-31734-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Ms. Frazar present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved for a **denial** of the appeals to retain the razor wire and vinyl door, consistent with the staff recommendations. He suggested that the applicant meet with staff to discuss the possible installation of a hedgehog in place of the barbed wire. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

With no business left to discuss, Fifield moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at approximately 3:25 PM.