

VIEUX CARRÉ COMMISSION ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE

Mitchell J. Landrieu
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Bryan Block
DIRECTOR

NOTE: The below minutes are in draft form and are a summary of actions taken. They are not a verbatim transcription of the meeting.

Architectural Committee meeting of **Tuesday, March 27th, 2018**

Committee Members Present: Daniel Taylor, Rick Fifield, Nick Musso

Committee Members Absent: Dennis Brady,

Staff Present: Bryan Block, Director; Nicholas G. Albrecht, Plans Examiner; Erin Vogt, Plans Examiner; René Bourgogne, Architectural Historian;

Staff Absent: Erika Gates, Building Inspector; Anthony Whitfield, Building Inspector

Others Present: John Williams, Mark Heck, Bill Keck, Bev Falk, Dixon Jelich, Darby Shields, Al Sunseri, Mike Perino, Mike Centanni, George Hargrove, Sophie Vorkoff, Geoff Coats, Amy Garrett, Elaine Bergeron, Dwight Norton, Louis Haywood, Sarah Norman, Jordan Pollard, Allen Kelly, Brian Anderson, Walter Ankar, S Lee, Cassidy Self,

AGENDA

Other Business

640 Royal St: 17-23398-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; James & Richard Realty, owner; Review of existing conditions of stucco, underlying masonry, and shutter hinge condition based on findings from initial permitted work for restoration of the Royal and St. Peter elevations.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=723363>

Nick M: Z-shaped hinge, although historic, one made to remedy a faulty design in the shutter. Holds rail and stile together. Not something that should be perpetuated merely because it is historic. Purpose of hinge two-fold: holding the elements of shutter because of lack of morticing; and the normal function of a hinge with eye fitting onto a socket. Not comfortable with perpetuating. Leaving existing to remain ok but not additional where missing. Addressing hinge only. Would rather remake shutter correctly with normal hinge

Rick F: examples of this hinge do exist. Are the shutters morticed?

John W: yes

RF: really discussing position of hinge in relation to frame. Anomalous condition is the pintle is attached to the back side of the frame. So that would be non-accessible once the frame is installed. Pintle on the opening side of the frame instead of the brick side is what is being showed in the mock-up.

Mark Heck: showing existing casing with notch in it. Put in regular size jamb with trim morticed in with hinge non-visible when shutter open. Other is morticing hinge into the jamb.

RF: hinge in either proposed details shutter doesn't seat into the frame as it should

MH: intent is to not alter the shutters to accommodate

RF: realistic ability to use existing shutters?

JW: reuse most

RF: for Renee: Z-shape hinges? How often installed in other conditions. Are they usually for warehouse bldgs.? Where is pintle installed typically?

RB: there is installation at Napoleon house

MH: this installation the plaster comes all the way beyond the pintle and to the edge which precludes making adjustments to allow for irregular openings

RF: importance of relationship of shutter to frame and how it sits within the depth of the opening. Don't think the details presented fully address the condition. Margin between shutter and frame. Bringing stucco over the hinge would need to be detailed?

BB: how would that be constructed?

David Carimi: nothing to adhere to stucco

JW: these two options allow

NM: believes that this hinge is anachronistic although maybe 100 years old.

DT: not recommending wholesale removal of historic material

MH: shrinking the jamb profile allows to maintain the width of the existing shutter

RF: have air space between elements, narrow the space between stucco and trim. Have staff look at existing conditions to determine historic conditions.

NM: potentially rebuild shutter so it becomes narrower

RF: margin between frame and shutter is in question

MH: will revise detail to address these concerns

DT: expand detail to show how jamb interacts with opening

NM: not ready to leave to staff

Renee B: bricks shown for reference

David Carimi: two wood mould bricks

RF: idea of relative compressive strength?

DC: can provide

RF: brick is lighter in weight so may have less compressive strength

Delegate to staff

Bryan B: provide that engineering info

MH: will provide additional details and engineering info re: bricks

RF: interested on more info on this type of shutter and hinge

NM: typically used on warehouse due to more robust use

RF: a sense of when these shutter and hinges showed up

NM: it's a cheap hinge

JW: these shutter and hinges are in HABS drawings

RF: agree that they are old just perhaps not original fabric

Old Business

933 Bourbon St: 16-08557-VCGEN; 933 Bourbon St: Craig Lehnhardt, applicant; Nola Bourbon LLC, owner; Proposal to remove existing wooden decking on front porch and replace with Aeratis Heritage synthetic decking, per application & materials received 03/16/16.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=16-08557-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Ms. Bergeron present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for approval of the proposal. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

211-15 Royal St. & 217-19 Royal St: 17-22503-VCGEN; John Guarnieri, applicant; Royal Condominium Developments LLC, owner; Review of construction documents for conceptually approved rooftop penthouse and roof decks, per application & materials received 06/28/17 & 03/20/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=722226>

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Ms. Garrett and Ms. Norman present on behalf of the application. Mr. Taylor asked if a lighting designer was involved; Ms. Garrett answered no, but that the proposed lighting would be vetted with an electrical consultant. Mr. Taylor stated that he was concerned that the roof area could be overly lit. Ms. Vogt asked the applicant to revise and resubmit the previously approved construction document set for the renovation of the historic buildings (16-32063) to include the penthouses and roof decks, so this permit may reflect the proposed work comprehensively.

Mr. Fifield stated that the proposed millwork, while unusual, can be considered appropriate for a contemporary addition and can be approved as is. He then moved to **approve** the construction documents consistent with staff recommendations (except for staff requested millwork revisions). Mr. Musso amended the motion to add that the future lighting submittal should return to Committee for further review, but that all other outstanding submittals could be handled at staff level. Mr. Fifield accepted the amendment to the motion and Mr. Musso seconded it; the approval passed unanimously.

229 Royal St: 17-27261-VCGEN; 229 Royal St: John C. Williams, applicant; 229 Royal Street LLC, owner; Review of design development drawings of conceptually approved proposal to restore façade elements & to construct new rooftop pool and deck, per application & materials received 08/08/17 & 03/20/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=726961>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Heck and Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that he found hollow metal doors appropriate for the particular locations being proposed and inquired about the brand of synthetic decking being proposed. Mr. Heck responded that they were considering Azek. Mr. Musso commented that he was not as comfortable with Azek decking but that he didn't have a problem with some kind of synthetic decking. Mr. Fifield commented that he had no problem with the metal fascia.

Mr. Musso stated that he concurred with the staff report. Mr. Musso moved to approve the metal doors and metal fascia but advised the applicant to alter their choice of synthetic decking and provide information about the lighting position. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

1039 Toulouse St: 17-38045-VCGEN; 1039 Toulouse St: Stewart Schmidt, applicant; Alfred R Sunseri, owner; Proposal to modify building and correct or retain violations including proposals to install new plate glass windows, retain HVAC unit, and retain new wood lattice rooftop railing, per application & materials received 11/10/17 & 3/20/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=738175>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Sunseri present of behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved to approve the replacement of the glass in the windows on the N. Rampart elevation with tempered plate glass, to allow the relocation of the HVAC split units to the right wall, to maintain the enclosure, and to maintain the awning with all details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

828 Toulouse St: 18-04926-VCGEN; 828 Toulouse St: John C. Williams, applicant; 828 Toulouse Street LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate rear buildings damaged by fire including partial demolition of courtyard infill to create additional open space, modifications of existing stairs and balconies, and installation of new mechanical equipment, per application & materials received 02/09/18 & 03/06/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=748621>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Williams and Mr. Winkert present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for the approval of option 3 provided the middle bay would be pushed back. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passes unanimously

1124 Decatur St: 18-05129-VCGEN; 1124 Decatur St: Jordan Pollard, applicant; Justin W Phillpott, owner; Proposal to renovate building including modifying ground floor doors, per application & materials received 02/12/18 & 03/22/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=748862>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Pollard present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved to accept the staff report with option A being the preferred approach. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

518 Dumaine St: 18-06868-VCGEN; Brian Anderson, applicant; La Place Revocable The, owner; Proposal to modify the Chartres elevation of the service ell, per application and materials received 02/27/18 & 03/20/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-06868-VCGEN>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Kelly and Mr. Anderson present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for deferral in order for the applicant to provide an engineer's report, to restudy the enclosure and also to research the history of the enclosure. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

941 Toulouse St: 18-06844-VCGEN; 941 Toulouse St: Robert Bell, applicant; Lc Clang!, owner; Proposal to renovate building including reinforcing service building balcony, per application & materials received 02/27/18 & 03/22/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=751666>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Perino present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved for approval consistent with the staff report. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passes unanimously.

New Business

509 Royal St: 18-07513-VCGEN; 509 Royal St: Ryan Tramonte, applicant; Royal St Ltdpartnership 511, owner; Proposal to modify storefront windows by removing muntins and installing single pane shatterproof glass, per application & materials received 03/07/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-07513-VCGEN>

Deferred due to a lack of representation on behalf of the application.

534 Esplanade Ave: 18-07940-VCGEN; 534 Esplanade Ave: Albert Palumbo, applicant; Albert A Palumbo, owner; Proposal to install two (2) new hanging gas light fixtures on the first floor of the Esplanade elevation, per application & materials received 03/07/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=752622>

This application will be handled at staff level.

1300 Chartres St: 18-08077-VCGEN; 1300 Chartres St: Walter Antin, applicant; Monterra Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate building including the demolition of the rear, brown-rated addition and the creation of an off-street parking spot, per application & materials received 03/08/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=752712>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Antin present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield noted that the proposed demolition would eliminate interesting fabric and configurations and advised the applicant not to take the demolition proposal lightly.

Mr. Musso moved for deferral in order for the staff to conduct a site visit of the rear building. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

1122 Dauphine St: 18-08654-VCGEN; 1122 Dauphine St: Alexander Adamick, applicant; Addie C Price, owner; Proposal to modify door and window openings in rear accessory building, per application & materials received 03/13/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-08654-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Ms. Self present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for **deferral** consistent with staff recommendation. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1301 Chartres St: 18-09214-VCGEN; Sidney Lee, applicant; Jon C King, Palo Inc, Rachel D Perkoff, Eddy D Broadway, Carolyn C Looper, Jeanne M Taylor, Geoffrey Kleine-Deters, owner; Proposal to install new mini-split condenser per application & materials received 03/19/18.

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Lee present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved for conceptual approval pending the acknowledgment for the adjacent owner and a master plan from the condo association. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Appeals & Violations

1001 Governor Nicholls St: 17-18113-VCGEN; 1001 Governor Nicholls St: Laurie Toups, applicant; Vincenzo Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to install new courtyard access gate and new glass and wood dormer door, correct minor demolition by neglect issues, and appeal to retain wooden deck, per application & materials received 05/30/17 & 03/09/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-18113-VCGEN>

Deferred at the applicant's request.

406 Burgundy St: 18-09031-VCGEN; Timothy Blake, applicant; Burgundy Street LLC, owner; Proposal to retain tie backs on the Conti elevation, per application & materials received 03/16/18 & 09/06/17, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-09031-VCGEN>

Deferred due to the fact that there was a lack of representation on behalf of the application.

Next AC date: Tuesday, April 10, 2018

Mr. Fifield moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at approximately 3:45 PM.