

VIEUX CARRÉ COMMISSION ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE

Mitchell J. Landrieu
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Bryan Block
DIRECTOR

Architectural Committee meeting of **Tuesday, April 24, 2018**

Committee Members Present: Rick Fifield, Daniel Taylor, Nick Musso

Committee Members Absent: Dennis Brady,

Staff Present: Bryan Block, Director, Rene Bourgogne, Architectural Historian; Erin Vogt, Plans Examiner; Nick Albrecht, Plans Examiner

Staff Absent: Tony Whitfield, Inspector; Marguerite Roberts, Inspector

Others Present: Daniel Zangara, Mark Heck, Max Begue, Kate Bishop, Richard Bishop, Tim Lupin, Mary Hewes, John Williams, Brian Anderson, Walter Antin, Steve Olson, Mark Backus, Dennis Fos, Richard Abadigian

AGENDA

Old Business

810 Esplanade Ave: Daniel Zangara, applicant; Ibu And Bapak LLC, owner; Proposal to install a wrought iron gate in front entrance alcove, per application & materials received 03/29/16 & 04/11/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=16-09797-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Zangara present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for conceptual approval with details to be worked out at the staff level. He recommended a single swing gate and larger pickets. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

1017 St Philip St & 1023 St Philip St: 17-25704-VCGEN & 17-25711-VCGEN; Lawrence Lupin, applicant; Elie Khoury, owner; Proposal to change the design of the previously approved fire-rated door located in the new glass connector between the two properties, per application & materials received 07/26/17 & 04/17/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-25704-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Lupin present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

229 Royal St: 17-27261-VCGEN; 229 Royal St: John C. Williams, applicant; 229 Royal Street LLC, owner; Review of design development drawings of conceptually approved proposal to restore façade elements & to construct new rooftop pool and deck, per application & materials received 08/08/17 & 04/17/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=726961>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved for approval provided the new decking could be painted without affecting the warranty of the material. He also asked that the applicant provide a sample to staff. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

800 N Rampart St: 17-40402-VCGEN; Michael Rouchell, applicant; J & R Rental Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to install a gallery on the N. Rampart elevation, and a metal awning on the St. Ann elevation, and to modify existing door and window openings, per application & materials received 12/01/17 & 04/17/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-40402-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Messrs. Williams & Heck present on behalf of the application.

Ms. Lousteau addressed the Committee, concerned that the building is currently in horrible condition with a window falling in leaving the building unsecured. She stated that the applicant appears to be cherry picking desirable elements from the previous and existing designs rather than restoring the building to a particular period. Ms. Vogt noted that a permit had been issued in response to violations and adjudications, but that the

work had not been done and the permit had since expired.

Mr. Musso asked the applicant if the intent was to have an occupiable gallery; Mr. Williams answered yes. Mr. Block stated that any change of use will need Commission review and a full proposal for the change of use should be submitted. Mr. Musso asked if any residential units would be included in the proposal; Mr. Williams answered no.

Mr. Fifield was concerned with the selective proposal to restore certain building elements and ignore others. He stated that there is no particular moment in time that the building would be restored to, and pointed out that the existing and proposed windows and doors are very different from the archival drawings, and the roof slope was drastically different and there were no dormers at that time the gallery/awning existed. He also stated that there is no evidence that there was inhabitable space on the gallery. Mr. Musso reiterated that the staff and Committee have repeatedly requested the applicant look for physical evidence since the first time the proposal was reviewed in January, and that nothing has been submitted in response. Mr. Williams stated that Ms. Hilary Irvin had conducted some research on the property; Mr. Fifield responded that the research was not conclusive and physical evidence should be explored. Mr. Williams asked if evidence of a door or window in the N. Rampart side gable would support the proposal, and Mr. Block answered that the staff and Committee were interested in any brick scarring or evidence that would indicate previous design. He added that any evidence of structural loads to support an occupiable gallery would be telling as well. Mr. Fifield noted that the rendering shows a wooden side gable, which differs from existing conditions.

Mr. Musso stated that it would be interesting to develop a proposal based on a restoration from a particular date, without combining elements from different periods, and reiterated that the renderings are not necessarily accurate and physical evidence will trump written or drawn records. Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application pending further investigation by the applicant to support the proposal. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

739 Bourbon St: 18-00764-VCGEN; Max J Begue, applicant; Max J Begue, owner; Proposal to apply water repellent sealer to exposed brick wall of rear, two-story building, per application & materials received 01/08/18.

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Begue present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved for approval and for the work to proceed. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

518 Dumaine St: 18-06868-VCGEN; Brian Anderson, applicant; La Place Revocable The, owner; Proposal to modify the Chartres elevation of the service ell, per application and materials received 02/27/18 & 04/16/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-06868-VCGEN>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Anderson present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield recommended working on an expression of the enclosure that works with the building and requested sections through the balcony space.

Mr. Musso moved for deferral in order for the applicant to submit a proposal without the 5 bays, to examine the appropriate size of the openings, and to examine a 19th century materials template. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

1300 Chartres St: 18-08077-VCGEN; Walter Antin, applicant; Monterra Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate building including the demolition of the rear, brown-rated addition and the creation of an off-street parking spot, per application & materials received 03/08/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=752712>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Antin present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield commented that the existing condition was a uniquely interesting elevation. Mr. Musso recommended maintaining the existing building form.

Mr. Fifield recommended sending a negative recommendation for demolition to the full Commission and that the applicant work on a redevelopment plan to reconstruct the rear buildings.

New Business

1104 Decatur St: 18-11156-VCSGN; John C. Williams, applicant; Tamais Limited Partnership, owner; Proposal to install new oversized parapet mounted neon sign, per application & materials received 04/03/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=756952>

The application was deferred at the applicant's request prior to the meeting.

816 Burgundy St: 18-11058-VCGEN; Gregory Smith, applicant; Simpson Fq Property LLC, owner; Proposal to modify design of previously approved French doors and transom, per application & materials received 04/03/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=756684>

The application was deferred at the applicant's request prior to the meeting.

310 Chartres St: 18-11097-VCGEN; Dennis Fos, applicant; Chsp French Quarter LLC, owner; Proposal to modify existing fixed French doors and convert them to in-swinging French doors, per application & materials received 04/06/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-11097-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report Mr. Fos present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that the Committee would need to review acoustical information for the air curtains. Mr. Fos agreed to submit manufacturer's cut sheets for the equipment. Mr. Fos stated that if the two center bay doors could open out that the doors would not need to be cut, but would obstruct the sidewalk. Mr. Fifield commented that there is no way the doors could lay flat due to the pilasters, and that encroachment on the sidewalk is not just a VCC issue, but would require public works review and approval.

Mr. Musso stated that he did not find the proposal approvable as presented and shared the concerns of the staff, but that operable doors could be approvable if more information is provided to show that the doors would not encroach and would not be atypically cut as proposed. Mr. Taylor asked why the applicant was requesting to modify the doors; Mr. Fos answered that the main concern was visibility. Mr. Taylor responded that removable glass panels or night blinds could be explored as options. Mr. Musso agreed that the doors could be modified with a similar appearance, but have a fixed wood panel below and operable glass. Mr. Block asked the Committee their opinion of an inward swing on the glass portion only, to which the Committee members responded could be an option.

Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application so the applicant could meet with staff to discuss all options, and for the applicant to submit additional materials as requested. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

901 Iberville St: 18-12444-VCSGN; Mark Backus, applicant; Properties L L C Hyman-Moses, Hyman-Moses Properties L L C, owner; Proposal to install new hanging sign with incorporated LED illumination, per application & materials received 04/12/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=758137>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Olsen and Mr. Backus present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved for conceptual approval in accordance with the staff report with regards to the new sign providing consistent light in a warm white color and that the incorporated LEDs have a low max brightness and be dimmable. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

540 N Rampart St: 18-12473-VCGEN; Harry Smith Jr, applicant; Vincent J Jr Marcello, owner; Proposal to install new millwork in ground floor cut corner opening, per application & materials received 04/12/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=758124>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Messrs. Marcello and Carlson present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield suggested that the applicants look at other examples of cut corner millwork. Mr. Musso commented that

he liked the proposed scale of the millwork.

Mr. Musso moved to defer the application in order for the applicant to make necessary modifications and for the final drawings to be reviewed at the staff level. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

724 St Philip St: 18-12489-VCGEN; Harry Smith Jr, applicant; Minacore Investments LLC, owner; Proposal to construct new shed roof between buildings, per application & materials received 04/13/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=758211>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Messrs. Marcello and Carlson present on behalf of the application. Mr. Marcello noted that they may be able to relocate the mechanical equipment out of the space where the roof was being proposed. Mr. Block suggested that the roof between the buildings could utilize a differentiating material.

Mr. Musso moved to accept the proposal provided that a standing seam roof was used in lieu of slate and the artificial materials were removed from the proposal. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Appeals & Violations

900 Dumaine St: 17-16049-VCGEN; Jarred Zeringue, applicant; Qsr Properties LLC, QSR Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to install Aeratis Heritage synthetic decking on second floor balcony, in conjunction with previously-approved violation abatement, per application & materials received 05/12/17.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-16049-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report. There was no one present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

208 Chartres St: 17-41983-VCGEN; Richard Abadisians, applicant; M & R Group LLC, owner; Appeal to retain rear dormer, skylight, and HVAC unit installed on rear roof slope without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 12/12/17. **[Notice of Violation sent 10/24/17]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-41983-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with be Abadisians present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved to defer the dormer in order for the applicant to present a new design, but moved to approve the retention of the skylight in its current location. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

808 Dauphine St: 18-11720-VCGEN; John Raney, applicant; Ronald S Cochran, John Cangelosi, owner; Appeal to retain wooden decking system installed on top of existing decking on the front balcony, and to retain modifications to gallery ironwork due to raising the height of the decking, per application & materials received 04/09/18. **[Notice of Violation sent 03/20/18, STOP WORK ORDER placed 03/19/18.]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-11720-VCGEN>

The application was deferred at the applicant's request prior to the meeting.

With no business left to discuss, Mr. Musso moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at approximately 3:02 PM.