VIEUX CARRE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

LaToya Cantrell
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Bryan Block DIRECTOR

Architectural Committee meeting of Tuesday, September 11th, 2018

Committee Members Present: Nick Musso, Rick Fifield, Daniel Taylor

Committee Members Absent: Dennis Brady

Staff Present: Rene Bourgogne, Architectural Historian; Erin Vogt, Plans Examiner;

Nick Albrecht, Plans Examiner

Staff Absent: Bryan Block, Director

Tony Whitfield, Inspector

Marguerite Roberts, Inspector

Others Present: Bev Falk, Corbett Scott, David McMurphy, John C. Williams, Steven

Wagner, L. Katherine Harmon, Gunner Guidry, Daniel Winkert, Harvey Burns, Brooks Graham, Dale Wood, Charles Ward, Alfred Hayes, Erika

Gates

AGENDA

Old Business

<u>310 Chartres St:</u> 18-11097-VCGEN; Dennis Fos, applicant; Chsp French Quarter LLC, owner; Proposal to replace non-operable first floor doors with new French doors, per application & materials received 04/06/18 & 09/04/18, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-11097-VCGEN

The item was deferred as there was no one present on behalf of the application.

<u>308 N Rampart St</u>: 18-17889-VCGEN; Loretta Harmon, applicant; Lesly H Labadie, owner; Proposal to renovate building including the installation of new mechanical venting, in conjunction with a proposed change of use from vacant to restaurant, per application & materials received 05/29/18 & 09/04/18, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=763708

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Ms. Harmon present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved for conceptual approval consistent with the staff report forwarding the application to the full Commission for the consideration of the change of use with a recommendation of approval provided that all aspects of the proposal were approvable with other city departments. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

<u>1014 N Rampart St:</u> 18-19094-VCGEN; Corbett Scott, applicant; Mohit Srivastava, owner; Review of design development drawings for renovation of pink-rated building, in conjunction with a **change of use** from *vacant* to *restaurant*, and to construct a small two-story service building in the rear courtyard, per application & materials received 06/07/18 & 08/28/18, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-19094-VCGEN

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Messrs. Scott and McMurphy present on behalf of the application. Staff noted that the applicant may wish to consider an awning for the new rear construction, as this element should be integrated into the design at this point if desired, instead of proposing to add one later on. After some discussion regarding occupancy loads and egress, Mr. Fifield recommended that the side entrance gate be widened to handle the egress instead of installing mulled doors on the front elevation.

Mr. Fifield moved to **conceptually approve** the proposal, with provisos for the rear building, hood vent, and egress as per the staff report and Committee recommendations. He noted that any proposed awning on the rear building would need to return to the Committee for review; construction documents would also need to return to AC for final approval prior to permit. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<u>1240 Royal St</u>: 18-21292-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; 1240 Royal LLC, owner; Proposal to modify roof structure of the rear addition to the main building, per application & materials received 06/26/18 & 08/01/18, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=767296

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved for the approval of option A 3.0 with the caveat that the diamond window be replaced with a double hung window or blanked out. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

<u>617-619 St Ann St</u>: 18-22507-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; Valentino Investments LLC, owner; Proposal to replace existing cast iron gallery columns with new steel pipe columns and to install new canvas drop awnings, per application & materials received 07/09/18 & 09/05/18, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=768426

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. After some discussion regarding the price of the fluted columns and the type of column appropriate for the style of building, Mr. Fifield moved for the deferral of the column replacement in order for the applicant to examine other styles of columns, and the approval of the new drop awning. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

New Business

<u>400 Chartres St</u>: 18-27185-VCGEN; Steven Wagner, applicant; & Leila Williams Foundation Kemper, owner; Proposal to replace wood balcony decking with Aeratis decking, per application & materials received 08/23/18. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-27185-VCGEN

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Wagner present on behalf of the application. After much deliberation over the possibility of approving Aeratis decking for a blue rated building, Mr. Musso and Mr. Taylor both expressed their reluctance. Mr. Fifield moved for **approval** of the decking. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

<u>713 St Louis St:</u> 18-28014-VCGEN; Harvey Burns, applicant; Roy F Guste, Roy F Guste, owner; Proposal to modify existing mechanical platform, install new condensers, and rearrange existing units, per application & materials received 08/23/18.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-28014-VCGEN

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Burns present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved for **approval** of the application in accordance with the staff report as the proposal would be a significant improvement over the existing conditions. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

225 Chartres St: 18-28114-VCGEN; Brooks Graham, applicant; 225 Chartres Owner LLC, owner; Proposal to install new condensers and hood vent on roof, per application & materials received 08/24/18 & 09/06/18, respectively. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-28114-VCGEN

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Graham present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved for **approval** of the proposal to install new condensers and a hood vent on the roof of 225 Chartres. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

<u>336 Decatur St</u>: 18-28151-VCGEN; Jordan Gargas, applicant; Joseph C Paciera, owner; Proposal to construct new three story building with the use to be determined featuring open roof terrace at the third floor and wraparound galleries at the second floor, per application & materials received 08/24/18.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=775008

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Messrs. Wood and Ward present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso noted that one previous proposal for this site had been rejected because there was no tenant and inquired if they had a current tenant and a current operation. Mr. Ward replied that they did not have a tenant but that it was being designed as a restaurant and noted that the building was being designed so that all of the mechanical

equipment would be screened.

Mr. Fifield noted that a section through the building, especially at the third floor would be helpful. Mr. Fifield continued that a reduction in the scale of the building (from the previous proposal) is exactly what the site needs. Mr. Taylor noted that the applicants may need to restudy the building's fenestration. Mr. Fifield noted that the gallery details don't necessarily match the building's type.

Mr. Williams, in the audience, noted that the previous applicants worked with the neighboring owner, who he represents, and requested that these applicants do the same.

Ms. Lousteau, in the audience representing VCPORA, noted that her prime concern is that this site is pivotal to the French Quarter and that the design should be held to the highest standard. She also expressed concern over the open air nature of the third floor and stated that it shouldn't be assumed that there would be no sound effect on neighboring buildings.

Mr. Musso moved to defer the application to allow the applicant to respond to the comments of the staff report and Architecture Committee. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1025 St Peter St: 18-28687-VCGEN; Rob Kemp, applicant; Rory Panepinto, owner; Proposal to demolish existing rear additions and to construct new two story building in similar footprint and proposal to add new side dormer to roof of main building, per application & materials received 08/28/18. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-28687-VCGEN

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Kemp present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield stated that he needed to see all the elevations, and that the proposed side dormer was not appropriate. He further stated that there were alternative massing scenarios that could work. Mr. Musso motioned for deferral concurrent with the staff report in order for the applicant to provide additional information and documentation of the existing structure, restudy the siting and details of the proposed new construction, and to eliminate the side dormer proposal. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

<u>928 St Ann St:</u> <u>18-28545-VCGEN:</u> Gunner Guidry, applicant; Aura LLC, owner; Proposal to install new balcony awning, cornice, swimming pool, and mechanical equipment, and to stucco exposed masonry walls, per application & materials received 08/28/18.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-28545-VCGEN

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Guidry present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso commented on the large amount of Portland cement present and noted difficulty with removing it unless it has delaminated. Mr. Guidry stated that he had consulted with mason Theodore Pierre and they had discussed minimizing the thickness of the stucco around reveals, but that Mr. Pierre was very concerned about the condition of the bricks if left exposed. Mr. Musso requested a survey of the brick conditions, as it would likely be most appropriate to tailor the treatment to fit each area.

Mr. Fifield stated that agreed with the staff recommendations, and that the applicant must provide convincing reasoning for proposed work, including full details. He especially requested revisions to the proposed alcove gate and the awning design, recommending that the applicant look at precedents in the district. Mr. Fifield stated that he was absolutely opposed to the through-wall AC units.

After some discussion regarding the brick and mortar conditions, Mr. Fifield moved for **deferral** in order for the applicant to study the building further and return with a more complete proposal. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Appeals and Violations

<u>1031 Barracks St</u>: 18-27792-VCGEN; Loretta Harmon, applicant; Loretta K Harmon, Michael T Howells, District Porperties LLC, Federal National Mortgage Association, owner; Appeal to retain metal cap flashing installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 08/22/18. [Notices of Violation sent 08/08/14 & 11/16/16]

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-27792-VCGEN

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Ms. Harmon present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved to **approve** the <u>temporary retention of the cap flashing for 12 months</u> at which time the applicant would be required to remove the metal cap flashing and replace it with a traditional mortar cap. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

<u>528 N Rampart St</u>: 18-28156-VCGEN; Jane Corey Scheuermann, applicant; Rx Holdings LLC, Shane E Williams, Jeffery C Collins, Jane C Scheuerman, Jane C Scheuerman, Michael C Romano, Michael C Romano, owner; Proposal to add security screen on metal alleyway gate, per application & materials received 08/26/18.

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Scheuermann present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for conceptual approval with the final details to be worked out at the staff level with regards to the possible removal of the iron gate and its replacement with a wooden door. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

<u>700 Bourbon St:</u> 18-27602-VCGEN; Bob Ellis, applicant; Mc Connell Enterprises Inc, owner; Appeal to retain lamped ceiling fans on second floor gallery and menu boxes on first floor installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 08/27/18. [Notices of Violation sent 04/08/16 & 07/30/18] https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-27602-VCGEN

This item was deferred at the applicant's request prior to the meeting.

<u>706-08 Bourbon St</u>: **18-28298-VCGEN**; Bob Ellis, applicant; 706-08 Bourbon Real Estate LLC, owner; Appeal to retain mechanical lift, ceiling fans, and window displays installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 08/27/18. [Notice of Violation sent 07/31/18] https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-28298-VCGEN

This item was deferred at the applicant's request prior to the meeting.

<u>811 Toulouse St</u>: 18-28486-VCGEN; Bob Ellis, applicant; Willie Mintz, Mintz and Mintz Realty LLC, owner; Proposal to retain awning installed on Dauphine side of building without benefit of VCC review or approval, per application received 08/31/18.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=775002

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Ms. Gates present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for deferral in order for the applicant to explore different flashing designs. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

With no business left to discuss, Mr. Musso moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at approximately 3:06 PM.