

VIEUX CARRE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

LaToya Cantrell
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Bryan Block
DIRECTOR

Architectural Committee meeting of **Tuesday, September 25, 2018**

Committee Members Present: Rick Fifield, Daniel Taylor

Committee Members Absent: Dennis Brady, Nick Musso

Staff Present: Rene Bourgogne, Architectural Historian; Erin Vogt, Plans Examiner;
Nick Albrecht, Plans Examiner

Staff Absent: Bryan Block, Director
Tony Whitfield, Inspector
Marguerite Roberts, Inspector

Others Present:

AGENDA

Old Business

512 Conti & 516 Conti St: 16-24076-VCGEN & 16-24074-VCGEN; Walter J. Baudier, III, applicant; 512 Conti LLC, owner; Review of proposed work in center and rear courtyards, including installation of a new pool, per application & materials received 07/22/16 & 09/17/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=16-24074-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Baudier present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for conceptual approval consistent with the staff report provided the applicant furnish more information on the property line wall footings, the pool was moved slightly as it is currently too close to the wall and that the lighting proposal was revised. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

829 Dumaine St: 17-33284-VCGEN; Alex Tefel, applicant; Jeanne Poorman Revocable Trust The, Jeanne Poorman Revocable Trust The, owner; Proposal to install Boral bevel siding in lieu of natural wood weatherboards, per application & materials received 09/28/17 & 09/17/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-33284-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Tefel present on behalf of the application. After much discussion Mr. Taylor stated that he was hesitant to allow the use of Boral bevel siding when the historically correct materials were currently still available. Mr. Block asked the committee if perhaps the rear building could be used as a test case. Mr. Fifield moved for deferral in order for the applicant to provide addresses where the Boral siding had been used and for the staff to inspect the locations. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

310 Chartres St: 18-11097-VCGEN; Dennis Fos, applicant; Chsp French Quarter LLC, owner; Proposal to replace non-operable first floor doors with new French doors, per application & materials received 04/06/18 & 09/04/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-11097-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Fos present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for conceptual approval with the caveats presented in the staff report as follows:

- The applicant work with staff to refine the millwork drawings to staff's satisfaction, and provide shop drawings prior to final approval and permit,
- That information on the dimensions of the air curtain be provided to verify its size.

Mr. Taylor seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

1026 St Louis St: 18-17211-VCGEN; Andrea Hendrickson, applicant; John W Stubbs, owner; Proposal to relocate hood vent exhaust from previously approved location, per application & materials received 05/22/18 & 09/17/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=762970>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Trahan and Ms. Hendrickson present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield concurred with the staff report and moved to approve the relocation of the hood vent with final details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

616 St Peter St: 18-19734-VCGEN; Gabriel Viridure, applicant; Petit Theatre Du Vieux Carre Le, 616 St Peter St LLC, owner; Proposal to install wraparound canopy with cast iron panels over second floor gallery, per application & materials received 06/18/18 & 09/14/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=765484>

Mr. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Trapolin, Mr. Ellis and Ms. Viridure present on behalf of the application. The staff report included information regarding the relationship between the existing gallery columns and the vertical panels of the historic railing. As they significantly differ from what is shown in the historic photographs and proposed elevation drawings, staff was concerned that the proposal should be modified before approval. Is it the intention of the applicant that the gallery poles be moved to align with the panels of the rail, or vice versa? After much discussion regarding the location of the new columns and how they would attach to the existing rail, Mr. Trapolin agreed that he and his team would go back and verify all location on the Chartres Street elevation to make sure that the drawings reflected all the correct locations. Mr. Fifield stated that the historic rail was the most precious part of the entire proposal and how the new pieces would attach was really the main cause for deferral. He further stated that he would have no problem with Aeratis decking at this location. Mr. Trapolin reiterated for clarity that the committee was ok with the decking and roof consistent with the drawings, but that he needed to come back with the rail and columns. Mr. Fifield responded yes. Mr. Fifield moved for deferral of the rails and columns. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

830 Conti St: 18-31055-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; Conti Hotel Investors Prince, owner; Proposal to replace existing steel windows with new double paned aluminum windows, per application & materials received 07/09/18 & 09/07/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=768278>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Williams and Winkert present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield questioned the applicant's decision to replace the windows with modern ones that do not accurately replicate the historic despite having agreeing to do so at the previous AC meeting. Mr. Winkert stated that historic steel widows were falling apart, buckling and leaking very badly. Mr. Fifield asked if there was a manufactured alternative that would exactly match the existing widows. He stated that he wanted to see the same window, not a replacement window such as presented that is a poor facsimile. The AC agreed that the current condition of the windows is a detriment to the integrity of the building but the proposed windows are not appropriate as new steel windows that would match are available.

Mr. Fifield moved to defer the application in order for the applicant to restudy the proposal and return with a widow that exactly matched the existing window. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

928 St Ann St: 18-28545-VCGEN; Gunner Guidry, applicant; Aura LLC, owner; Proposal to install new balcony awning, cornice, swimming pool, and mechanical equipment, and to stucco exposed masonry walls, per application & materials received 08/28/18 & 09/17/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-28545-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Guidry present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield noted that the balcony awning should include a gutter. Mr. Guidry expressed concern regarding the awning structure. Mr. Fifield recommended transitioning from a steel outrigger to a welded rod on the interior. He added that he was concerned that a wood cornice would warp and distort and that it is typically a stucco detail. Addressing the alcove, Mr. Fifield stated that the columns must be the focus and the gate should not distract or obscure them.

Regarding the vehicular gate, Mr. Fifield stated that a backing would not be found approvable. Mr. Guidry responded to the staff report, commenting that the proposed height is the same as the existing gate that will be replaced.

Mr. Fifield asked if a parge coat would be an acceptable compromise. Mr. Guidry responded that his mason, Theodore Pierre, said that stucco would be best to preserve the soft brick. Mr. Fifield asked for a complete masonry survey, keying the elevation to photographs. Mr. Taylor added that he would need additional persuasion before agreeing to stucco the building. Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application to allow for the applicant to respond to Committee comment. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

New Business

819 St Louis St: 18-29191-VCGEN; Harvey Burns, applicant; Patricia M Armand, owner; Proposal to renovate building including the demolition and reconstruction of exterior wood stairs and the addition of a new iron gate at the base of the stairs, per application & materials received 09/04/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=775040>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Patin and Mr. Spaulding present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield asked what the precedent is for the guardrail design. Mr. Patin stated that the guardrails were existing at the balcony level. Mr. Fifield stated that he did not find the existing guardrail detail something to be replicated and that he would like to see a simplified detail where there will be new guardrails.

Mr. Fifield moved for conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1201 Decatur St: 18-29715-VCGEN; 1201 Decatur St: Joshua Noland, applicant; Vieux Telegraphe LLC, owner; Proposal to replace existing windows on the second floor of the Governor Nichols elevation with new French doors, per application & materials received 09/08/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=776062>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Noland present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield asked the applicant if he actually knew if French doors had existed at this location. Mr. Taylor stated that the applicant needed to provide evidence of their previous existence to the committee in order for them to consider the proposed alteration, as per the design guidelines and standard preservation best practices.

Mr. Fifield moved for a deferral in order for the applicant to provide evidence and develop drawings in support of the proposed change from windows to French doors on the second floor. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

534 St Louis St: 18-29672-VCGEN; Kristen Bailey, applicant; 534 St Louis Partners, owner; Proposal to install flagpole hardware and flower baskets on gallery rail, per application & materials received 09/11/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-29672-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Ms. Bailey and Mr. Lingnest present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for approval of the planters concurrent with the staff report. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

525 Madison St: 18-31132-VCGEN; Michael Reid, applicant; Walter H Cochran, owner; Proposal to modify and install new metal security bars outside first floor windows and review of proposed parapet flashing details, per application & materials received 09/18/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=776992>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Reid present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield stated that there was something interesting with the bars piercing the raw material of the masonry and that you lose that sense of detail if it becomes a framed element. Mr. Fifield stated that he would like to see a detail of the existing attachment to the building and the proposed change. In reference to the ridge tiles, Mr. Taylor stated that he tends to prefer the terra cotta tiles.

Mr. Fifield moved for deferral in order for the applicant to work with staff to provide details on the bars, ridge caps and flashing details and to return to the Committee. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Appeals and Violations

522 Chartres St: 17-17790-VCGEN; Greg Eckert, applicant; Supreme Court Parking LLC, owner; Proposal to install bollards in parking area to prevent vehicular damage to masonry walls, per application & materials received 05/23/17 & 09/17/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-17790-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Marquette present on behalf of the application. After much discussion regarding the bollard placement, Mr. Marquette asked the committee to defer the application so that his team could revise the 18" versus the 9" bollard and in order to consult his engineer and have him present in the meeting. Mr. Fifield moved for deferral consistent with the applicant's request. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

208 Chartres St: 17-41983-VCGEN; Richard Abadisians, applicant; M & R Group LLC, owner; Proposal to remove and replace rear dormer installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 12/12/17 & 09/18/18, respectively. **[Notice of Violation sent 10/24/17]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-41983-VCGEN>

Mr. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Abadisians present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for conceptual approval of the proposed new dormer concurrent with the staff report with the details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

816 Orleans Ave: 18-25691-VCGEN; Erika Gates, applicant; 816 Orleans LLC, owner; Proposal to modify the Orleans elevation gable of the main building, previously modified without benefit of VCC review or approval, per application & materials received 08/02/18 & 09/18/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=771521>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Ms. Gates present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield stated that the submitted drawings did not explain to the Committee how the new widow would be installed in the gable on the front elevation. Mr. Fifield continued that the possibility of recessing the wall and putting the louvers back in their previously existing plane may be the best solution. Mr. Taylor stated that he need to see a section drawing of the proposed design.

Mr. Taylor moved to defer the application in order for the applicant to provide the necessary details. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

700 Bourbon St: 18-27602-VCGEN; Bob Ellis, applicant; Mc Connell Enterprises Inc, owner; Appeal to retain lamped ceiling fans on second floor gallery and menu boxes on first floor installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 08/27/18. **[Notices of Violation sent 04/08/16 & 07/30/18]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-27602-VCGEN>

This item was deferred at the applicant's request prior to the meeting.

706-08 Bourbon St: 18-28298-VCGEN; Bob Ellis, applicant; 706-08 Bourbon Real Estate LLC, owner; Appeal to retain mechanical lift and ceiling fans installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 08/27/18. **[Notice of Violation sent 07/31/18]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-28298-VCGEN>

This item was deferred at the applicant's request prior to the meeting.

828 Toulouse St: 18-29201-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; 828 Toulouse Street LLC, owner; Proposal to retain and modify six (6) balconies constructed without benefit of VCC review or approval, to modify railings and add structural supports at other existing balconies, to install exterior lighting and uplighting, and to modify previously approved plans, per application & materials received 09/04/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=775135>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Winkert present on behalf of the application. Mr. Taylor stated that overall he concurs with the staff report and that some of the balconies will need to be eliminated. The staff report noted the following items in need of additional review or revisions:

- The missing shutter on the Dauphine elevation 538 Dauphine
- The structural needs of the balcony at 538 Dauphine
- The proposed methods of increasing the various guardrails
- Revisions to the lighting as noted
- Revisions to the balcony proposals as noted

Mr. Taylor continued that he thought building upon the height of the existing rails may be appropriate in this instance in order to bring the rails up to code.

Mr. Winkert stated that the proposed lighting design sought to place fixtures between the window and door openings to reduce the amount of light entering the hotel rooms. Mr. Taylor stated that he found that aspect of the proposal approvable.

Mr. Fifield recommended looking at the possibility of a bifold shutter in the location where one shutter is missing. Mr. Taylor stated that an alternative may be to restudy the millwork of that opening and remove the shutters entirely.

Mr. Fifield stated that he would like to see the balcony brace details including how the braces attach to the building and outriggers.

Mr. Fifield moved for a deferral consistent with the staff report. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

91 French Market Pl: 18-30267-VCGEN; MiamiNola Enterprises LLC, applicant; James & Richard Realty, owner; Proposal to retain work completed in deviation of approved permit including stain on exterior doors and trim in lieu of approved paint, per application & materials received 09/12/18.

This item was deferred as there was no one present on behalf of the application.

With no business left to discuss, Mr. Fifield moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at approximately 3:06 PM.