

VIEUX CARRE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

LaToya Cantrell
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Bryan Block
DIRECTOR

Architectural Committee meeting of **Tuesday, January 15, 2019**

Committee Members Present: Rick Fifield, Daniel Taylor, Nick Musso

Committee Members Absent: Dennis Brady

Staff Present: Bryan Block, Director; Rene Bourgogne, Architectural Historian; Nick Albrecht, Plans Examiner; Erin Vogt, Plans Examiner;

Staff Absent: Tony Whitfield, Inspector; Marguerite Roberts, Inspector

Others Present: Bev Falk, Bridget Balentine, Susan Gillibrand, Claudio Hemb, Mariane Houssen, Lacey Wotring, Dixon Jelich, Kathleen Edmundson, Kristine Shull, Shea Trahan, Andrea Hendrickson, Bob Edmundson, Paul Richard Jr., Erin Holmes, Andrew Doss, Mary Hewes, Bob Ellis, Katherine Harmon, Sydney Perez, Ross Karson, Erika Gates, Donald Maginnis, Charles Dwyer, Jennifer Johnson

AGENDA

Old Business

211 & 217 Royal St: 17-22503-VCGEN; John Guarnieri, applicant; Royal Condominium Developments LLC, owner; Proposal to install new galleries on both buildings, per application & materials received 06/28/17 & 12/20/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-22503-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Guarnieri present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved to concur with staff for the **approval** of the construction documents, with revisions to be submitted per staff and Committee provisos, with the lighting to be worked out at the staff level. He further stated that the ceiling of the gallery should not be painted a stark white color. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

808 Royal St: 16-02803-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; N I C E Investments LLC, owner; Proposal to construct new four story building, per application and materials received 06/09/15 & 12/14/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=573243>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for **deferral** in order for the applicant to consider both staff and the Committee's comments particularly with regards to the rollup door. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

1005-09 St. Philip Street: 18-01001-VCGEN; John C. Williams, applicant; Balentine Carbondale Holdings LLC, owner; Proposal to add a second floor to the rear kitchen building, per application & materials received 01/22/18 & 01/09/19, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-01001-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. After the staff report, the committee heard the following comments from the public:

- Kathleen Edmondson: She stated that she lives directly across the street and finds the proposed new construction to be in keeping with building types and proportions found within the neighborhood. She agreed that this would be an improvement over the view she currently has of a blank brick wall in that location.
 - Bob Edmondson: He stated that he also lives directly across the street and agrees with the comments made by Mrs. Edmondson.
 - Jeff Collins: Owns the building behind this site which comprises the brick wall mentioned above. He was concerned that the proposed new construction would be physically attached to his brick wall and that the construction process would be overly disruptive and intrusive. Lacey Wotring, representing the project architect, stated that the proposed new construction would not be mounted on the historic brick
-

wall but would be supported by steel beams. She further stated that a survey shows this to be a party wall with the property line going through the middle of it.

- Nikki Szalwinski: She stated that as the kitchen building in question was potentially at least partially built by a named free person of color, the building could be considered to be historically significant and should not, therefore, be modified as proposed. It is her opinion that the construction of a second floor would alter the building to such a degree that this should not be considered to be adaptive reuse. She is further concerned that this potentially is in deviation of the 3'-0" building setback requirement of the CZO.

Mr. Fifield agrees with the staff report regarding the gallery in that this is atypical for a rear yard dependency. A balcony would be more appropriate for this location. This would then allow the massing of the second story to be further reduced.

Mr. Musso stated that the proposed modification would dominate the site, particularly due to the height as currently shown. He agreed that a second floor could potentially be added to the building but does not find the current design yet appropriate. Mr. Taylor found the deep gallery to be awkward in that it radically changes the scale of the building.

M. Fifield addressed the concerns of the public regarding proposed modifications to historic buildings within the Vieux Carré expressing the fact that this is, and has always been, a dynamic neighborhood. These kinds of modifications are challenging to do successfully which is why the design guidelines have been thoughtfully and carefully written. The current kitchen building is a hybrid of historic and contemporary and should not be considered to be of great historic or architectural significance. The committee and VCC staff take these types of proposals very seriously and responds to them carefully understanding the difficulty of approving this kind of intervention. The property owners have shown a willingness to respond to previous AC comments by reducing the scale of the proposed addition.

He recommended showing how this new construction would relate to the adjacent historic brick wall. Mr. Musso further reiterated his objection to the scale of the current proposal and recommended a lower roof pitch.

Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the matter so the architect could respond to these comments. Mr. Musso seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

111 Iberville St: 16-188424-VCCGEN; John Williams, applicant; Badine Land Ltd, owner; Proposal to modify previously approved plans including changes to openings, per materials received 12/12/2018 & 01/08/19, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=589575>

Mr. Block read the staff report with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. At that time the AC was comfortable with the changes to the penthouse fenestration as presented and moved for **conceptual approval** with the details to be worked out with the staff. This should proceed to the VCC for approval. The motion passed unanimously.

New Business

626 Bourbon St: 17-06727-VCGEN; John C Williams, applicant; Grace T Granger LLC, owner; Appeal to revise permitted renovation drawings, including converting the existing front balcony to a gallery and infilling rear window openings, per application & materials received 02/24/17 & 01/08/19, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=17-06727-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Ms. Wotring and Ms. Haussen present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that the proportions for a wooden gallery would be atypical and that steel would be preferable, as proposed. Mr. Fifield stated that he did not consider the building to have historic integrity any longer, and that he did not agree with any of the changes to the already extensively modified building, making it difficult to review the building in historic context.

Mr. Musso moved to **conceptually approve** the gallery, but not the window infill. Mr. Fifield proposed to amend the motion to **deny** the window infill and require completion as previously approved. Mr. Musso accepted the amendment and Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. Mr. Musso informed the applicant

that the window denial could be appealed to the Commission.

512 - 516 Dauphine St: 18-34435-VCGEN; Paul Richard, applicant; Paul R Jr Richard, owner; Proposal to convert existing attic access door to new casement window on the St. Louis elevation of the main building and proposal to add new casement window to the Toulouse elevation of the main building, per application & materials received 12/07/18 & 12/31/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=787080>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Richard present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved to adopt the staff report of **conceptual approval** of the modified and new window openings with applicant to return with a modified proposal that featured wood double hung windows with section details and the addition of shutters. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

620 Decatur St: 18-40737-VCGEN; Mike Treadway, applicant; Wwtj LLC, Lawrence Allan Schlaw, Louisiana CVS Pharmacy LLC, Ms Jane Ann's Quarter Quarters LLC, Jph-One LLC, George L Jones Trust, Peter S Escamilla, Michael D Krochak, Friday Properties New Orleans LLC, Syed N Abbas, Roy Investments Properties LLC, New Jax Commercial LLC, Lori B Prudhomme, 820 Decatur LLC, Jph-Two LLC, William S Everitt, Jmr River Vieux 526 LLC, 416 Bourbon St LLC, Roy Investment Properties LLC, Randall Morris, Jph-One LLC, Hugo Enrique Biedermann Montaner, Hugo Enrique Biedermann Montaner, The Spruce Pine Trust, Walker S Kimball, Bosco Enterprises LLC, Jaxson Group Nola LLC, DMK Group Three LLC, Micheal D Krochak, Rachael C Kinberger, Iberia Tigers LLC, The Spruce Pine Trust, Charles F Post, Thomas J Ward, Nenesplace LLC, owner;

Proposal to install upright fixtures above three (3) existing canopies on the St. Peter elevation and three (3) existing canopies on the Decatur St. elevation, per application & materials received 12/14/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=787885>

The item was **deferred** as there was no one present on behalf of the application.

1026 St Louis St: 18-41894-VCGEN; Andrea Hendrickson, applicant; John W Stubbs, owner;

Proposal to modify previously approved plans including modifying exterior vent pipes, increasing the size of the mechanical platform, and relocating the alleyway gate, per application & materials received 12/28/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=788908>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Trahan and Ms. Hendrickson present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved to adopt the staff recommendation to **approve** the mechanical modifications but to not allow any visible piping. Mr. Musso seconded the motion but reiterated that the applicant needed to reconsider the pump. The motion passed unanimously.

521 Dumaine St: 19-00484-VCPNT; Sydney Perez, applicant; Bopp Enterprises#1 LLC, owner; Proposal to replace existing wood balcony decking on the Dumaine elevation with new Aeratis decking, per application & materials received 01/07/19 & 01/08/19, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Ms. Perez present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved to **approve** the synthetic decking, only if it would be painted, with the applicant to work with staff on the purlin design. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

308 N Rampart St: 19-00789-VCGEN; L. Katherine Harmon, applicant; 1025 Bienville LLC, owner; Proposal to modify previously approved plans including joining existing French doors together to form a single leaf for accessibility purposes, per application & materials received 01/08/19.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=789858>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Ms. Harmon present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved to concur with the staff recommendation of **conceptual approval** with the applicant to work with staff on the appropriate hardware. He also asked for staff to inspect the doors to make sure the historic door was retained and modified correctly. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Appeals and Violations

831 Dauphine St: 18-13486-VCGEN; Donald Maginnis, applicant/owner; Appeal to maintain copper cap flashing and electrical conduits, per application & materials received 04/23/18. **[Notice of Violation sent 02/01/18]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-13486-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Maginnis present on behalf of the application. Mr. Maginnis responded to the staff report, stating that the work in response to demolition by neglect violation was complete except for painting. Mr. Musso disagreed, pointing out the hanging and loose wiring, significant stucco cracks, and vegetation remaining on the building. Mr. Maginnis stated that those items would be rectified. Mr. Fifield and Mr. Musso voiced concerns with the cap flashing, particularly that it appeared loose and could become airborne in a storm or allow water intrusion through the parapet. Mr. Maginnis explained a proposal to remove the cap flashing at the end of the parapets.

Mr. Fifield moved for a **deferral** for 30 days in order for Mr. Maginnis to modify the “boot” design, and take them off with staff present for inspection. Mr. Musso seconded the motion which passed unanimously.

700 Bourbon St: 18-27602-VCGEN; Bob Ellis, applicant; Mc Connell Enterprises Inc, owner; Appeal to retain lamped ceiling fans on second floor gallery and menu boxes on first floor installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 08/27/18. **[Notices of Violation sent 04/08/16 & 07/30/18]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-27602-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Ellis present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for a **deferral** in order for the applicant to work out the lighting and menu boxes at staff level. Mr. Musso seconded the motion.

706-08 Bourbon St: 18-28298-VCGEN; Bob Ellis, applicant; 706-08 Bourbon Real Estate LLC, owner; Appeal to retain lamped ceiling fans installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 08/27/18. **[Notice of Violation sent 07/31/18]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-28298-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Ellis present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for a **deferral** of the application and for it to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Musso amended the motion for the removal of signage. Mr. Fifield agreed. Mr. Musso seconded the amended motion and the motion passed unanimously.

1015 Ursulines Ave: 18-36062-VCGEN; Robertsonroofinginc, applicant; Maurice L Rouen, Jason B Hinkle, owner; Appeal to retain metal chimney cap flashing installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 10/31/18. **[Notice of Violation sent 09/27/18]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-36062-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with a representative from Robertson Roofing present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso moved to approve the retention of the metal chimney caps for 2019 and 2020 and to reexamine in 2021. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

422 Burgundy St: 18-40077-VCGEN; Rita M Satawa, applicant/owner; Proposal to retain condition of entrance stoop demolished without benefit of VCC review or approval, per application & materials received 12/06/18 & 01/08/19, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=787044>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Ms. Satawa present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield motioned for **deferral** with the applicant to work with staff to reestablish the one tread stoop to maintain the historic character of the building and the street. Mr. Musso seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

1114 Burgundy St: 18-40817-VCGEN; 1114 Burgundy St: Charles E Dwyer, applicant; J L Family Trust Of 1984, owner; Proposal to install gas line, gas pool heater, and four (4) gas sconces in courtyard, per application & materials received 12/13/18. **[STOP WORK ORDER posted 11/19/18]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-40817-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Dwyer present on behalf of the application. Mr. Taylor stated that the gas sconces could be approvable but a more contemporary design should be chosen.

Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the proposal to staff level, with the gas line to be buried as much as possible. Mr. Taylor proposed an amendment to the motion, with fixtures to be **conceptually approved** if less decorative. Mr. Fifield accepted the amendment and Mr. Taylor seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

733 Iberville St: 18-38910-VCGEN; Kris Shull, applicant; Cornerstone Tapestry LLC, owner; Proposal to remove fresh air intake installed on front elevation without benefit of VCC review and approval and to install new air intake on rear courtyard infill roof, per application & materials received 11/28/18 & 01/03/19, respectively. **[Notice of Violation sent 09/19/18]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-38910-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Ms. Shull present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for **conceptual approval** concurrent with the staff report with additional information to be provided for final review and approval by the Committee. Mr. Taylor seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

1016 St Ann St: 18-40465-VCGEN; Andrew Doss, applicant; Katherine C Doss, owner; Appeal to retain work without VCC review and approval, including the installation of an asphalt shingle roof on rear addition and modifications to rear gable windows, and proposal to install new keypads on front entry doors, per application & materials received 12/11/18. **[Notice of Violation sent 10/22/18]**

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Redirect.aspx?SearchString=18-40465-VCGEN>

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Doss present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield moved for a **deferral** for 12 months for the HVAC, the chimney caps and the roof at which time the applicant would return with a comprehensive plan. He further moved to **defer** the windows and lockset, which might be handled at staff, and for the immediate removal of the satellite dish. Mr. Doss stated that there would be financial hardship as the insurance had already paid out. Mr. Taylor stated that the applicant had 12 months and that he should follow up with the roofer. Mr. Fifield stated that the applicant could appeal to the full Commission and defined said hardship. Mr. Taylor seconded the original motion and the motion passed unanimously.
