

VIEUX CARRÉ ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

City of New Orleans

Notice of Public Meeting

NOTE: The below minutes are in draft form and are a summary of actions taken. They are not a verbatim transcription of the meeting.

Minutes of the VCC Architectural Committee meeting of Tuesday, January 28 2020 – 1:30 pm.

Committee Members Present: Rick Fifield, Toni DiMaggio, Stephen Bergeron

Staff Present: Bryan Block, Director; Erin Vogt, Senior Building Plans Examiner; Renée Bourgogne, Senior Architectural Historian; Marguerite Roberts, Inspector;

Staff Absent: Anthony Whitfield, Inspector; Nicholas Albrecht, Senior Building Plans Examiner

Others Present: Erika Gates, Mark Heck, Juan Carlos Lara, Jesse Stephenson, Mike Murray, Jonathan House, Jeffrey Stolier, Jimmy Boulanger, Subia Weber, Brook Tesler, Whitney Mahl, Nikki Szalwinski, Abdul Siddiqui, L. Katherine Harmon, Samantha Johnson, Kristine Kobila, Jennifer Snape, Claus Sadlier, Nicholas Musso

AGENDA

Old Business

1236 N. Rampart St.: 19-06343-VCGEN & 19-06285-VCGEN: Rick A. Fifield, applicant; 1236 N Rampart, LLC, owner; Proposal to modify landscaping throughout the site, per materials received 01/15/2020.

[1236 N. Rampart was moved to the end of Old Business to allow for the applicants to arrive. Mr. Fifield recused himself prior to the presentation of the staff report, and did not return to the hearing until after the motion and vote were complete.]

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Messrs. Murray and Doyle and Ms. Snape present on behalf of the application. Ms. DiMaggio noted the complexity of the site and stated that a passive stormwater management system usually has more long-term success and requires less maintenance, so she found the proposal to be very successful. Mr. Murray agreed, stating that the proposal would avoid any excavation on the site. Mr. Bergeron moved to **conceptually approve** the landscaping plan, with samples to be submitted for final review prior to permit approval. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

827 Ursulines St.: John Williams Architects, applicant; Claus E Sadlier, owner;

Proposal to renovate building, including rebuilding rear addition and installing new mechanical equipment, per application & materials received 11/26/19 & 01/21/2020, respectively.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Mr. Lara present on behalf of the application. Ms. DiMaggio stated that she appreciated the revisions and found them very successful. She moved to **conceptually approve** the proposed work, consistent with staff recommendations, with the applicant to return to the Committee for construction document review prior to permit. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

715-19 Bourbon St.: John Williams Architects, applicant; 715-17-19 Bourbon Street LLC;

Proposal to demolish existing stoops and lower door sills by 18", per application & materials received 10/08/19 & 01/21/2020, respectively.

Mr. Block presented the staff report with Messrs. Heck and Siddiqui present on behalf of the application. The applicant requested a deferral in order to explore other alternatives and further discuss the issues with his client. Ms. DiMaggio moved for a deferral. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

616 Conti St.:19-36250-VCGEN: Terri Dreyer, applicant; Conti Street Holding, LLC, owner;

Proposal to renovate building, including modifications to rear service ell, addition of outdoor dining patio, and mechanical equipment, in conjunction with a **change of use** from *vacant* to *commercial (restaurant)*, per application & materials received 11/11/19 & 01/21/2020, respectively.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Ms. Johnson and Ms. Kobilá present on behalf of the application. Ms. Johnson stated that the interior demolition is ongoing and that interior conditions, particularly at the service ell, were not what was previously thought and that raising the roof height would not be necessary. She stated that she would discuss the inline exhaust and scrubber with the engineer. She was not optimistic that the roof hatch could be relocated given the existing conditions and noted that the exhaust fan may need to penetrate the roof of the main building. Regarding the millwork on the rear of the main building, she stated that they were requesting a metal window for maintenance purposes and that all of the millwork would require replacement. She agreed to remove the glass rail from the proposal and return to the conceptually approved proposed rail addition, but noted that it may have to be set back in response to SHPO review. Ms. Vogt noted that the VCC staff frequently works well with SHPO and that any conflicts in direction are usually resolved. Ms. Johnson stated that she would work with staff to review the first floor millwork and that an exterior lighting plan is being developed.

Mr. Fifield noted that the property had been subject to a significant amount of illegal work, but that the main building is intact for the most part. He encouraged the applicant to faithfully restore the historic building, restricting any modifications due to the change of use to the contemporary portions of the building wherever possible. Ms. Kobilá noted that options for mechanical are limited due to interior conditions with ductwork; Mr. Fifield stated that switching to an inline exhaust system may remove that issue.

Mr. Block asked how visible the roof is from surrounding properties. Ms. Vogt responded that the visibility is prevalent from taller buildings in the upper Quarter. Mr. Fifield noted that the proposed screening is very contemporary in design, and that the applicant should study the site lines to establish whether or not the screening would be effective.

Mr. Jeff Stolier addressed the Committee, stating that he was the contractor and asking if a permit could be issued for work to begin on any exterior items. Ms. Vogt responded that the applicant was planning on submitting a separate application for staff approvable work, and that a permit would be issued as soon as staff received the proposal.

Ms. DiMaggio moved to **defer** the application to allow the applicant to respond to comment and submit revisions. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

208-212 Bourbon St.: City Wide Construction, applicant; 210 Bourbon, LLC, owner;
Proposal to replace wood gallery decking with Aeratis synthetic decking, per application & materials received 12/20/2019.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with no one present on behalf of the application. Mr. Bergeron asked how recently the decking had been replaced. Ms. Vogt answered that she believed it had been within the last five years, but that none of the gallery elements were historic fabric since the gallery was restored in the 1980s. Ms. DiMaggio stated that the gallery does not meet typical guidelines for synthetic decking since it is covered, but noted that the existing spacing of the purlins would allow for the decking to be changed back to wood at a later date without any significant alterations. Ms. Vogt noted that the Committee has taken use and high traffic into account for other buildings within the VCE overlay district, so approval at this property would not be unprecedented.

Mr. Bergeron moved to **approve** the installation of the decking with the provisos as noted in the staff report. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

918 St. Peter: L. Katherine Harmon, applicant; Antonio Carbone, owner;
Proposal to add and modify pedestrian alley gates, per materials received 01/21/2020.

Mr. Block presented the staff report with Ms. Harmon present on behalf of the application. Ms. DiMaggio moved for **conceptual approval** with all details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

922 St. Peter St.: L. Katherine Harmon, applicant; Paul Verrette, owner;
Proposal to add and modify vehicular gates, per materials received 01/21/2020.

Mr. Block presented the staff report with Ms. Harmon present on behalf of the application. Ms. DiMaggio moved for **conceptual approval** with all details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

New Business

1025 Orleans St: Arthur Roger, III, applicant; Arthur Roger, III, owner;

Proposal to remove deteriorated wood siding and leave underlying brick-between-posts construction exposed, per application & materials received 01/07/2020.

The application was withdrawn at the applicant's request prior to the hearing. Ms. DiMaggio moved to remove the item from the agenda. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

537-41 Chartres, 602 Toulouse St: Jonathan House, applicant; Kemper and Laila Williams Foundation, owner;

Proposal to replace existing door hardware with new lever keypad, per application & materials received 01/07/2020.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Mr. House present on behalf of the application. Mr. House stated that the touchscreen does not display numbers unless it detects motion and that the fixture had been selected because it did not have exposed buttons. He explained that his client wanted a keypad instead of a traditional lockset because it was easier to change a keypad combination instead of getting locks changed if there were any security concerns. He added that the selected keypad only required drilling one hole in the door and was less invasive than other hardware.

Mr. Fifield asked if there were any comments from the public. Mr. Nicholas Musso addressed the Committee, voicing concerns that allowing use of keypads at retail businesses would set a dangerous precedent and that the VCC may see loss of historic hardware as a result. Mr. Fifield noted that the existing doors and hardware are not historic but agreed with the concerns regarding installation of keypads at retail use.

Mr. House stated that he could investigate hardware that had a separate touchscreen and deadbolt to be used with a thumb latch handle. Mr. Fifield encouraged the applicant to look into a traditional commercial lockset as well. Mr. Bergeron moved to **defer** the application for the applicant to explore other options. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

727 Toulouse St: Erika Gates, applicant; 727 Toulouse, LLC, owner;

Proposal to install new keypad at front entry door, per application & materials received 01/14/2020.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Ms. Gates present on behalf of the application. Ms. Gates stated that the owner wished to switch from an interior manual release system to a keypad to admit guests. She agreed to explore alternatives to the hardware and asked that it be handled at staff level. Ms. Vogt stated that she was comfortable reviewing it at staff level and had intended to recommend that, instead of it returning to the Committee. Mr. Bergeron moved to **conceptually approve** new hardware in this location, consistent with staff recommendations and provisos noted above, to be completed at staff level. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1127 Dauphine St.: Larry Bagneris, applicant; George J Azar, III, Lawrence G Bagneris, Jr, James Carinder, Carla J Dugas, Edward B Fabacher, Jr, Peyton R Hall, Paul C Miller, P&K Asset Ventures, LLC, Pat's Properties, LLC, Stephen J Smith, Aaron Swanson, Sonja T Vehorn, owner;

Proposal to install new metal fence at front property line, per application & materials received 01/21/2020.

Mr. Block presented the staff report at the applicant's request with no representation on behalf of the application. After some discussion regarding detailing, Ms. DiMaggio moved to **conceptually approve** the new fence with details to be worked out at staff level. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

Appeals and Violations

220-22 Bourbon St.: L. Katherine Harmon, applicant; 220-222 Bourbon Street, LLC, owner;

Appeal to retain metal cap flashing and dormer trim installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 12/29/2019.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Ms. Harmon present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield stated that it is important to maintain accurate historic detail even if the original historic fabric deteriorates and requires replacement.

Ms. Vogt noted that, due to the cyber-attack, it could not be determined if the existing dormer sashes are prescribed; staff will do additional research and may cite the sashes as a violation once digital resources become accessible. She encouraged the applicant to replace them, whether or not they are found to be in violation, as they are not appropriate for the building.

Ms. DiMaggio moved to **deny** the retention of the inappropriate dormer trim. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. The applicant was informed of their right to appeal to the Commission within thirty days.

821 Barracks St.: 19-16910-VCGEN: Jimmy Boulanger, applicant; Crescent City Boys, LLC, owner;
Appeal to retain gutter and downspout installed on gallery awning in deviation from approved plans permitted by VCC on 09/25/2019.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Mr. Boulanger present on behalf of the application. Mr. Boulanger stated that he had installed a k-style gutter after having difficulty sourcing a half-round gutter, and that he tied into the existing downspouts rather than installing a new one. Mr. Fifield concurred with staff's assessment that it is unnecessary and not historically accurate to tie into the existing downspouts or install new ones. He stated that half round gutters are readily available from sheet metal suppliers. He asked the applicant if he was willing to work with staff or if he would prefer a denial to appeal to the Commission. Mr. Boulanger stated that he would be willing to meet with staff so they could explain how the drainage should be completed.

Ms. DiMaggio moved to **defer** the appeal for resolution at staff level. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

409 Bourbon St.: Sharon Bourn, applicant; Nova Aurelia Holdings, LLC, owner;
Proposal to add two (2) new steel outriggers and to remove angle brackets installed without benefit of VCC review or approval, per application & materials received 01/17/2020.

Mr. Block presented the staff report with Mr. Musso present on behalf of the application. Ms. DiMaggio moved for **conceptual approval** with all details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

1128 Decatur St, 37 French Market.: Subia Weber, applicant; Justin Phillipott, owner;
Appeal to retain keypad door hardware installed without benefit of VCC review or approval, per materials received 01/14/2020.

Mr. Block presented the staff report with Ms. Weber present on behalf of the application. Ms. DiMaggio moved for a **90 day deferral** of the application. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

With no items left to discuss, Mr. Bergeron moved to adjourn the meeting at approximately 3:20 pm. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

Next AC date: Tuesday, February 11, 2020

Upon request, a sign language interpreter for the hearing impaired will be available at the meeting. To place a request for sign language interpreter services, please call **TTY at (504) 658-2059 or 1-800-981-6652**.