# VIEUX CARRE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

LaToya Cantrell MAYOR CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

#### Architectural Committee meeting of Tuesday, August 10, 2021.

# NOTE: The below minutes are in draft form and are a summary of actions taken. They are not a verbatim transcription of the meeting.

Committee Members Present:	Rick Fifield, Toni DiMaggio, Stephen Bergeron
Staff Present:	Bryan Block, Director; Renée Bourgogne, Deputy Director; Nick Albrecht, Senior Building Plans Examiner; Erin Vogt, Senior Building Plans Examiner; Marguerite Roberts, Inspector; Tony Whitfield, Inspector
Others Present:	Jeff Collins, Jason Richards, Katherine Harmon, David Carimi, Hank Smith

# **Minutes**

Prior to the start of the meeting, Mr. Block explained the process for a web conference as follows: after the presentation of the staff reports and a period for questions from the Committee members to the applicant and staff, the Committee would take a 30-minute recess to allow for the submittal of public comments via email at VCC@nola.gov. The comments would then be read to the Committee members prior to any motion or vote for each item. There would be a cap on the length of the comments to what could be read within two minutes, and the emails received have been saved as part of the public record.

At approximately 1:00 pm Mr. Fifield called the teleconference to order. Mr. Block called roll and all three Committee members were present, constituting a quorum.

# **New Business**

**1009 Burgundy St: 21-19741-VCGEN;** Jeff Collins, applicant; Jeffery C Collins, owner; Proposal to install a generator in rear courtyard, per application & materials received 07/09/2021 and 07/30/2021, respectively. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=891783

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Collins present on behalf of the application. Mr. Collins stated that the new generator would be at least 3' from the side and 15' from the rear and that it would not be elevated. Mr. Fifield asked the Committee if they had any comments or questions. Mr. Bergeron asked how the generator would be connected to the electrical panel and where that panel was located. Mr. Collins stated that it would be run through the planter, down the alley and the panel was currently located inside the main house. Mr. Fifield asked if there was to be any other switching equipment that would be visible. Mr. Collins stated no, besides the unit itself. He went on to say that as for the sound, the property was right next to the WWL TV studio so the sound shouldn't be a concern as their generator was quite loud. With no other questions or comments, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

**<u>808 Bourbon St</u>: 21-20920-VCGEN**; Loretta Harmon, applicant; 810 Bourbon LLC, owner; Proposal to demolish existing, brown-rated rear addition and construct a new two-story connecting structure, per application & materials received 07/20/2021.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=893177

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Ms. Harmon present on behalf of the application. Ms. Harmon stated that regarding the height, she could maybe spare 9", otherwise it would not be functional. She went on to say that they were also open to more modern materials and that it was to be a single-family home, so they wanted to remove the stair. Mr. Fifield asked if there were any comments or questions from the Committee. Ms. DiMaggio stated that she agreed with the staff report and the proposal was a huge improvement on the current conditions. She went on to say that if the elevation facing the courtyard was more modern and lighter it would help the massing. Lastly, she stated that she believed there were definitely options. Mr. Bergeron stated that he agreed with Ms. DiMaggio. He went on to say that he was unsure how necessary the connecting structure actually was,

and he agreed about the materials. Mr. Fifield stated that he understood why they wanted the connector but that it looked like infill. He went on to say that materials question was an interesting one. Ms. DiMaggio stated that the casement and siding should be abandoned for a more modern take and the rest of the design would likely follow. She went on to say that the stair and lean-to removal were positive enough for her to consider the approach. She then stated that the siding should be a different material and the casement should follow suit.

Mr. Fifield asked about the shutters on the first-floor wall. Ms. DiMaggio stated that she was looking to the Committee for that aspect. She believed that that it would follow suit once the other adjustments were made. Mr. Bergeron stated that he agreed. He went on to say that the materials evoked an accumulation of building over time and that he believed one material would be better. Ms. Harmon stated that owner was now rethinking the proposal. Mr. Fifield asked if he was understanding currently, the owner now wished to just replace the metal stair with wood? Ms. Harmon stated yes that they would turn it ninety-degrees to be parallel. Mr. Fifield stated that he was hesitant to discuss this change without an actual proposal. Mr. Block stated that they would have to defer in order to have time to review any changes. Mr. Fifield asked the Committee if they thought the Committee could vote for a conceptual approval on the massing and size with additional review. Mr. Bergeron stated yes. Mr. Fifield state that he would also like an elevation from the rear side. With nothing else to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

<u>521 Conti St</u>: 21-21302-VCGEN; Carimi David, applicant; Gas & Electic Light Bevolo, owner; Proposal to install new slate roof including the installation of new copper cap flashing on low side parapet wall, per application & materials received 07/26/2021. <u>https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=894714</u>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Carimi present on behalf of the application. Mr. Carimi stated that he agreed with the staff report. Mr. Fifield stated that he believed everything was well documented. He asked the Committee if they had any questions. Mr. Bergeron stated that he agreed with the staff report. Ms. DiMaggio agreed as well. Mr. Fifield asked if they had any questions or comments regarding the chimney. Mr. Bergeron stated that it was hard to know the chimney's condition in the photos, but that there might not be much left. Mr. Fifield agreed. He went on to say that they might just have to wait and see with discovery. Mr. Carimi stated that they were unsure of the chimney condition but would be happy to report back. Mr. Fifield stated "perfect!" With nothing left to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

<u>527 Conti St</u>: 21-21311-VCGEN; Carimi David, applicant; Bevolo Gas & Electric Lights LLC, owner; Proposal to install new slate roof including the installation of new copper cap flashing on low side parapet wall, per application & materials received 07/26/2021. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=894713

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Carimi present on behalf of the application. For clarification Mr. Carimi explained that there was building between 521 and 527 not owned by the same owner, but that 521 and 527 were owned by the same owner. Ms. DiMaggio asked if they needed to be sure the middle owner was ok with this work. Mr. Fifield stated that he would like to think they only dealt with the preservation issues. Ms. Dimaggio agreed and stated that she felt the same way here as she did for the previous application at 521 Conti. Mr. Bergeron agreed. Mr. Carimi state that they would have the owner communicate with the other owner. Mr. Fifield responded "great!" With nothing left to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

<u>942 N Rampart St</u>: 21-21347-VCGEN; West Studio, applicant; 4421 Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate building, including addition of mechanical equipment, alterations to lighting, and installation of awnings over sidewalk, per application & materials received 07/23/2021.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=894396

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Richards present on behalf of the application. With regards to the awnings, Mr. Richards stated that the design intent was to match the existing one on the front but that they would discuss with the owner and explore using a retractable awning. As for the lighting, Mr. Richards stated that the floodlights would be removed. Mr. Fifield asked about staff's concern over the camera position. Mr. Richards stated that if the cameras were at 9' they would conflict, but a retractable awning would address that. Mr. Fifield asked the committee if they had any questions or comments. Mr. Bergeron asked if the existing kitchen exhaust and louvered exhaust were permitted. Ms. Vogt stated that it had been there since at least 1988, so, if it was unpermitted work, it would be considered prescribed. Ms. DiMaggio and Mr. Fifield both took issue

with the triangle shaped gap between the awnings. She asked the applicant why the awnings were this particular length, noting that they seemed arbitrary and not related to architectural elements. Mr. Richards stated that they could pull them away from the corner awning so there was more separation. Regarding the length, he stated that it was to provide cover for sidewalk dining. On the Rampart side, Mr. Richards stated that they were trying to center on the window, on the St Philip side they were just matching the length. Mr. Fifield stated that holding them off the corner would help significantly, but that they were covering half the building and not working with the existing architectural features. He went on to say he wasn't sure how to solve this dilemma, but he believed there might be some accuracy issues with the drawings as well, and he advised the applicant to revise and study the proposal before resubmitting. Mr. Bergeron stated that he wholeheartedly agreed with Mr. Fifield. Ms. DiMaggio agreed as well and went on to say that she appreciated the clarity about working with the existing architectural features. Mr. Richards asked if the awnings should be aligned in the negative space of the parapet where it stepped up. Mr. Fifield replied yes, or the window. Mr. Richards stated that they would verify all lengths. Ms. DiMaggio asked him to also check the window heights. Mr. Fifield asked if there were any other objections. Mr. Bergeron responded no and then asked the applicant to make sure the new cameras would have no "droopy" wiring. With nothing left to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

**<u>208 Bienville St</u>: 21-21645-VCGEN**; David Maise, applicant; 208 Bienville Street Development LLC, owner; Proposal to construct a new three-story gallery with roof overhang on the N. Front elevation of the building, per application & materials received 07/29/2021.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=895078

This item was deferred at the applicant's request prior to the meeting.

# 1022 Dumaine St: 21-21713-VCGEN; Sosa Nicholas, applicant; F B Lutz, owner;

Proposal to replace existing wood tongue and groove balcony decking with new Aeratis synthetic decking, per application & materials received 07/27/2021.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=894894

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report. There was no one present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield asked the Committee if they wished to defer due to a lack of representation. Ms. DiMaggio stated that she agreed with the staff report and that she believed this could be handled at the staff level unless other modifications were required. Mr. Bergeron agreed. With nothing left to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

# **Appeals and Violations**

<u>624 Dumaine St</u>: 19-02566-VCGEN; Paul Duxworth, applicant; Bienville Street Outback LLC, owner; Review of test patch of attempted mortar and brick cleaning, per application & materials received 04/08/19 & 08/06/2021, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=791830

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Smith present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield asked where the test patch was exactly in the photos. He was directed to slide 100-102. Mr. Block stated that it looked like the effort to remove the slurry was further damaging to the brick, so he believed it might be better to leave the slurry on than to remove it. Mr. Fifield asked if the mortar was lime based. Mr. Smith stated yes. He went on to explain that it had also run down from the parapet when that was being repaired so in addition to the smear there was also a drip effect. Mr. Fifield asked the applicant if the Committee was to follow the staff recommendation what did he propose for the rest of the building. Mr. Smith stated that they were going to try and remove the "streaming" mortar from top. Mr. Fifield asked the Committee for their thoughts. Ms. DiMaggio was perplexed. Mr. Fifield stated that this was not just a preservation technology question, but also a viewshed question due the building's proximity to a purple rated structure. Ms. Roberts stated that she had been on site and had photographed numerous empty bags of Quikrete. Mr. Fifield asked Ms. Roberts if she believed that it was likely the material was Portland based. Ms. Roberts stated yes. Mr. Fifield then stated that this fact changed everything. He went on to say that he wondered if they should recommend a paint or stucco treatment. He then asked the applicant if he thought the owner might agree to such a treatment. Ms. DiMaggio state that she was concerned that painting wouldn't be enough, and that stucco was probably the best option. Mr. Fifield stated that stucco would address the damage and might be the best preservation method. Mr. Smith stated that he would ask the owner. Mr. Fifield then stated that this was a very thin line- he would never want to encourage

this behavior. He then asked Mr. Bergeron if he was ok with this approach. Mr. Bergeron agreed and stated that this was a very unfortunate solution but possibly the only option. With nothing else to discuss the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

**<u>214 Chartres St:</u> 21-20097-VCGEN**; 214 Chartres St: David Lenau, applicant; Thomas Joseph Vandeveld And Myrna The, Timmie D Shedd, Larry J Stout, The Sereda Nash Revocable Trust, Sean J Hubar, Wayne F Wandell, owner; Proposal to address demolition by neglect violations and install new decorative lighting and roof hatch, per application & materials received 07/13/2021 and 07/27/2021, respectively. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=892139

Ms. Vogt read the staff report. There was no one present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield asked the Committee if they wished to defer the application. Ms. DiMaggio stated that normally she would prefer to defer with no representation present, but she did not want to hold up the demolition by neglect items. Ms. Vogt stated that she was unsure if they would start on the staff approvable items right away if the permit were split up, or if they would wait until the entire scope was released. Ms. DiMaggio stated that she would like to make a motion to be handled at staff and to only return to the Committee if staff deemed it necessary. Mr. Bergeron agreed. With nothing left to discuss the Committee went into a 30-minute recess for public comment.

At approximately 2:10 PM Ms. DiMaggio made the motion for a 30-minute recess for public comment. Bergeron seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously, and the Committee agreed to reconvene at 2:40PM.

At approximately 2:40PM Mr. Block called the roll. Mr. Bergeron was not present as he had to leave the meeting early. There was a quorum with Mr. Fifield and Ms. DiMaggio present. Mr. Fifield reconvened the meeting.

### **New Business**

**1009 Burgundy St: 21-19741-VCGEN;** Jeff Collins, applicant; Jeffery C Collins, owner; Proposal to install a generator in rear courtyard, per application & materials received 07/09/2021 and 07/30/2021, respectively. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=891783

#### **Public Comment:**

#### **Chad Pellerin**

I am not a paid spokesperson and reside at 819 Orleans Avenue. I would like to comment on the proposed Generac unit being considered in the lovely garden area of this home. Having suffered from an insensitive developer in the distant past, who placed 5 condenser units without any noise buffer overlooking our properties, I became quite sensitive to noise intrusions between properties. Hard feelings with and from the developer resulted. My hope is tha the ARC will ensure that the type of installed generator is within a locale that has sufficient distance from neighbors and has some natural sound buffering. I trust that the potential decibels emanating are not beyond OSHA guidelines that would be required if this were on commercial property. Perhaps some type of filtering device for noise can be considered and placed on this machine, if not already in these plans. Clearly, neighbors that achieve harmony with each other are in the best interest of the VCC. Thank you for letting suggestions be offered from a resident who was forced to endure something that could have easily been avoided.

#### Nikki Szalwinski, French Quarter Citizens

I am traveling today and wasn't able to log in until the discussion was wrapping up so I apologize if these questions have been answered in presentation already:

- 1. Will the generator include a noise insulating housing?
- 2. Is this a natural gas or liquid fuel unit? Or both?
- 3. Does the dB output vary with fuel source and/or load?
- 4. Are regular maintenance cycles necessary and if so how frequent? How long?

I heard something mentioned about the WWL generator which while not terribly loud for us I know it is unbearable for adjacent neighbors who have said that the unit was installed without permit. (I have no verification for this latter part.). Currently we have generators on both sides of us. The one to our Rampart side has an insulating housing and while we can hear it it is reasonable. The one to our river side was so loud last October during the hurricane we could not be outside at all and had to keep the windows and doors closed yet we could still hear it. I measured more than 100 db for the two hours or so it ran. It was so loud it drowned out the WWL generator.

I do believe the Collins are sensitive to courtyard ambiance and will want to minimize the noise disruption. Nikki Szalwinslk

#### **Discussion and Motion:**

Ms. DiMaggio noted that the sound output was comparable to some condensers and she had no major concerns. She was unsure about the maintenance cycle. Mr. Fifield asked the owner to the floor for a response, but he was no longer in attendance.

Ms. DiMaggio made the motion for the conceptual approval of the new generator, with provisos as noted by staff, and requiring compliance with all Safety and Permits requirements. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

#### 808 Bourbon St: 21-20920-VCGEN; Loretta Harmon, applicant; 810 Bourbon LLC, owner;

Proposal to demolish existing, brown-rated rear addition and construct a new two-story connecting structure, per application & materials received 07/20/2021.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=893177

#### **Public Comment:**

There was no public comment.

# **Discussion and Motion:**

Ms. DiMaggio made the motion to defer the application. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

#### 521 Conti St: 21-21302-VCGEN; Carimi David, applicant; Gas & Electic Light Bevolo, owner;

Proposal to install new slate roof including the installation of new copper cap flashing on low side parapet wall, per application & materials received 07/26/2021.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=894714

#### **Public Comment:**

There was no public comment.

#### **Discussion and Motion:**

Ms. DiMaggio made the recommendation for the approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

**527 Conti St:** 21-21311-VCGEN; Carimi David, applicant; Bevolo Gas & Electric Lights LLC, owner; Proposal to install new slate roof including the installation of new copper cap flashing on low side parapet wall, per application & materials received 07/26/2021.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=894713

#### **Public Comment:**

There was no public comment.

#### **Discussion and Motion:**

Ms. DiMaggio made the recommendation for the approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

<u>942 N Rampart St</u>: 21-21347-VCGEN; West Studio, applicant; 4421 Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate building, including addition of mechanical equipment, alterations to lighting, and installation of awnings over sidewalk, per application & materials received 07/23/2021.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=894396

#### **Public Comment:**

I live in the same block as this restaurant and know we all hope to have a nice neighborhood restaurant again. I

am hopeful they can find a way to make teh cameras wok as security is of increasing concern. I do have concerns about awnings and dining tables particularly on the St. Philip elevation as teh sidewalk isn't very wide. Teh last tenant was not very mindful of garbage and residue on teh st. Philip side and I hoe the new restaurant will take this more seriously.

Nikki Szalwinski, FQC

#### **Discussion and Motion:**

Ms. DiMaggio moved to **conceptually approve** the mechanical and lights, **deferring** the awnings and cameras. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

**208 Bienville St**: **21-21645-VCGEN**; David Maise, applicant; 208 Bienville Street Development LLC, owner; Proposal to construct a new three-story gallery with roof overhang on the N. Front elevation of the building, per application & materials received 07/29/2021.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=895078

#### **Public Comment:**

There was no public comment.

#### Discussion and Motion:

Ms. DiMaggio moved to defer the application at the applicant's request. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

#### 1022 Dumaine St: 21-21713-VCGEN; Sosa Nicholas, applicant; F B Lutz, owner;

Proposal to replace existing wood tongue and groove balcony decking with new Aeratis synthetic decking, per application & materials received 07/27/2021.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=894894

#### **Public Comment:**

There was no public comment.

#### **Discussion and Motion:**

Noting that there had not been an applicant present, Ms. DiMaggio moved to approve the proposed synthetic decking provided:

- No modifications to the purlins are needed
- Staff can verify that the existing wood decking is significantly deteriorated and in a condition similar to other balconies that were approved for replacement

Ms. DiMaggio noted that if either of these conditions are not satisfied that the application will need to return to the Committee. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

# **Appeals and Violations**

624 Dumaine St: 19-02566-VCGEN; Paul Duxworth, applicant; Bienville Street Outback LLC, owner;

Review of test patch of attempted mortar and brick cleaning, per application & materials received 04/08/19 & 08/06/2021, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=791830

#### **Public Comment:**

There was no public comment.

**Discussion and Motion:** 

Ms. DiMaggio made the motion to defer the application to the next meeting on August 24, 2021. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

**<u>214 Chartres St:</u> 21-20097-VCGEN**; 214 Chartres St: David Lenau, applicant; Thomas Joseph Vandeveld And Myrna The, Timmie D Shedd, Larry J Stout, The Sereda Nash Revocable Trust, Sean J Hubar, Wayne F Wandell, owner; Proposal to address demolition by neglect violations and install new decorative lighting and roof hatch, per application & materials received 07/13/2021 and 07/27/2021, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=892139

# No Public Comment

# Discussion and Motion:

Ms. DiMaggio moved for **conceptual approval** of the lighting and roof hatch size and location, with the roof hatch to comply with the Design Guidelines. She noted that the application should return to the Committee if the applicant or staff had any disagreement regarding the hatch. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

With no items left to discuss, Mrs. DiMaggio moved to adjourn the meeting at approximately 3:02PM. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Next AC Date: Tuesday, August 24, 2021