VIEUX CARRE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

LaToya Cantrell MAYOR CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Architectural Committee meeting of Tuesday, September 28, 2021.

NOTE: The below minutes are in draft form and are a summary of actions taken. They are not a verbatim transcription of the meeting.

Minutes of the VCC Architectural Committee meeting of Tuesday, September 28, 2021–1:00 pm.

Committee Members Present:	Rick Fifield, Toni DiMaggio, Stephen Bergeron
Staff Present:	Bryan Block, Director; Renée Bourgogne, Deputy Director; Nick Albrecht, Senior Building Plans Examiner; Erin Vogt, Senior Building Plans Examiner; Marguerite Roberts, Inspector; Tony Whitfield, Inspector
Others Present:	John Williams, Heather Cooper, Lewis Robinson, Nikki Szalwinski, Brook Tesler, David Landers, Cesar Padilla

AGENDA

Prior to the start of the meeting, Mr. Block explained the process for a web conference as follows: after the presentation of the staff reports and a period for questions from the Committee members to the applicant and staff, the Committee would take a 30-minute recess to allow for the submittal of public comments via email at VCC@nola.gov. The comments would then be read to the Committee members prior to any motion or vote for each item. There would be a cap on the length of the comments to what could be read within two minutes, and the emails received have been saved as part of the public record.

At approximately 1:00 pm Mr. Fifield called the teleconference to order. Mr. Block called roll and all three Committee members were present, constituting a quorum.

Minutes

Old Business

<u>615 Toulouse St</u>: 21-06765-VCGEN; C Williams John, applicant; 615 Toulouse Owner LLC, owner; Review of proposed changes to first floor millwork on front elevation, per application & materials received 03/09/2021 & 08/26/2021, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=875672

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. Mr. Bergeron asked if there was a net increase in doors out to the street; Mr. Williams responded no, it would be the same number of doors, but they were changing the swing for life safety reasons. Mr. Bergeron asked about slide 11. He stated that this slide showed 4 panels. He asked if the left most opening was fixed; Mr. Williams responded yes and that the middle would be operable. Mr. Bergeron asked if the doors would be left open when the business was in operation; Mr. Williams responded no, since tickets would be required for admission. Mr. Fifield stated that this was a reasonable question.

Ms. DiMaggio asked the applicant to please work out the detailing at staff, specifically the far-right bay, how the doors meet and what supported them. Ms. Vogt pointed out that slide 21 showed the detail. Ms. DiMaggio asked if this was the only opening with the extra mullion. Mr. Williams stated yes. Ms. DiMaggio stated that since the existing millwork was not original, she took less issue with it. With nothing left to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

1118-1120 Bourbon St: 21-10129-VCGEN; John Gray, applicant; Soren Giseson, owner;

Proposal to modify existing property line walls by replacing existing wood portions with new bricks and proposal to replace existing cloth awnings with new copper awnings, per application & materials received 04/09/2021 & 09/13/2021, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=883353

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report. There was no one present on behalf of the application. The Committee decided to move on without discussion.

<u>226 Bourbon St</u>: 21-14105-VCGEN; Heather Cooper, applicant; 226-28 Bourbon Street LLC, owner; Proposal to alter non-historic first floor millwork, per application & materials received 05/17/2021 & 07/07/2021, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=885101

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Ms. Cooper present on behalf of the application. Ms. Cooper stated that she agreed with the staff report. There was no further discussion needed on the part of the Committee. Mr. Bergeron noted that in the meeting materials doors one and four were shown as operable. He asked if they were to be fixed. Ms. Cooper responded that they would be. The Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

New Business

801 Chartres St: 21-11897-VCGEN; John C Williams, applicant; Taormina Family Investments LLC, owner; Proposal to remove existing cement, slate-type shingles and to install new non-cement, synthetic slate-type shingles, per application & materials received 04/27/2021 & 09/17/2021, respectively. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=883324

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Williams present on behalf of the application. Mr. Williams stated that he had brought some samples to staff and that while the building could handle the weight of a slate roof, the owner was concerned about the age, so he was asking for consideration of this as replacement. Ms. DiMaggio asked if this was plastic. Ms. Bourgogne stated "yes." Ms. DiMaggio stated that this would be a huge precedent and that she was uncomfortable with this exception. She went on to say that if the guidelines and staff said no, she agreed. With nothing left to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

<u>628 Esplanade Ave</u>: 21-24474-VCGEN; W Andrews, III John, applicant; Chandelier Development Nola LLC, owner; Proposal to relocate existing pool equipment structure approximately 3' so that it is no longer encroaching on the neighboring property, per application & materials received 08/19/2021. <u>https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=897757</u>

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report. There was no one present on behalf of the application. The Committee decided to move on without discussion.

<u>1119 Chartres St</u>: 21-25334-VCGEN; Premier South Roofing, applicant; John W Day, David Adam Remmetter, David L Landers, Graig A Luscombe, Sugar Oaks Estate LLC, All-State Creditplan LLC, Carole Lovelace, Rosemerie Viana, Landers And Lisa Landers Revocabl David, James H Dormon, Gloria K Fiero, Ernest E Breedlove, Dormon James Hunter, Jr, Magnolia Getaway LLC, Harry Robert Family LLC, Boudreaux Robert Jr, Kylie R Primeaux, owner; Proposal to remove existing cement, slate-type shingles and to install new non-cement, synthetic slate-type shingles, per application & materials received 08/27/2021 & 09/21/2021, respectively. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=898583

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Landers, condo president, and Mr. Padilla, the roofer, present on behalf of the application. Mr. Landers explained that the insurance company sent a drone over and they were told that they had substantial roof damage and the company was going to drop them. He went on to say that the insurance company wouldn't maintain the insurance unless they had a roofing contract. Mr. Landers described the issues getting slate in time and he went on to say that the roof was not visible from the street, so they purchase this "slate." Mr. Fifield asked if it was only the slopes into the courtyard. Mr. Landers stated no, the whole roof. Mr. Fifield asked if the Committee had any comments or questions. He then stated that if this was a hardship it needed to go to the full Commission. Ms. Bourgogne asked if staff had seen a sample. Mr. Albrecht stated no, not in person. Ms. Vogt stated that this proposed material had been approved for budlings with a lesser rating, not a green rated building. Mr. Fifield asked if staff could provide some examples. Mr. Block stated yes. Ms. DiMaggio stated that it felt "strange" to approach this any differently than the previous agenda item. She went on to say that it might need to go to the full Commission. Mr. Bergeron agreed and also pointed out that

portions of the roof of the main building were visible from the street. There was some talk about slide 140 and which side of the slide was the slate and which side was the synthetic. Mr. Bergeron stated that if this did go to Commission they would need to see photos of the product installed. The roofer agreed. Mr. Fifield stated that the issue was the surface texture, size and color. With nothing left to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

Appeals and Violations

<u>627-629 Toulouse St:</u> 21-25815-VCGEN; Lewis Robinson, applicant; Adrien L Larroque, Le Jou Jou Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to address widespread demolition by neglect violations, replace inappropriate millwork, and appeal to retain fountain, per application & materials received 09/14/2021. [Notices of Violation sent 02/17/2017 & 07/23/2020]

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=898918

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Robinson present on behalf of the application. Mr. Robinson responded to the staff report, stating that the lights in the passageway and loggia would be electric and installed in existing locations. He added that there was no evidence of water intrusion from the fountain and the wall at that particular spot was approximately 3' thick.

Ms. DiMaggio asked if the decorative fixtures in the loggia could be approved by staff or if they had to return to the Committee. Ms. Vogt stated that the Committee would not need to review that item unless they specifically requested to see it. She added that further Committee review would be needed for the stair and rail/screen, so the project would be returning. Mr. Fifield asked if the colonnade was an early 20th century modification; Ms. Vogt responded that she was unsure as she had not researched it specifically, but that brick was harder and that she would guess early 20th based on the photos. Mr. Robinson agreed. Mr. Bergeron asked the Committee what they thought of the proposal to install a rail, stating that he thought he preferred a screen. Mr. Fifield stated that it was a question of how to treat a non-original element, agreeing that they may want a solution other than a traditional guardrail. Mr. Robinson stated that there was a door at the rear of the building so it could be used as a walkway, hence the proposal for a rail. Ms. DiMaggio stated that, given the length of the colonnade, she found a rail to be more appropriate as a lattice screen would not be appropriately formal. Mr. Fifield stated that the lattice could be installed in panels that corresponded to the arches, and also serve as a guardrail. Mr. Robinson stated that he checked the Sanborn maps, and the colonnade was present in 1896 but was likely wood at that time. Mr. Fifield commended Mr. Robinson on his scholarship and the Committee moved into the 30-minute recess period.

At approximately 1:55 Mr. Bergeron made the motion for a 30-minute recess for public comment. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously, and the Committee agreed to reconvene at 2:25PM.

At approximately 2:25 PM Mr. Block called the roll. All were present. Mr. Fifield called the meeting to order.

Old Business

<u>615 Toulouse St</u>: 21-06765-VCGEN; C Williams John, applicant; 615 Toulouse Owner LLC, owner; Review of proposed changes to first floor millwork on front elevation, per application & materials received 03/09/2021 & 08/26/2021, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=875672

Public Comment:

Nikki Szalwinski, FQ citizens

Given another item on today's agenda represented by the same architect, we are concerned that changing millwork to make all doors operable is enabling this and future operators to leave doors open during business hours. We reiterate zoning requirements state that windows and doors are to be closed during live music. Can the committee please consider requiring the doors to be truly only for fire egress with automatic closing mechanisms and not easily allowed to stay open.

Discussion and Motion:

Mr. Williams responded to the public comment, stating that the doors would require panic hardware with closers. Mr. Fifield asked if the hardware would be visible above the lockrail; Mr. Williams stated that that had already been discussed with staff, and the panic bar would be installed below the glass lites.

Ms. DiMaggio moved for **conceptual approval** with the details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1118-1120 Bourbon St: 21-10129-VCGEN; John Gray, applicant; Soren Giseson, owner;

Proposal to modify existing property line walls by replacing existing wood portions with new bricks and proposal to replace existing cloth awnings with new copper awnings, per application & materials received 04/09/2021 & 09/13/2021, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=883353

There was no Public Comment.

Discussion and Motion:

Mr. Bergeron made the motion to defer the application in order for the applicant to be present. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

<u>226 Bourbon St</u>: 21-14105-VCGEN; Heather Cooper, applicant; 226-28 Bourbon Street LLC, owner; Proposal to alter non-historic first floor millwork, per application & materials received 05/17/2021 & 07/07/2021, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=885101

Public Comment:

Nikki Szalwinski, FQ Citizens

We remain concerned about the effect of these millwork changes on the tout ensemble of the district given statements made by the business owner in the last meeting, and, more so, due to the current complete lack of enforcement elsewhere in the district, not just along Bourbon street. We reiterate that zoning requirements state that windows and doors are to be closed during live music. Comm. Bergeron asked if some of the doors are to be fixed. Please provide clarification as it is difficult to ascertain in the drawings how this is to be accomplished. All the doors in the plans show handles so if it is simply a matter of latching the doors by the operator this is easily bypassed.

Discussion and Motion:

Ms. DiMaggio made the motion for the conceptual approval of the proposed work with bays 1 and 4 to be fixed since they were not required for egress, with revised drawings to be submitted for final review and approval at staff level. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

New Business

<u>801 Chartres St</u>: 21-11897-VCGEN; John C Williams, applicant; Taormina Family Investments LLC, owner; Proposal to remove existing cement, slate-type shingles and to install new non-cement, synthetic slate-type shingles, per application & materials received 04/27/2021 & 09/17/2021, respectively. <u>https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=883324</u>

Public Comment:

Laurie Bordelon for Eric White

I am writing to campaign for the use of the Inspire slate on 801 Chartres. The restaurant owner who is replacing the roof feels more comfortable with this option for the existing fire free slate. We have used this product for 15 years and it has performed exceptionally well. We feel that is a viable replacement for the fire free.

Discussion and Motion: Mr. Bergeron made the motion for the denial of the application with the applicant to submit a revised proposal with appropriate roofing material. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

<u>628 Esplanade Ave</u>: 21-24474-VCGEN; W Andrews, III John, applicant; Chandelier Development Nola LLC, owner; Proposal to relocate existing pool equipment structure approximately 3' so that it is no longer encroaching on the neighboring property, per application & materials received 08/19/2021.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=897757

Public Comment:

There was no public comment.

Discussion and Motion:

Ms. DiMaggio made the motion to defer the application in order for the applicant to be present. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

<u>1119 Chartres St</u>: 21-25334-VCGEN; Premier South Roofing, applicant; John W Day, David Adam Remmetter, David L Landers, Graig A Luscombe, Sugar Oaks Estate LLC, All-State Creditplan LLC, Carole Lovelace, Rosemerie Viana, Landers And Lisa Landers Revocabl David, James H Dormon, Gloria K Fiero, Ernest E Breedlove, Dormon James Hunter, Jr, Magnolia Getaway LLC, Harry Robert Family LLC, Boudreaux Robert Jr, Kylie R Primeaux, owner; Proposal to remove existing cement, slate-type shingles and to install new non-cement, synthetic slate-type shingles, per application & materials received 08/27/2021 & 09/21/2021, respectively. <u>https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=898583</u>

Public Comment:

There was no public comment.

Discussion and Motion: Mr. Bergeron moved to deny the application. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

Appeals and Violations

<u>627-629 Toulouse St:</u> 21-25815-VCGEN; Lewis Robinson, applicant; Adrien L Larroque, Le Jou Jou Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to address widespread demolition by neglect violations, replace inappropriate millwork, and appeal to retain fountain, per application & materials received 09/14/2021. [Notices of Violation sent 02/17/2017 & 07/23/2020]

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=898918

Public Comment:

Eric Spinrad

As a public listener, and having looked through the plans for 627-629 Toulouse St., I wanted to comment that I appreciate the time given to historical detail. The matching of the millwork to the 1830s existing millwork and the use of the 1896 Sanborn maps to address material aspects of the building are both commendable. This appears to be a thoughtful restoration of the building to an original state. Thank you to the VCC for your continued work.

Discussion and Motion:

Ms. DiMaggio moved to **defer** the application to a future meeting in order to allow the applicant time to revise/develop the items discussed today, with emphasis on the following comments:

PASSAGEWAY AND LOGGIA

Electric Lanterns – staff to determine if AC needs to review

FOUNTAIN

Retention of the fountain if all required materials/documentation submitted satisfy staff review of current conditions

COLONNADE

Support of infill wall removal with future submission of design proposal for HVAC screening, as well as any

MILLWORK details that may need to be illustration/revised/developed for review.

Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

With no items left to discuss at approximately Mr. Bergeron moved to adjourn the meeting at approximately 2:43PM. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.