VIEUX CARRE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMITTEE

LaToya Cantrell
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Bryan Block

Notice of Public Meeting TUESDAY, FEBRUARY 8th, 2022; 1:00 PM,

WebEx Conference Call: (415) 655-0001, Access Code: 2492 013 2120

NOTE: The below minutes are in draft form and are a summary of actions taken. They are not a verbatim transcription of the meeting.

Minutes of the VCC Architectural Committee meeting of Tuesday, February 8, 2022–1:00 pm.

Committee Members Present: Rick Fifield, Toni DiMaggio, Stephen Bergeron

Staff Present: Bryan Block, Director; Renée Bourgogne, Deputy Director; Nick Albrecht, Senior

Building Plans Examiner; Erin Vogt, Senior Building Plans Examiner; Marguerite

Roberts, Inspector; Tony Whitfield, Inspector

Others Present: Blake Kidder, Julia Scheuermann, Patrick Kadow, Robert Cangelosi, Jr., Quitman

Gahagan, Shelly Waguespack, Tim Terrell, Wayne Ducote, Karri Maggio, Jeffrey

Farshad

Minutes

Old Business

500 St Peter St: 21-04902-VCGEN; Kidder Blake, applicant; El Churasco Chapin LLC, owner;

Proposal to install mechanical safety equipment including access ladders and service platforms, per application & materials received 02/23/2021 & 01/11/2022.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=873987

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Mr. Kidder present on behalf of the application. Mr. Kidder stated that the fans were residential exhaust for condensers. Mr. Fifield stated that the clarification was very helpful. Ms. DiMaggio stated that she appreciated the difficulty with many concerns to balance, but noted that the building was Purple rated and roof hatches would be less impactful than the ladders running up the courtyard walls. She noted that the VCC does not have jurisdiction over this property but thought it was important to state that for the record. She added that it did not change her opinion, but she understood the proposal. Mr. Fifield asked if there were any drawings or materials that showed the other options they had considered and eliminated, Mr. Kidder responded no. He added that a roof hatch would require a larger platform. Mr. Fifield stated that it was difficult to evaluate whether that would be better or not. Ms. DiMaggio stated that a 3-5' wider platform would still be less invasive than the bolted ladder. Mr. Fifield asked Mr. Kidder if he would be able to submit something for the next meeting; he responded that he would submit for both alternatives. He added that another consideration was maintenance; if the equipment had to be changed, it would have to go through the hatch instead of up a ladder. Mr. Fifield stated that it was very important to see alternatives so the Committee could rule out other options. Mr. Bergeron added that it might be helpful to see the interior conditions they were concerned about even if not in the VCC's purview. With no further discussion, the Committee moved on to the next item on the agenda.

208 Bienville St: 21-21645-VCGEN; David Maise, applicant; 208 Bienville Street Development LLC, owner; Proposal to construct a new three-story gallery with roof overhang on the N. Front elevation of the building, per application & materials received 07/29/2021 & 01/31/2022, respectively. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=895078

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Terrell and Mr. Ducote present on behalf of the application. Mr. Terrell stated that they had tried to steer the proposal to a more industrial style by using the existing arch to direct it. He went on to say that they just wanted to start a dialogue and explore any options that the Committee might believe could be more successful. Mr. Ducote stated that he agreed and that they would be happy to come back with more guidance from staff. Mr. Bergeron stated that he found the proposal to be interesting and that

he agreed with staff that the proposal might have "some legs." Ms. DiMaggio stated that she was trying to decide if the materiality changed her feelings, in other words did it make a good consideration for approval. She went on to say that using the exterior footprint and pulling it back within the exoskeleton made it "less confusing." Mr. Blocks stated that they had met on site and his takeaway was that if this could be contemporary and not "faux historic" with more industrial language there was definitely room for discussion. Mr. Fifield stated that he did think the designs on A 1.B and A 1.C were more successful. He went on to say that he agreed the more contemporary or industrial the design the better but for the architect not to detract from the beauty of the buildings. He went on to suggest that perhaps hung balconies might work. He suggested working with staff.

<u>923 Decatur St</u>: 22-03489-VCGEN; Perez Architects, applicant; Salvadore T Tusa, owner; Proposal to renovate hurricane damaged building, per application & materials received 01/25/2022. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=914717

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Ms. Maggio present on behalf of the application. Ms. Maggio stated that after communicating with the structural engineer, the intent was to retain the existing tie backs in there current locations. She continued that additional tie backs would be incorporated inside the building. Mr. Fifield asked if this overall construction would be a faithful reproduction of the building that was damaged during Hurricane Ida, specifically the massing and footprint. Ms. Maggio stated that yes, the drawings were based on limited field measurements and site conditions.

Mr. Bergeron asked how much of the original building could remain in place compared to being demolished and rebuilt. Ms. Maggio responded that for the most part the exterior walls are intact and are to be repaired as needed. She continued that the front façade had pulled away slightly from the sidewalls and would be pulled back in place. With no additional questions, the Committee moved on to the next item on the agenda.

<u>925 Decatur St</u>: 22-03493-VCGEN; Perez Architects, applicant; & Sylvia Goldberg Israel, owner; Proposal to renovate hurricane damaged building, per application & materials received 01/25/2022. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=914721

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Ms. Maggio present on behalf of the application. The applicant stated that similar to 923 they intended to stabilize the front with L shaped tiebacks at the roof line. Mr. Fifield asked if the tiebacks in the gable end or the collapsed roof would be visible. The applicant stated no. With nothing left to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

New Business

<u>916 Dumaine St:</u> 21-33701-VCGEN; Patrick Kadow, applicant; Thomas J Wyllie, owner; Proposal to replace existing wood garage door with metal, per application & materials received 12/07/2021 & 01/31/2022. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=908905

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Kadow present on behalf of the application. Mr. Kadow stated that the door had been kicked in during Katrina and that they finally found this option that looked similar. He added that the existing door was so heavy that they had replaced the operating mechanism 4 times. Ms. DiMaggio asked if the door came in a finish that was not the stamped faux wood texture; Mr. Kadow responded that they were unable to find one. Ms. Vogt called attention to the approved garage door at 820 Dauphine, noting that it was a custom, commercial door, and stated that she would provide the applicant with the manufacturer information. Ms. DiMaggio stated that she would prefer a smooth finish or a wood clad metal; Mr. Bergeron agreed. With nothing left to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

<u>829 Barracks St</u>: 22-00769-VCGEN; Cangelosi, Jr Robert, applicant; Lawrence Heilbronner-Kolthoff, owner; Proposal to replace millwork and install new steps in courtyard, per application & materials received 01/12/2022. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=911971

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Mr. Cangelosi present on behalf of the application. Mr. Cangelosi stated that there wouldn't be much change to the frame at opening A, just removing the transom and bar, and that he hoped it could be approved at staff level. Mr. Bergeron asked if the windows labeled H were existing masonry wall openings; Mr. Cangelosi stated that they dated to a poorly executed renovation in the 60s or 70s, which he

stated was probably done without permits. He stated that there would be no changes to any historic fabric. Mr. Fifield agreed that the windows were definitely not historic. With nothing left to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

914 N Peters St: 22-01209-VCGEN; Kidder Blake, applicant; French Market Corp., owner;

FOR RECOMMENDATION ONLY: Proposal to repair storm damage and renovate building including proposed installation of synthetic balcony decking, per application & materials received 01/19/2022. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=913176

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Kidder present on behalf of the application. Mr. Kidder stated that the decking was exposed on the riverside and that was the only one they wanted to replace. Both Ms. DiMaggio and Mr. Bergeron stated that they agreed with the staff report. With nothing else to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

830 Burgundy St: 21-35412-VCGEN; Quitman Gahagan, applicant; Harry Q III Gahagan, owner; Proposal to install new decorative light fixtures, per application & materials received 01/05/2022. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=910629

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Gahagan present on behalf of the application. Mr. Gahagan explained that the needed a new functional light fixture at the front for safety, but that they also wanted something attractive. He added that the light pole had not worked since they purchased the property. Mr. Block stated that they would reach out to DPW about the pole. Mr. Fifield asked if Mr. Gahagan could work with staff on the appropriate fixtures; Mr. Gahagan responded that he was surprised by staff's recommendation against decorative lights. Mr. Fifield stated that lighting should make the building pop and the fixtures should be subservient to the building instead of attracting attention to themselves. Ms. Bourgogne stated that frankly she would suggest soffit mounted fixtures and Ms. Vogt agreed. Mr. Bergeron commented that he was surprised to hear that recommendation from staff since there was no visible soffit venting. Ms. Bourgogne stated that the overhang was tall, and the fixtures could be soffit mounted, one over each opening. Mr. Fifield suggested functional fixtures, adding that the decorative fixtures might not be adequate lighting, and that staff could suggest better fixtures. Mr. Gahagan stated that they wanted gas fixtures down the road, but he wasn't sure if it would be approved; Ms. Bourgogne stated that they did not provide enough light and would not be appropriate for this building. Mr. Fifield agreed. With nothing left to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

Appeals and Violations

830 Burgundy St: 22-00825-VCGEN; Quitman Gahagan, applicant; Harry Q III Gahagan, owner; Appeal to retain keypad hardware installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 01/12/2022. [Notice of Violation sent 08/26/2021]

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Mr. Gahagan present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield encouraged the applicant to use staff as a resource, noting that consultation before undertaking work. Mr. Gahagan stated that this too was a safety issue, adding that they wanted a keyless system that would lock behind the person once they entered. Ms. DiMaggio stated that it was likely that alternative hardware could be approved that met the applicant's needs and the Design Guidelines. Mr. Bergeron agreed with Ms. DiMaggio. Mr. Fifield asked if this could be worked out at staff. Mr. Gahagan stated that they had done a lot of research, and this was the only set they could find that locked behind you. Ms. Vogt stated that they had some examples in the PowerPoint. With nothing left to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

<u>1129 Decatur St</u>: 21-34791-VCPNT; Jeffrey Farshad, applicant; French Quarter Enterprises LLC, owner; Proposal to replace existing unpermitted keypad door hardware with new "Schlage Touch Keyless Touchscreen Lever," per application & materials received 12/15/2021.

Mr. Albrecht read the staff report with Mr. Farshad present on behalf of the application. Mr. Farshad stated that he was looking for a lock that always locks automatically when closed and includes a lever. Ms. DiMaggio noted that the issue with this one seemed to be the visible touchscreen and if there was an option for a touchscreen

that was only visible when in use and still met the owners criteria that might be a way to move forward. Mr. Fifield if this matter could be handled at the staff level if appropriate hardware was proposed. Mr. Albrecht responded that with a conceptual approval of hardware similar to this that staff could take it from there. With nothing left to discuss, the Committee moved on to the next agenda item.

<u>718 St Peter St</u>: 22-00514-VCGEN; Pat O'brien's Bar Inc, applicant; Pat O Briens Bar Inc, owner; Appeal to retain items installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, including mounted heaters, speakers, screening, and courtyard awnings, per application & materials received 01/06/2022. [Notice of Violation sent 06/11/2021]

Ms. Vogt read the staff report with Ms. Waguespack present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield stated that simply asking for retention could result in denial, and he recommended a proactive approach, or the result would be less successful. Ms. Waguespack asked if they should go through the list item by item. Mr. Fifield asked if she was the owner or manager; she responded that she was third generation owner. Mr. Fifield asked if she was aware of what is required for review and approval; she answered that she was, but that she did not micromanage. Mr. Fifield stated that a document addressing all items would be helpful. Mr. Bergeron asked the rating. Ms. Vogt stated blue. Mr. Bergeron agreed with Mr. Fifield, stating that the applicant would need to submit a comprehensive plan to resolve the situation. Ms. Waguespack stated that she understood. With nothing left to discuss, the Committee went to recess. It was approximately 2:25 PM.

At approximately 2:25 PM Mr. Bergeron made the motion for a 30-minute recess for public comment. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously, and the Committee agreed to reconvene at 2:55PM.

At approximately 2:55PM Mr. Block called the roll. All were present, and Mr. Fifield called the meeting to order.

Old Business

500 St Peter St: 21-04902-VCGEN; Kidder Blake, applicant; El Churasco Chapin LLC, owner;

Proposal to install mechanical safety equipment including access ladders and service platforms, per application & materials received 02/23/2021 & 01/11/2022.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=873987

No Public Comment

Discussion and Motion:

Ms. DiMaggio moved to **defer** the proposal with the applicant to provide materials showing alternatives as discussed. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

208 Bienville St: 21-21645-VCGEN; David Maise, applicant; 208 Bienville Street Development LLC, owner; Proposal to construct a new three-story gallery with roof overhang on the N. Front elevation of the building, per application & materials received 07/29/2021 & 01/31/2022, respectively. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=895078

Public Comment:

There was no public comment.

Discussion and Motion:

Mr. Bergeron made the motion to defer the application in order to allow the applicant time to work with staff to further develop this proposal based on today's discussion and using the guidelines for New Construction and Additions as a guide. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

923 Decatur St: 22-03489-VCGEN; Perez Architects, applicant; Salvadore T Tusa, owner;

Proposal to renovate hurricane damaged building, per application & materials received 01/25/2022. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=914717

Public Comment:

Having monitored today's meeting, I am acutely interested as to when contracts will be let to affect repairs at 923 and 925 Decatur St and an estimation as to how long it will take to complete these repairs. The sidewalks in front these properties have been closed to pedestrians since Hurricane IDA. There is a chain link fence running the entire length of the closed properties and it extends from the front of the properties out into the street which requires pedestrians to compete with vehicular traffic. I am certainly empathetic as to the extent of damage and the enormity of the task to rehabilitate these buildings; but, it would be extremely comforting to have some idea as to how soon normal life can be restored to this stretch of Decatur Street.

Thank you,

Stephen Kornovich

Discussion and Motion:

Mr. Fifield noted that the Committee does not delve into the matters of schedules or pace of work but that it might be something that the Director take up with Public Works and/or the owners to provide safe pedestrian passage. Mr. Block responded that the VCC is aware of this concern and welcomed individuals to reach out to him directly with any other questions or concerns.

Ms. DiMaggio moved for conceptual approval of the application with the applicant to return to the Architecture Committee with more details regarding the tie backs and any other items that may need additional review. Mr. Bergeron inquired about an amendment to the motion to allow staff to approve the tie back locations if they are in their historic locations. Ms. DiMaggio accepted the amendment and the motion passed unanimously.

<u>925 Decatur St</u>: 22-03493-VCGEN; Perez Architects, applicant; & Sylvia Goldberg Israel, owner; Proposal to renovate hurricane damaged building, per application & materials received 01/25/2022. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=914721

Public Comment: See Public Comment for 923 Decatur.

Discussion and Motion:

Mr. Bergeron made the motion to conceptually approve the proposed work with any final details to be worked out at the staff level. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

New Business

<u>916 Dumaine St:</u> **21-33701-VCGEN**; Patrick Kadow, applicant; Thomas J Wyllie, owner; Proposal to replace existing wood garage door with metal, per application & materials received 12/07/2021 & 01/31/2022. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=908905

No Public Comment

Discussion and Motion:

Ms. DiMaggio stated that she would be willing to consider multiple different options and moved to **defer**, with the applicant to investigate alternatives with no wood grain stamp. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<u>829 Barracks St</u>: 22-00769-VCGEN; Cangelosi, Jr Robert, applicant; Lawrence Heilbronner-Kolthoff, owner; Proposal to replace millwork and install new steps in courtyard, per application & materials received 01/12/2022. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=911971

No Public Comment

Discussion and Motion:

Mr. Bergeron moved to **conceptually approve** the proposed work, with final review and approval to take place at staff level, and approve **temporary retention** of the HVAC unit on the balcony until it requires replacement at the end of its life. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

914 N Peters St: 22-01209-VCGEN; Kidder Blake, applicant; French Market Corp., owner;

FOR RECOMMENDATION ONLY: Proposal to repair storm damage and renovate building including proposed installation of synthetic balcony decking, per application & materials received 01/19/2022.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=913176

There was no Public Comment.

Discussion and Motion: Ms. DiMaggio made the motion for a positive recommendation to allow the use of synthetic decking. Mr. Bergeron seconded the recommendation and the recommendation passed unanimously.

830 Burgundy St: 21-35412-VCGEN; Quitman Gahagan, applicant; Harry Q III Gahagan, owner; Proposal to install new decorative light fixtures, per application & materials received 01/05/2022.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=910629

No Public Comment

Discussion and Motion:

Mr. Bergeron moved for **deferral**, with the applicant to work with staff on a proposal that would meet the Design Guidelines and use functional fixtures.

Appeals and Violations

830 Burgundy St: **22-00825-VCGEN**; Quitman Gahagan, applicant; Harry Q III Gahagan, owner; Appeal to retain keypad hardware installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, per application & materials received 01/12/2022. [Notice of Violation sent 08/26/2021]

No Public Comment

Discussion and Motion:

Ms. DiMaggio moved to **deny** retention of the current hardware, with the applicant to work with staff on selecting a replacement that would meet their needs and the Design Guidelines. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion, which passed unanimously. Mr. Block informed the applicant of their right to appeal decisions of the Architectural Committee to the full Commission.

<u>1129 Decatur St</u>: 21-34791-VCPNT; Jeffrey Farshad, applicant; French Quarter Enterprises LLC, owner; Proposal to replace existing unpermitted keypad door hardware with new "Schlage Touch Keyless Touchscreen Lever," per application & materials received 12/15/2021.

There was no Public Comment.

Discussion and Motion:

Mr. Bergeron moved to conceptually approve the installation of keypad door hardware with final, more discrete hardware selection to be worked out at the staff level. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

<u>718 St Peter St</u>: 22-00514-VCGEN; Pat O'brien's Bar Inc, applicant; Pat O Briens Bar Inc, owner; Appeal to retain items installed without benefit of VCC review and approval, including mounted heaters, speakers, screening, and courtyard awnings, per application & materials received 01/06/2022. [Notice of Violation sent 06/11/2021]

No Public Comment

Discussion and Motion:

Ms. DiMaggio moved to **defer** the appeal with the applicant to submit a comprehensive plan to address all violations. Mr. Bergeron seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

At approximately 3:09 PM, Mr. Bergeron moved to adjourn the meeting of February 8th, 2022. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.