

VIEUX CARRE COMMISSION

Mitchell J. Landrieu  
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Bryan Block  
DIRECTOR

Minutes of the **Vieux Carré Commission** meeting of **Wednesday, July 5th, 2018 - 1:30 P.M.**

**COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:** Nicholas S. Musso, Chairman  
Leslie S. Stokes, Secretary  
Daniel Taylor  
Mamie Gasperecz  
Rick Fifield

**COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:** Bill Keck  
Patricia C. Denechaud  
Angela King  
Adrienne Thomas

**STAFF PRESENT:** Bryan D. Block, Director; Renée Bourgoigne, Architectural Historian;  
Nicholas G. Albrecht, Building Plans Examiner; Erin Vogt, Building Plans  
Examiner; Marguerite Roberts, Inspector

**STAFF ABSENT:** Tony Whitfield, Inspector

**I. ROLL CALL**

Chairman Musso called the meeting to order at approximately 1:41 PM. A quorum was established with the presence of five (5) of the nine (9) seated Commissioners present.

**II. REVIEW OF MINUTES**

Mr. Taylor moved, Ms. Gasperecz seconded, that the minutes of the Vieux Carré Commission meeting of June 6th, 2018 be approved as previously circulated. The motion passed unanimously.

**III. CHAIRMAN'S REPORT**

Chairman Musso did not present a Chairman's Report.

**IV. DIRECTOR'S REPORT**

Mr. Block did not present a Director's Report.

**V. OTHER BUSINESS**

**Presentation and ratification of Rooftop Addition Subcommittee Draft Resolution**

After explaining the requisite ratification process, Mr. Block read the Rooftop Addition Subcommittee draft resolution in its entirety. The chairman asked if there was any commentary from commissioners and the public.

Meg Lousteau, in the audience representing VCPORA, noted that the use of rooftops may be fine but that it could create problems for neighboring properties. Ms. Stokes moves and Mr. Taylor seconded to adopt the resolution as presented and forward to City Council for adoption. The motion passed unanimously.

**VI. OLD BUSINESS**

**916 Governor Nicholls St: 16-09663-VCGEN**; Cangelosi, Jr Robert, applicant; Michael W Magner, owner; Review of staff recommendation to upgrade the newly-restored building and service ell from pink rated to green rated, per permit finalized 06/27/18.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report on behalf of the property. With no discussion necessary, Mr. Taylor moved to approve the rating upgrade from pink to green. Ms. Stokes seconded the

motion, which passed unanimously.

## VII. NEW BUSINESS

**1300 Chartres St: 18-08077-VCGEN;** Walter Antin, applicant; Monterra Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to demolish the rear, brown-rated addition in order to create an off-street parking spot, in conjunction with a renovation of the main building, per application & materials received 03/08/18 & 03/23/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=752712>

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation although there was no one present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso noted that the current condition was dangerous at best and that the building would require a total rebuild rather than a renovation. Mr. Fifield noted that he was not present at the 06/12 Architecture Committee meeting and that he would not have voted for the proposed demolition.

Mr. Taylor moved for approval of the proposed demolition and waiving the 30-day layover period. Ms. Gasperecz seconded the motion, which passed with four votes in favor and Mr. Fifield voting in opposition.

**501 Decatur St: 18-15039-VCGEN;** John C. Williams, applicant; 501 Rue Decatur LLC, 501 Rue Decatur LLC, owner; Proposal to remove existing balcony and to construct new covered gallery, per application & materials received 05/04/18 & 06/06/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=761338>

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Mr. Winkert present on behalf of the application. Mr. Taylor and Mr. Fifield asked about the second floor door between the Decatur and St. Louis buildings; staff responded that the buildings had been totally separate and the door is located in brown-rated infill. Mr. Taylor moved to **conceptually approve** the new gallery, with the door to be removed. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

**939 - 941 Orleans Ave: 18-16287-VCGEN;** Robert Pell, applicant; First Quarter LLC, owner; Proposal to demolish existing garage structure, per application & materials received 05/15/18 & 06/06/18, respectively.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=762001>

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Messrs. Pell and Loewenthal present on behalf of the application. Mr. Fifield noted that he was not present at the June 12<sup>th</sup> Committee meeting and would've voted against the demolition at that meeting. Mr. Musso stated that he disagreed with Mr. Fifield's objections to the demolition, as this building has no historic value and what is proposed is an improvement. Mr. Taylor moved to **approve** the demolition, consistent with staff recommendations, including waving the 30 day layover period. Ms. Stokes seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

## VIII. APPEALS AND VIOLATIONS

**1005 St Philip St, 1009 St. Philip Street: 18-01001-VCGEN;** John C. Williams, applicant; Balentine Carbondale Holdings LLC, owner; Appeal to retain demolition of outbuilding begun without benefit of VCC review and approval, and in deviation from permitted materials, per application & materials received 01/22/18 & 04/05/18. [**STOP WORK ORDER posted 06/11/18**]

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Mr. Winkert present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso asked for speakers from the public to address the Commission.

Mr. Jacobs spoke in opposition to the unpermitted demolition and the additional height added to the property line wall, stating that the previously existing building was charming, and that the approved height would block light into his neighboring window. It should be noted that this height modification is not part of this review and was approved previously by the Architectural Committee and permitted. He added that the construction methods were shoddy and the wall is now bowing out. He also voiced concerns that the unpermitted wall reconstruction would not hold the roof structure, and with any intentions to add density to the property. This substandard work was noted previously by VCC staff and must be removed and reworked.

Ms. Szalwinski was also concerned with the construction methods and agreed with Mr. Jacobs' comments.

Ms. Lousteau stated that she was shocked by the illegal work and that the architecture firm is familiar with typical VCC and Safety and Permits process for demolition. She strongly encouraged the Commission to financially penalize the owners and to send the property to adjudication.

Mr. Musso stated that the poor construction methods are visually apparent, and stated that a single-wythe brick wall with no lateral bracing is unacceptable since the previously existing lumber was supporting the structural loads. He emphasized that the work reflects poorly on everyone involved and is a heinous violation. Mr. Block responded that he had spoken with the architect and with the owners, and that he believed the improper work stemmed from a lack of communication oversight between the architect and contractor. He explicitly stated that he did not believe this work was intended in bad faith. Mr. Winkert explained that the work was completed over a weekend and that his firm had been surprised by it.

Mr. Musso responded that, at best, this was a result of a lack of communication, and that the architect needs to supervise inexperienced contractors. He added that these situations cast aspersions and that there have been numerous occurrences of architects and contractors exceeding permitted scopes of work.

Mr. Taylor moved to concur with staff recommendations to **forward** the application to the Architectural Committee for further review. Mr. Fifield seconded Mr. Taylor's motion. Mr. Musso stated that he wished to consider a financial penalty and asked if any Commissioners would consider amending the motion. Mr. Winkert added that the contractor found termite damage in the lumber construction which may have led to his removal of it. Mr. Musso responded that the appropriate procedure would have been to return to the VCC with that information before taking any action. Mr. Taylor stated that he would keep his motion as-is since it was the recommendation of the staff. Mr. Musso called for a vote, and Commissioners Taylor, Fifield, Stokes and Gasperecz voted in support of the motion, which passed. Mr. Musso voted against the motion.

**835 Orleans Ave: 18-18408-VCGEN**; Brian Begue, applicant; Max J Begue, Max J Begue, owner; Appeal of the Architecture Committee denial of a proposal to remove existing wood weatherboards from the Dauphine and Bourbon elevations of the main building and install new Hardiboard cement siding, per application & materials received 06/01/18 & appeal letter received 06/20/18.

<https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=764144>

The application was deferred prior to the meeting at the applicant's request.

**IX. RATIFICATION** of Architectural Committee and Staff actions since the Wednesday, June 6, 2018 VCC meeting.

Mr. Taylor moved to ratify the Architecture Committee and Staff actions since June 6, 2018. Ms. Stokes seconded the motion, and the motion passed unanimously.

With no other business to discuss, Mr. Taylor moved to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Stokes seconded the motion, and the motion passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at approximately 2:30pm.