VIEUX CARRE COMMISSION

LaToya Cantrell
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Bryan Block DIRECTOR

AGENDA WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 18, 2023 1:00 PM CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS 1300 PERDIDO ST, NEW ORLEANS, LA 70112

- I. ROLL CALL
- II. REVIEW OF MINUTES
- III. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT
- IV. DIRECTOR'S REPORT

V. NEW BUSINESS

434-40 Bourbon, 732 St Louis St: 23-00612-VCGEN; Diane Hickman, applicant; MDK 440 Bourbon Real Estate LLC, owner; Proposal to demolish Brown rated structures and construct new three-story building with double gallery, in conjunction with a change of use from bar to bar/short term rental, per application & materials received 01/09/2023 & 08/15/2023, respectively.

https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=958615

<u>914 N Rampart St</u>: 23-23407-VCGEN; Terrell Fabacher, applicant; Victorian House LLC, owner; Proposal to modify millwork and install mechanical wheelchair lift on side elevation, in conjunction with a **change of use** from *commercial* to *medical clinic*, per application & materials received 08/24/2023 & 09/29/2023. https://onestopapp.nola.gov/Documents.aspx?ObjLabel=Permit&ID=985631

RATIFICATION of Architectural Committee and Staff actions since the Wednesday, September 20, 2023 VCC meeting.

ADDRESS: 434-40 Bourbon, 732 St. Louis

OWNER: MDK 440 Bourbon Real Estate APPLICANT: Diane Hickman

LLC

ZONING: VCE SQUARE: 63

USE: Commercial LOT SIZE: 5,494.4 sq. ft.

DENSITY: OPEN SPACE:

ALLOWED: 9 units REQUIRED: 1098.9 sq. ft. EXISTING: None EXISTING: None

EXISTING: None EXISTING: None PROPOSED: Unknown PROPOSED: None

ARCHITECTURAL/HISTORICAL DESCRIPTION OF PROPERTY:

Main building: **Green**, of local architectural and/or historic significance.

Rear additions: Brown, detrimental, or of no architectural and/or historic significance

Although constructed circa 1820 as part of the Pigneguy's Stables, this 3-story brick building has lost its early 19th-century appearance. In the 1870s the front building (Bourbon and St. Louis) housed a bakery and the open yard, surrounded by separate buildings, served as a stable.

Vieux Carré Commission Meeting of 10/18/2023

DESCRIPTION OF APPLICATION: 10/18/2023

Permit # unassigned Lead Staff: Erin Vogt

Proposal to demolish Brown rated structures and construct new three-story building with double gallery, in conjunction with a **change of use** from *bar* to *bar/short term rental*, per application & materials received 01/09/2023 & 08/15/2023, respectively.

STAFF ANALYSIS & RECOMMENDATION: 10/18/2023

This property was last reviewed by the Commission on 07/12/2022, where a proposal to construct a two-story addition was considered. The applicant was given feedback on what could be found approvable for the site under the Design Guidelines, and several revised proposals have been reviewed at the Committee level.

The applicant is now proposing to demolish the brown rated infill structure on the site and build a new three-story building, which will leave much of the Green rated historic building at the corner unchanged. The new building will provide additional space for the existing bar to expand to the second floor, while the third floor is pulled back from the historic building, creating a lightwell so five of the seven existing rear windows will be left unaltered. The third floor of the historic building will hold offices, ADA compliant restrooms, and other service space. The third floor of the new construction will hold two short term rental units. The mechanical equipment for the site will be located on the roof of the new building, which is 41'-6" tall. The height of the access stair is not indicated, but must be below 50'-0" in order to comply with the CZO.

The front elevation on St. Louis is divided into three bays and has a stucco façade with a double gallery and denticulated cornice. The gallery is simplified in detail and has pipe columns on all three floors. The rail design is a vertically-flipped abstraction of the rail at the historic Green rated building, but does not copy it directly. The stucco is shown with expansion joints, as is typical for contemporary stucco. The Committee reviewed multiple options for fenestration on this elevation, and further revision is likely to occur during design development.

Chapter 14 of the VCC Design Guidelines list design principles which must be considered when evaluating the appropriateness of proposed new construction, including but not limited to:

DESIGN PRINCIPLES	NEW CONSTRUCTION & ADDITIONS
Scale: Height & Width	Proportions and size of the new building/addition compared with neighboring buildings/existing building
Building Form & Massing	The three-dimensional relationship and configuration of the new building/ addition footprint, its walls and roof compared with neighboring buildings/ existing building
Setback	Distance of the new building/addition to the street or property line when compared with other buildings on the block/existing building
Site Coverage	Percentage of the site that is covered by a building/addition, when compared to nearby sites of compatible size
Orientation	Location of the front of the new building/addition and principal entrance relative to other buildings on the block
Alignment, Rhythm & Spacing	Effect the new building/addition will have on the existing patterns on its block

Architectural Elements & Projections	Size, shape, proportions and location of each entrance, balcony, gallery, porch, roof overhang, chimney, dormer, parapet and other elements that contribute to the building's overall shape and silhouette relative to neighboring buildings
Façade Proportions: Window & Door Patterns	Relationship of the size, shape and location of the new building/addition façade and building elements to each other, as well as when compared to other buildings on the property, block/existing building
Trim & Detail	Mouldings, decorative elements and features of a building that are secondary to major surfaces such as walls and a roof and how they relate to the neighboring buildings/existing building
Materials	Products with which an addition or new building is composed or constructed and how these relate to neighboring buildings/existing building

14-4 Vieux Carré Commission - Guidelines for New Construction, Additions & Demolition

While many of these criteria cannot be evaluated until the project has progressed further, the Committee found on 02/28/2023 that the overall concept could proceed to the Commission with a positive recommendation, with the proviso that any required Board of Zoning Adjustments or Board of Building Standards and Appeals variances must be resolved prior to Commission review. Since that motion in February, the applicant has consulted with Zoning and the Department of Safety and Permits, and found that any substantial renovation on the site would trigger a requirement for CZO compliance regarding open space. Much discussion was had regarding how the work could proceed without requiring a variance, but it appears to be unavoidable. Staff notes that the entire site has been covered since at least the 1876 Sanborn maps, and the first-floor rear elevations of the Green rated building have long since been demolished. As such, staff recommends that the Commission forward a **positive recommendation** to the BZA, supporting an open space variance at this property.

Staff notes that demolition of the brown rated building triggers a 30-day layover to allow for careful consideration and public comment, at which point the Commission must re-review the proposal prior to approval of any demolition. Consistent with the Design Guidelines, demolition may not be permitted until construction documents for the new construction have also been approved and permitted. Considering the new construction drawings will take more than 30 days to develop and further Committee review will be required, final review of the demolition will return to the Commission at that time, not the November hearing.

Staff recommends **conceptual approval** of the proposed demolition and new construction, with a **positive recommendation** for the open space variance to be forwarded to the BZA, and with design development drawings to return to the Architecture Committee for further review.

VIEUX CARRÉ COMMISSION ACTION:

10/18/2023

ADDRESS: 914 N. Rampart Street

OWNER: Victorian House LLC APPLICANT: Terrell Fabacher

ZONING: VCC-2 SQUARE: 104

USE: Unknown LOT SIZE: 3072 sq. ft. (approx.)

ARCHITECTURAL/HISTORICAL DESCRIPTION OF PROPERTY:

Main building & service building: Green, of local architectural and/or historic significance.

A 2-story, frame, late Victorian dwelling.

Vieux Carré Commission Meeting of 10/18/2023

DESCRIPTION OF APPLICATION: 10/18/2023

Permit #23-23407-VCGEN Lead Staff: Erin Vogt

Proposal to modify millwork and install mechanical wheelchair lift on side elevation, in conjunction with a **change of use** from *commercial* to *medical clinic*, per application & materials received 08/24/2023 & 09/29/2023.

STAFF ANALYSIS & RECOMMENDATION:

10/18/2023

Article 2.10 of the Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance states that:

"Within the Vieux Carré Historic District, no occupancy permit shall be issued by the Director of Safety and Permits, for any change in the use of any existing building until and unless a special permit shall have been issued by the Vieux Carré Commission, except that where no change of exterior appearance is contemplated such permit by the Vieux Carré Commission shall not be required. Where any change in exterior appearance is contemplated, the Vieux Carré Commission shall hold a hearing, and if it approves such change, it shall issue a special permit to continue the same use, or for any other use not otherwise prohibited in the district, subject to the following conditions and safeguards:

- 1. The historic character of the Vieux Carré shall not be injuriously affected.
- 2. Signs which are garish or otherwise out of keeping with the character of the Vieux Carré shall not be permitted.
- 3. Building designs shall be in harmony with the traditional architectural character of the Vieux Carré.
- 4. The value of the Vieux Carré as a place of unique interest and character shall not be impaired."

The following work is proposed in conjunction with a **change of use** to *medical clinic*, which is an allowable use for this overlay district. The applicant proposes to install a wheelchair lift on the St. Philip elevation of the building, hidden behind an existing wood gate. An existing anachronistic side entrance at the main building will be removed. The adjacent two-over-four double-hung window will be moved to that opening, and a new wood and glass door with transom installed in the opening closest to the street. A wooden landing with handrail supports the new wheelchair lift. The door is not clearly seen in these drawings as it is obscured by the platform rail, but the number and size of the lites appear to be influenced by the adjacent window, and it is shown swinging out.

The Committee recommends **conceptual approval** of the millwork replacement, with detail drawings to return to the Committee for final approval prior to permit, and that the Commission forward a **positive recommendation** for the **change of use** to the Director of Safety and Permits. Staff notes that an unobscured elevation of the door and spec sheets for all hardware must be provided before the project will be scheduled for further Committee review.

VIEUX CARRÉ COMMISSION ACTION:

10/18/2023