

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks
Commission Meeting Minutes

Date: March 12, 2025

Location: City Council Chamber

Called to order: 1:00 p.m.

Commissioners present: Jennie Cannon West, Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Commissioners absent: Jennifer Green, Annie Clark

I. Roll Call

II. Minutes of the meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Shawanda Poree

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments:

III. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the consent agenda.

By: Ross Karsen

Second: Jim Ashbee

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments: Greg Hackenberg recused himself from this vote.

IV. New Business Work Applications

A. 1137 St Charles

Application: Appeal the ARC recommendations for the renovation of penthouse and addition of rooftop deck at a Landmark, commercial building.

Motion: Deny the appeal and uphold the ARC recommendations.

By: Jim Ashbee

Second: Tim Lupin

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 4100 Royal

Application: Review and comment only for the new construction of four-story multifamily building for 82 apartments and leasing office on a vacant lot.

Recommendation:

At that time the Commission made the following comments regarding the current proposal:

1. The site plan responds well to the previous ARC recommendations:
Improvements made since original proposal
 - Parking lot
 - Vehicular circulation
 - Preservation of certain large trees
2. However, other elements of the current proposal fall short of previous recommendations:
 - The current plan eliminates responsiveness to context
 - Fewer building entrances (3-4) whereas the previous had 15-20
 - Elimination of the “townhouse” forms in the massing
 - Balconies
 - The current proposal indicates some double-hung windows instead of doors with “Juliet” railings which are at odds with the neighborhood context

The Commission made the following recommendations:

1. Consider detailing the proposal so that it more closely aligns with previous ARC comments.
2. Improve transparency and connectivity at the ground level conditions.
 - Adding more doors will improve relationships to neighborhood rhythms and patterns as previously articulated by the client’s own diagrams about entry conditions.
3. Reconsider “Juliet balcony” conditions which seem to no longer function and only mimic an historic balcony when it does not perform as one.
4. Reconsider how the proposed fiber cement paneling referred to in the drawings is detailed.
 - Current drawings do not accurately/adequately represent actual joint conditions. If built as currently detailed they will not weather well.
5. Parapet height
 - No parapet is currently indicated
 - This is an opportunity to increase the height of the building
 - Will more readily conceal proposed mechanical equipment
 - CZO requires screening of such equipment.
6. The Commission hopes that there is a willingness to revise the plans to be more responsive to the ARC recommendations and the neighborhood scale and context.

By: Ross Karsen

V. New Business Demolition Applications

A. 2924 Louisiana Ave

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, raised basement, single-family building to grade.
Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that further understanding be given of the current state of the interior of the building.

By: Tim Lupin

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 1400 South Carrollton Ave

Application: New construction of a 5,000 SF, one-story commercial building.

Motion: Conceptually approve the application for the new construction of a 5,000 SF, one-story commercial building with the comments made by the ARC.

By: Annie Irvin

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments: Public comment by Susan Johnson

C. 1570 N Roman

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition to grade based on the condition of the structure today and because much of the original character-defining exterior architectural details remain and the building continues to contribute its type, style, massing and roof form to the surrounding local historic district.

By: Ross Karsen

Second: Tim Lupin

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 2228 Iberville

Application: Demolition of a one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.

By: Jason King

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 7519 Hampson

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, single-family residential building to grade
Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that further research can be done on the building history.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Annie Irvin

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments: Public comments by Susan Johnson, Jeff Burniard

F. 2825 Calhoun St

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, raised basement, single-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting to better understand the interior conditions of the building.

By: Tim Lupin

Second: Shawanda Poree

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments: Public comments by Susan Johnson, Kukhee Choo

G. 1019 N Rendon

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof at a Contributing rated, single-story, single family residential building.

Motion: Grant approval of the demolition of more than 50% of the roof at a Contributing rated, single-story, single family residential building.

By: Ross Karsen

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments:

H. 8510 Cohn

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof and wall structure at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family building.

Motion: Grant approval of the demolition of more than 50% of the roof at a Contributing rated, single-story, single family residential building.

By: Tim Lupin

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:
Comments:

I. 6225 Annunciation

Application: Demolition of a Non-Contributing, single-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.

By: Tim Lupin

Second: Jim Ashbee

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments: Public comment card submitted by Susan Johnson

VI. New Business Retention Applications

A. 5617 Dauphine St

Application: Retention of the removal of ridge tiles at a Contributing rated, two-family, single-story residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of the removal of ridge tiles at a Contributing rated, two-family, single-story residential building provided that the reinstallation of the ridge tiles is included in the scope of work submitted by Restore Louisiana.

By: Adero Lewis

Second: Shawanda Poree

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 2217 Governor Nicholls St

Application: Retention the demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade at a Contributing rated, single-family, single-story residential building without a Certificate of Review.

Motion: Grant approval of the retention the demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade at a Contributing rated, single-family, single-story residential building without a Certificate of Review.

By: Shawanda Poree

Second: Tim Lupin

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Motion: Defer the vote to levy a fine. The HDLC Commission would like documentation of the building condition prior to the demolition and reframing prior to determining a fine.

By: Shawanda Poree

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 2425 St Philip

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the exterior walls and roof as well as demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade at a Contributing rate, single-story, single family residential building without a Certificate of Review.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that further research can be done on the building history.

By: Tim Lupin

Second: Anne Redd

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 2318 Burgundy St

Application: Retention of removal of one (1) masonry chimney from left-side structure without a Certificate of Appropriateness, and request to remove existing asphalt shingle roofing for replacement with new standing seam metal roofing at (2) two Contributing rated one-story, single-family residential buildings on a single lot of record, including removal of existing roof ridge tiles from the left-side structure.

Motion: Deny the request for retention of the masonry chimney removed previously without HDLC approval based on the HDLC Design Guidelines and because the noted storm damage and deterioration was not documented by the owner, because the exterior chimney was relatively simple in form/detail, the interior chimney remains intact, and because it is an important exterior architectural element that was highly visible from the public right of way. The Commission also included a proviso that the full chimney must be repaired, reconstructed, and reinstalled above the roofline to match the previously existing condition, materials, detailing, and appearance. Additionally, the Commission noted that if mortar repair at the interior portion of the chimney is required, HDLC strongly recommends utilizing the standard HDLC lime-based mortar formula as this will be most compatible with the existing historic masonry. This specification should be obtained from HDLC staff.

The Commission also voted to deny the request for installation of new standing seam metal roofing at the two structures because this is not considered an appropriate roof material for the historic buildings based on the HDLC Design Guidelines, the high visibility of the roofs from the street, and because the original roof material was confirmed to be true slate. HDLC recommends the applicant instead consider a standard or Fortified roof using either asphalt/fiberglass roof shingles or aluminum metal shingles (such as Permalock) which more accurately replicate the appearance of true slate, allow for the existing roof ridge tiles to remain, and can be approved at the staff level.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Tim Lupin

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments:

VIII. Ratification of the Architectural Review Committee and Staff Actions since the September 4th, 2024 meeting.

Motion: Approve the ARC and Staff Actions

By: Jason King

Second: Tim lupin

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jim Ashbee, Greg Hackenberg, Ross Karsen, Jason King, Tim Lupin, Shawanda Poree, Annie Irvin, Adero Lewis, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments:

IX. HDLC Reports and Communications

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.