

VIEUX CARRÉ COMMISSION ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE

Mitchell J. Landrieu
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Brian Block
INTERIM DIRECTOR

Architectural Committee meeting of **Tuesday, March 29th, 2016**

Committee Members Present: Daniel Taylor, Nick Musso, Rick Fifield,

Committee Members Absent: Dennis Brady, George Hero,

Staff Present: Bryan Block, Interim Director; Renee' Bourgoigne, Architectural Historian; Nicholas G. Albrecht, Plans Examiner; Erin Vogt, Plans Examiner; Jennie Garcia, Intern;

Staff Absent: Erika Gates, Building Inspector

Others Present: Mark Thomas, Henry Hanisee, John Williams, Kay Champagne, Juan Lara, Michelle Cumberland, David Carimi, Meg Lousteau, Karen Glaser Stein, Aleksandar Antonovic,

AGENDA

Old Business

546 St Peter St: Donald Zimmer, applicant; City of New Orleans, owner; Review of shop drawings for final approval to replace doors to match existing, per application conceptually approved by Commission 03/02/16 & materials submitted 03/09/16.

[The rules were temporarily suspended to hear this item of the agenda out of order.]

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Mr. Zimmer and Mr. Senner present on behalf of the application.

Mr. Musso moved to approve the proposal consistent with staff analysis and recommendation. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

[The rules were reinstated following the hearing of this item.]

311 Bourbon St: John C. Williams, applicant; The City Of New Orleans, owner; Proposal to add new exterior string lighting, per application & materials received 05/13/15 & 03/10/16, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Williams and Ms. Champagne present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that this lighting was a slippery slope, that there are more contemporary lighting options, and the string lighting have been rejected in the past.

Mr. Fifield stated that he does not find the string lighting objectionable in this instance. Mr. Musso again noted the precedent this could set and stated that alternatives could be explored. Mr. Williams stated that the French Market Corporation has approved these light fixtures. Mr. Musso noted that these types of lights cause glare which is discouraged by the guidelines.

Mr. Taylor asked if another type of string lighting would be approvable.

Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application to allow the applicant to work with staff utilizing the lighting guidelines. Mr. Musso seconded the motion. The motion passed with affirmative votes from Messrs. Taylor and Fifield. Mr. Musso abstained from voting.

808 Royal St: John C. Williams, applicant; N I C E Investments LLC, owner; Proposal to construct new four story building, per application and materials submitted 06/09/15 & 03/24/16, respectively.

The application was deferred at the request of the applicant.

411 Bourbon St: John C. Williams, applicant; Cajun 411 LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate structures and construct second floor addition, in conjunction with a proposed **change of use** from *night club/retail* to *restaurant*, per application & materials received 01/11/16 & 03/23/16, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Messrs. Williams and Lara present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that he generally agrees with the staff report and noted concerns with the issues stated by staff. Mr. Williams stated that the height of the second floor addition could be lowered to something that closer fits with the guidelines.

Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the application to see if the addition can proceed with a lower height. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

336 Decatur St: Mark Thomas, applicant; Joseph C Paciera, owner; Proposal to demolish existing yellow-rated structure and construct new three story building with rooftop terrace, per application and materials received 07/04/15 & 03/15/16, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Messrs. Thomas and Hanisee present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that he concurs with staff and there is still work to be done but he would be comfortable with conceptual approval at this point. Mr. Fifield stated that the proposed building is much more appropriate than previous iterations.

Mr. Block inquired how the Architectural Committee felt about the new building fenestration, specifically the header heights, in relation to the adjacent buildings. Mr. Musso stated that the site is atypical and very prominent. Mr. Taylor stated that he felt the regularity of fenestration within the building was more important than a slavish response to adjacencies.

Ms. Lousteau, in the audience, expressed concern for rooftop decks in general, hosting large crowds on the tops of buildings, as well as the sounds that may emanate from a rooftop and how that may affect neighboring residences. Ms. Lousteau stated that she hopes the Commission makes rules regarding rooftop decks. Mr. Musso noted that live entertainment would not be allowed on the rooftop deck and amplified music should be addressed by the sound ordinance.

Mr. Block asked the Architectural Committee how they felt about the proposed rooftop bar architecture. Mr. Musso responded that he did not like it but conceptually it could work and this element should be addressed by the Commission.

Mr. Fifield, in response to Ms. Lousteau's comments, noted that the proposed wall section on the N Peters elevation of the roof terrace would help to reduce noise and noted that the Commission hearing may be a better venue to address noise concerns.

Mr. Fifield then moved for **conceptual approval** and to forward the application to the Commission, consistent with the staff analysis and recommendation. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

822 Barracks St: Sarah Busch, applicant; Barda Properties LLC, owner; Review of changes to previously approved plans for renovations of green-rated buildings, per application & materials received 01/28/16.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. McMurphy present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that the use of a standing seam copper roof would be acceptable over the gallery. Mr. McMurphy stated that the pool design was not finalized. Mr. Musso recommended using a classical shape for the pool.

In reference to the aluminum gate, Mr. McMurphy stated that this gate could be changed to a wood louvered gate.

Mr. Fifield noted that not much detail was shown on the proposed handrail.

Mr. Fifield moved to **approve** the application, specifically removing the aluminum gate, pool, and handrail from the approval and specifying that standing seam copper would be used for the roof of the gallery. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1216-1222 Dauphine St: Sarah Busch, applicant; Barda Properties LLC, owner; Review of changes to previously approved plans, per application & materials received 01/29/16.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. McMurphy present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that he believes the change helps the proportions of the proposed new building. Mr. Fifield stated that he has no problems with the changes.

Mr. Musso moved to **approve** the changes as submitted. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

New Business

1022 St Peter St: Lee Page, applicant; Janet L Rail, Russell Mc Levy, Gay Gordon, Barry Starr, Pamela S Campion, Ira P Babin, II, Joseph R Linn Jr, Eunice G Gordon, Thomas L Keister, Marcia W Rosen, Michael Kendrick, Linda J Sumner Revocable Trust, Jude T Smith, Ellen G Wilson, John L Wilson, Condo Master Owner, Sanjo LLC, Jeffrey K Roby, Tony Viejo, Joseph R Linn Jr, William T Conger, Vito Petretti, owner; Proposal to install new structural tie and renovate exterior of green-rated service building, per application & materials submitted 01/07/16 & 02/29/16, respectively.

Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation with Mr. Bodet present on behalf of the application.

Mr. Fifield moved for **conceptual approval** consistent with the staff analysis and recommendation, with final details and approval to be completed by staff. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

400 N. Peters St: Amanda Story, applicant; Chalon F Seale, Elizabeth M Fontaine, Edgar B Fontaine Jr, Laura F Etienne, Nathan B Fontaine, Christian Fontaine, Joan M Fontaine, owners; Proposal to remove existing mechanical equipment and install new units, per application & materials submitted 02/02/16 & 02/18/16, respectively.

The application was deferred due to a lack of representation on behalf of the proposal.

632 Burgundy St: Kevin Buford, applicant; Kevin-Steven C Buford, owner; Proposal to remove deteriorated wooden driveway gate and pedestrian gate, and replace with ornamental iron gates, per application & materials received 02/10/16.

At the applicant's request, Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation without the applicant's presence on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that the applicant should include a proposed relocation of the mailbox or mail slot, since submitted drawings did not indicate a location or type of mailbox. Mr. Musso concurred with the staff recommendation that spiked finials be used rather than ornamental fleur-de-lis, and requested drawings be submitted for the pedestrian gate. Staff also recommended that the applicant propose a more secure type of locking mechanism for the gates.

Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the application, consistent with the staff analysis and recommendation, with final details and approval to be completed by staff after materials are revised and resubmitted by the applicant. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

933 Burgundy St: Charles Berg, applicant; Claus E. Sadlier, III, owner; Proposal to modify existing wood alleyway door with new iron grilles, per application and materials received 02/11/16.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Messrs. Berg and Sadlier present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that he has seen many instances of iron inserts in an open framework and that he has no problem with the submittal. Mr. Sadlier stated that he does not like the louvers, that with the additional gas lights in the alleyway the inserts would provide increased visibility.

Mr. Musso stated there is numerous precedence and that he has no problem with not using the louvered shutters.

Mr. Musso moved to **approve** the cast iron inserts with final details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

300 Bourbon St: Frank Trujillo, applicant; Royal Sonesta Inc, owner; Proposal to install two (2) new HVAC units on rooftop, per application and materials received 02/29/16.

At the applicant's request, Ms. Vogt gave the staff presentation without the applicant's presence on behalf of the application.

Mr. Musso moved for **approval** consistent with the staff analysis and recommendation, with final approval and permitting to be completed by staff. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1309 Dauphine St: Gene Guidry, applicant; J & R Rental Properties L L C, owner; Proposal to perform various repairs and other work throughout the property including demolition of an exterior wood stair and addition of new wood balcony columns, per application and materials received 03/01/16.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Antonovic present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that he concurred with the staff report and suggested reworking the outriggers instead of adding any additional columns.

Mr. Musso moved to **approve** the application consistent with the staff recommendation to exclude the columns and to allow final details to be worked out at the staff level. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

806 Conti St: Rebekah Williams, applicant; Johnny Provenza, owner; Proposal to stucco over existing brick on the ground floor of the Conti elevation, per application & materials received 03/04/16.

The application was deferred due to a lack of representation on behalf of the proposal.

1000-1012 St. Philip: Karen Glaser Stein, applicant; Philip Stein, owner; Proposal to add metal mesh backing to existing metal gates, per application & materials received 03/07/16.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Ms. Stein present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that just because the specific language regarding metal backings to metal gates was deleted from the new guidelines does not mean they are allowed. Mr. Musso further noted that metal structural reinforcement to wood gates has been allowed.

Mr. Fifield inquired about the issues leading to the request of the metal backing. Ms. Stein stated that she has small pets that can slip between the pickets. Mr. Fifield inquired if adding additional pickets between the existing pickets would be acceptable. Mr. Musso responded that that could be

an acceptable solution.

Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application to allow the applicant to work out a solution with staff. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

Appeals & Violations

546 St Peter St: Donald Zimmer, applicant; City of New Orleans, owner; Appeal to retain mechanical equipment in lightwell, installed without benefit of VCC review or approval, per application received 03/18/16.

At the request of the Committee, Ms. Vogt gave the staff report despite a lack of representation on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that the Committee has previously disallowed use of light wells for similar mechanical installations but may make exception in this case.

Mr. Block replied that permitting the equipment in its current location would allow the previously approved door restoration (Permit Number 15-19202), which is contingent upon a decrease in kitchen size. Mr. Musso stated that it may be possible for the Commission to permit the equipment as an exception since there are no suitable alternate locations.

Mr. Fifield asked for clarification that the equipment was installed without permit. Mr. Block stated that he had completed a site inspection with a mechanical inspector from the Department of Safety and Permits, and that the mechanical division had retroactively approved the equipment. Mr. Block confirmed that no VCC permit was issued prior to installation. Mr. Musso stated that the Commission could potentially require provisos for retroactive permitting, mentioning that the equipment may be permitted with a caveat that it be removed upon change of use or transfer of lease.

The presence of a representative from the French Market Corporation was also requested by the Committee.

Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the application so legal council could be consulted, clearly stating that there would be no action for removal of the equipment, but that the Commission may place conditions upon the permit that would relate to the terms of the lease. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

511 Bourbon St: L Katherine Harmon, applicant; Brevort Enterprises LLC, owner; Proposal to address outstanding violations with modification to existing courtyard structures and construction of new structure, per application & materials received 11/18/15 & 03/03/16, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Ms. Harmon present on behalf of the application. Messrs. Musso and Fifield both stated they felt positive about the application as submitted.

With no additional discussion necessary, Mr. Musso moved to **approve** the application as submitted. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

300-304 Royal St: Carimi Construction & Development LLC, applicant; Bunthorne LLC, owner; Proposal to retain four (4) gas lanterns installed without benefit of VCC review or approval, per application & materials received 02/11/16. **[Notice of Violation sent 01/07/16]**

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Carimi present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso suggested the use of two (2) lanterns and new under balcony LED light fixtures, noting that he would prefer the lanterns to go away entirely and have all downlight fixtures.

Mr. Carimi stated the reason for this application was because of a major miscommunication between the contractor and the new commercial tenant.

Ms. Lousteau, in the audience, inquired about the height of the lanterns above the sidewalk. Mr. Musso estimated they were approximately 7 or 8 feet above the sidewalk.

Mr. Fifield asked the applicant if the lantern installation was tied into the lease agreement for the commercial space. Mr. Carami stated that it was but they could come up with a more comprehensive lighting plan.

Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application to allow the applicant to come up with a comprehensive lighting plan. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

221-225 Bourbon St.: Sarah Nickelotte, applicant; Mildred P Randon, owner; Appeal of staff denial to retain approximately forty-six (46) signs installed in ground floor door lites without benefit of VCC review or approval, per application received 02/16/16. **[Notice of Violation sent 10/11/13]**

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Ms. Cumberland present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that neither the quantity nor quality of the signs were approvable, noting that the guidelines do not permit anything that darken out or make windows opaque.

Mr. Musso moved to **deny** the application. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

600 Esplanade Ave: Kyle Schonekas, applicant; Kyle D Schonekas, owner; Proposal to leave previously collapsed balcony overhang unrepaired, per application received 03/03/16. **[Notice of Violation sent 04/22/15 & 02/11/16]**

With no one present to represent the application, Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application for thirty days. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1117 Decatur: William Sonner, applicant, owner: Decatur Street Properties LLC; Proposal to retain unpermitted walk-in cooler in rear courtyard and install new mechanical screening, per application & materials received 03/16/16.

The application was deferred due to a lack of representation on behalf of the proposal.

Next AC Date: Tuesday, April 12, 2016

Upon request, a sign language interpreter for the hearing impaired will be available at the meeting. To place a request for sign language interpreter services, please call TDDY at (504) 658-2059 or 1-800-981-6652.