

VIEUX CARRÉ COMMISSION ARCHITECTURAL COMMITTEE

Mitchell J. Landrieu
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Bryan Block
INTERIM DIRECTOR

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING

Architectural Committee meeting of **Tuesday, April 26th, 2016**

Committee Members Present: Daniel Taylor, Nick Musso, Rick Fifield

Committee Members Absent: Dennis Brady, George Hero,

Staff Present: Bryan Block, Interim Director; Renee' Bourgogne, Architectural Historian; Nicholas G. Albrecht, Plans Examiner; Erin Vogt, Plans Examiner; Erika Gates, Building Inspector; Jennie Garcia, Intern

Others Present: Kate and Richard Bishop, Meg Lousteau, Mark Thomas, Henry Hanisee, John C. Williams, Hank Smith, Stephen Broussard

AGENDA

Old Business

336 Decatur St, 400 Conti St: Mark Thomas, applicant; Joseph C Paciera, owner; Proposal to demolish existing yellow-rated structure and construct new three story building with rooftop terrace, per application and materials received 07/04/15 & 04/19/16, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Messrs. Thomas and Hanisee present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated the proposal was more indicative of a new building on a new site.

Mr. Fifield inquired about the purported sound study. Mr. Hanisee replied that the sound consultant stated that the revised roof element helps to contain the sound and that the sound would travel horizontally and up from the rooftop but not down. Mr. Hanisee continued that only one building nearby which was five stories would be affected by sound coming from the roof. Mr. Fifield stated that he was also concerned with sound from the second and third floors galleries and asked about a covenant regarding live music.

Mr. Hanisee stated that live music was only allowed ten (10) times throughout the year. Mr. Hanisee continued that the galleries would only be used for dining, rather than standing room, and no speakers would be installed on the outside of the building.

Ms. Lousteau, in the audience, expressed concern regarding the use of the outdoor space, noting that the proposed operators would not be the last owner or operator of the building. Ms. Lousteau inquired if there were any covenants being put in place for the long term. Finally, Ms. Lousteau stated that VCE-1 zoning allows for live entertainment daily.

Mr. Hanisee stated that a sound study would limit the ambient noise level at the street no more than 10 dB above the existing condition. Mr. Block noted that this was not the appropriate venue to discuss issues of noise or use. The review at hand should remain on the merits of the architecture presented.

Mr. Musso stated that there needs to be a resolution with the BZA concerning the matter of open space. Mr. Block stated that the BZA had inquired if the proposal could move forward with the required open space. A copy of the report will be forwarded to BZA along with the current set of review drawings.

Mr. Fifield stated a desire to see a report from the BZA regarding the open space. Mr. Hanisee presented a drawing showing what the proposed building would look like with the required 20%

open space. Mr. Fifield noted that the drawing showed the proposed building with a hatched area in the middle representing the open space. Mr. Hanisee commented that because of the location of stairs, elevators, and mechanical equipment, as well as the need for two means of egress the hatched area was located where it was. Mr. Fifield responded that two means of egress are not needed for many buildings, only the proposed building, providing an example that a one-story pavilion on the site would not have such a requirement for egress. Mr. Musso requested that VCC staff be present at the BZA hearing for this property.

Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the application until such time as the BZA has responded to the application for a waiver of the open space requirement. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

916 Governor Nicholls St: Robert Cangelosi, Jr., applicant; Michael W Magner, owner; Proposal to renovate and restore building to single-family use, per application and drawings received 03/26/15 & 03/28/16.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report with Mr. Cangelosi representing the application.

Mr. Musso moved for **approval** of the application, with final review and approval to be completed by staff. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

1140 Decatur St, 47-49 French Market Place: Harold Flettrich Jr, applicant; Gold Leaf Investments LLC, owner; Proposal to install air intake in ground floor arched transom window, per application and revised materials received 05/11/15 & 04/19/16, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Broussard present on behalf of the application.

With no discussion necessary, Mr. Musso moved to accept the recommendation of the staff and **approve** the application. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

315 Decatur St: John C. Williams, applicant; Vieux Carre Ventures LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate building including installation of new windows in Conti side party wall, per application & materials received 07/28/15 & 04/15/16, respectively.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report, with Messrs. Williams and Harwood representing the application. Mr. Fifield recommended that the applicant revise the proposed new windows, detailing them as six-over-six double-hung windows (that remain fixed) rather than as single fixed 12-lite panels. Mr. Fifield explained that the depth and shadows created by a sash bar would be more appropriate. The Committee also agreed that the iron gate, as proposed, is approvable.

After a brief discussion about the replacement of two inappropriate doors installed on the first floor that are proposed for demolition, the Committee agreed that the replacement doors could be approved by staff.

Mr. Fifield moved to **approve** the construction documents, with the applicant to submit the final set for staff review and permit. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

822 N Rampart St: John C. Williams, applicant; North Rampart Properties LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate building in conjunction with a proposed **change of use** from *vacant* to *commercial/residential*, per application & materials received 08/25/15 & 12/17/15, respectively.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report, with Mr. Williams representing the application. Mr. Musso stated that the set would need to be scrutinized for consistency by the applicant and resubmitted for final approval.

Mr. Musso moved to **approve** the proposal consistent with staff analysis and recommendation,

with final approval and permitting to be completed by staff. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

204 Decatur St, 205 Clinton St: Harry Baker Smith Architects, applicant; Decatur Live LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate structure and install balconies, in conjunction with a proposed **change of use** from *vacant* to *restaurant/residential*, per application & materials received 02/15/16 & 04/19/16.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report, with Mr. Smith representing the application. Mr. Musso stated that he felt the changes made since the last meeting had improved the proposal. Mr. Fifield asked if the proposed balconies included any plan to modify the existing windows; Mr. Smith stated that they would not be altered. Mr. Fifield suggested that Mr. Smith consider cast iron panels for the balcony railing rather than a plain spindle.

Mr. Fifield voiced concern regarding the installation of balconies on the Decatur elevation, suggesting that the applicant consider replicating the historic awning and installing a protective rail within the existing window frame. Mr. Musso hesitated to agree, stating that the awning would have been utilized as occupied space, considering the full length windows.

Mr. Musso moved for **conceptual approval** of the application including the proposed **change of use** and other renovations, but *specifically excluding the Decatur balcony from the recommendation to the Commission*. Mr. Musso recommended that the applicant propose an additional Decatur elevation, so that both an awning and a balcony could be considered further before receiving Committee recommendation. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, forwarding the application to the Commission for review. The motion passed unanimously.

New Business

620 Decatur St: Stevie Garcia, applicant; The Iff LLC, New Jax Commercial LLC, DMK Group Three LLC, 416 Bourbon St LLC, New Jax Commercial LLC, Syed N Abbas, The Penthouse At Jax, LLC, Vanderbilt New Orleans LLC, Tigers, L.L.C. Iberia, William S Everitt, Ms Jane Ann's Quarter Quarters, LLC, Charles F Post, 820 Decatur LLC, Raymond R Morris, Stephen J Schmidt, The Spruce Pine Trust, Jeanette B Ogden, George L Jones Trust, Louisiana Cvs Pharmacy, LLC, New Jax Rh, LLC, L & L Investment Group, LLC, Rachael C Kinberger, Castille Investments LLC, Friday Properties New Orleans LLC, Micheal D Krochak, Roy Investments Properties LLC, Gsb Holdings LLC, Michael D Krochak, Peter S Escamilla, Thomas J Ward; Proposal to install single signs per face of existing clock/sign, per application & materials received 04/29/15 & 04/18/16, respectively.

The item was **deferred** prior to the meeting at the applicant's request.

806 Conti St: Rebekah Williams, applicant; Johnny Provenza, owner; Proposal to stucco over existing brick on the ground floor of the Conti elevation, per application & materials received 03/04/16.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Ms. Williams present on behalf of the application. There was a brief discussion regarding the fact that an inspection of 04/25/16 showed that the ground floor had already been stuccoed, although it seemingly done using Portland cement. Mr. Musso moved to **forward** this application directly to the Commission for consideration. Mr. Fifield requested that the staff visit the site and review the detailing, mix, and resolution of stucco at window and door locations.

Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

301 Royal St, 701-713 Bienville: Michael Tabb, applicant; Bunthorne LLC, owner; Proposal to install new rooftop mechanical equipment in conjunction with a **change of use** from *retail* to *restaurant*, per application & materials received 03/11/16 & 04/11/16, respectively.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Tabb present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso concurred with the recommendation of the staff and moved for **approval** of the application as well as sending the rear building to the full Commission for consideration of re-rating. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

226-28 Bourbon St: Kristine Shull, applicant; 226-28 Bourbon Street LLC, owner; Proposal to repoint, repair failing window lintels and repair deteriorating flat roof and liquid flashing, per application & materials received 03/17/16 & 03/31/16.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report, with Mr. Fabacher representing the application. Mr. Musso stated that the partial deferral would alter the sequence of the work. Mr. Musso moved to accept the recommendation of the staff and **approve** the application, requesting that staff monitor the sequence and progress of the work. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

524-28 Dauphine St: Micah Loewenthal, applicant; Eric Hatten, Rodney S Ryan, Jonathan P Dolese, Condo Master Owner, owner; Proposal to install new standing seam metal roof on main building, per application & materials submitted 04/06/16.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report, with Mr. Loewenthal representing the application. Considering the 5/12 slope of the hip-and-gable roof, and understanding the history of multiple cementitious slate-type shingle roof failures at this property, staff found that a natural slate roof may be the only permissible installation for this green-rated structure, and recommended denial of the application to install a standing seam metal roof.

Mr. Musso concurred with staff that slate would be the most appropriate material and that standing seam metal could not be approved. Mr. Fifield stated that any hardship involving the cost of a slate roof would have to be appealed to the Commission and could not be considered by the Committee.

Mr. Musso moved to accept the staff recommendation of **denial**. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

222-224 Decatur St, 231 Clinton: Jennifer Rowe, applicant; 222 Decatur LLC, 214 Decatur Street Development LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate building including addition of new rooftop mechanical equipment and removal of iron shutters, per application & materials received 04/08/16.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Fabacher present on behalf of the application.

Mr. Musso suggested submitting a replication of iron shutters to staff for review. Mr. Fifield inquired if the applicant had any objections to retaining the iron shutters. Mr. Fabacher responded that he had no objection to retaining the existing pair but could not speak to replicating shutters for all openings.

Mr. Musso moved to accept the recommendation of the staff to **approve** the application except for the removal of the iron shutters. Mr. Musso stated the applicant should consult with the owner regarding the installation of iron shutters throughout the property.

There was a discussion regarding removal of the existing historic fabric vs. requiring iron shutters on all 2nd, 3rd, and 4th floors on both the Decatur and Clinton elevations.

Mr. Fifield seconded the motion for **approval** of the application in general and **deferral** regarding the shutters, which passed unanimously.

816 Burgundy St: Marcus Calhoun, applicant; Burgundy Holdings LLC, owner; Proposal to construct two additions including a one-story rooftop addition and a two-story side addition, per application & materials received 04/08/16.

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Calhoun present on behalf of the application. Mr. Musso stated that the configuration and position of the proposed rooftop addition did not help the applicant's cause and suggested submitting some site line studies to show the effect a revised proposal may have. Mr. Block stated that the guidelines explicitly prohibit rooftop additions on two-story, residential buildings.

Mr. Fifield stated that there is a logic to the roof plan. However, the proposed side addition may create problems with water draining towards the neighbor's property line. Mr. Fifield suggested studying this aspect of the proposal and submitting more information regarding what this side of the building may look like.

Mr. Fifield continued that he did not believe the rooftop addition was appropriate.

Meg Lousteau, in the audience, stated that the rooftop addition was jarring and encouraged the Architectural Committee to respect the Guidelines which explicitly prohibit this. Ms. Lousteau encouraged the applicants to reconsider the proposal for any kind of rooftop addition.

Mr. Fifield moved to support the staff recommendation of **deferral** to allow the applicant to address the staff and Committee concerns. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

901-03 Dauphine St, 901-905 Dumaine: John Crouch, applicant; Leland T Vandeventer, Judy P Steele, owner; Proposal to restore historic soffit detail, per application & materials received 04/11/16.

The item was **deferred** due to a lack of representation on behalf of the application.

521-29 Bienville St: Rachel Davis, applicant; Tomirene Co LLC, owner; Proposal to construct new brick portico and wrought iron fence on rear elevation, per application & materials received 04/12/16.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report, with Mr. Fabacher representing the application. Mr. Taylor asked if the restaurant is operating; Mr. Fabacher responded it is prepared to open, but had not yet opened. Mr. Block commented that the addition of the portico would lend a misleading history to date of construction, as the style and age of the portico conflict with the existing industrial building. Mr. Fabacher stated that the portico was intended to resolve water intrusion issues, as well as provide covered seating. Mr. Fifield inquired about the rear windows, and suggested that an overhang be proposed as an outdoor amenity rather than as a method of remediating leakage issues. Mr. Taylor asked if the interior slab was lower than exterior grade; the applicant responded that it is.

Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the application, and encouraged the applicant to revise the proposal. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

907-17 Governor Nicholls St, 1211-15 Dauphine: John C. Williams, applicant; 913 Governor Nicholls LLC, owner; Proposal to renovate existing building, demolish existing parking structure, and construct new three story building, per application & materials received 04/13/16.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report, with Mr. Williams representing the application. Mr. Musso concurred with staff, adding that there would be legal and zoning considerations for an application involving two lots of record, and suggested that the applicant immediately acquire surveys for both lots.

Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the application until all necessary information could be submitted regarding a possible resubdivision.

Mr. Block asked the Committee to voice their first impressions of the proposed design. Mr. Fifield stated that the building would be highly visible from multiple surrounding blocks, particularly considering its adjacency to Cabrini Park. Mr. Fifield noted that the appearance of the building on Dauphine had an “applied historicism,” and would need to be heavily reconsidered before any further Committee review. Mr. Fifield also commented that the prominence of the garage door on the Dauphine elevation placed an emphasis upon the building’s interaction with cars rather than pedestrians. Mr. Taylor voiced strong concerns about the scale of the proposed new construction, mentioning that neighboring properties would likely share those concerns.

Meg Lousteau, Executive Director of Vieux Carre Property Owners, Residents, and Associates, spoke on behalf of her organization, stating that the proposed project would have an enormous impact on the square, and that all aspects of the project including scale, materials, etc. should require considerable revision.

Mr. Fifield recommended that the applicant prepare a physical model in order to show the proposed new construction within context during subsequent reviews. With Mr. Musso’s motion on the table, Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

Appeals & Violations

609-15 Iberville St: Joseph Lantz, applicant; New Hotel Monteleone, owner; Appeal to retain generator room, vents and access doors installed without benefit of VCC review or approval, per application & materials received 02/04/15 & 10/22/15, respectively.

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report, with Mr. Choate representing the application. Mr. Choate stated that the final drawings were submitted through proper channels and was unaware that they had bypassed final VCC review and permitting. Mr. Choate explained that the existing courtyard is approximately 8’-0” x 14’-0” and that the mechanical engineers made the grilles larger due to the lack of airflow in the small courtyard.

Mr. Block stated that he did not believe that the applicant had intended to avoid VCC review, but that Committee review was necessary since generator installations are not approvable at staff level.

Mr. Musso moved to **approve** the existing conditions, requesting that the applicant provide as-built drawings and photos. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

340 Chartres St: Mercier Realty & Investment Company, applicant; Mercier Realty & Inv Co, owner; Proposal to **demolish** yellow-rated building and to construct a masonry wall with double-leafed fence, per application & materials received 02/10/15. **[Notices of Violations sent 04/23/09, 9/20/13, 12/19/14]**

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Messrs. Werling and ??? present on behalf of the application.

Mr. Musso inquired if the applicants have explored donating the building only to adjacent property owners. Mr. ?? stated that they have proposed that to neighboring property owners but none of them are interested in responding in writing. Mr. ?? stated that the long term plans of the owners is to build a building on the site but such a proposal is not feasible at the current time.

Mr. Taylor stated that this building is a unique circumstance and it would be much easier to

consider the demolition of this building if the owners had plans for the development of the corner. Mr. Musso inquired if the owners could return with a proposal for a development that could reach a starting point within the next calendar year. Mr. Taylor noted that vacant land in the French Quarter is a form of urban blight and the proposed demolition would be much easier with a plan to address the rest of the lot which is vacant land.

Mr. Musso moved to **defer** the application pending receipt of a comprehensive plan for the entire site. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

Complete Minutes Needed.

831 Decatur St: Tommie Aysenne, applicant; The Ingram Family Trust, owner; Proposal to alter first floor fenestration, per application & revised materials received 06/05/15 & 04/15/16, respectively. **[STOP WORK ORDER placed 03/22/16; Notices of Violation sent 09/30/15 and 03/03/16]**

Complete Minutes Needed.

612-14 Dauphine St: Brian Swier, applicant; Brian G Swier, owner; Appeal to retain existing skylights, corrugated metal roof and metal French doors installed without benefit of VCC review or approval, per application & materials submitted 03/14/16. **[Notice of Violation sent 02/11/16]**

Ms. Vogt presented the staff report, with Mr. Swier representing the application.

Complete Minutes Needed.

600-02 Esplanade Ave, 1315-1321 Chartres: Kyle Schonekas, applicant; Kyle D Schonekas, owner; Proposal to leave previously collapsed balcony overhang unrepaired, per application received 03/03/16. **[Notice of Violation sent 02/11/16]**

Mr. Albrecht gave the staff presentation with Mr. Schonekas present on behalf of the application. Mr. Schonekas stated that he was not receptive to the idea of demolishing the brown-rated addition. Mr. Musso stated that the building does call for a canopy, noting that the proportions from the second floor openings up to the parapet were awkward. Mr. Musso suggested that the applicant make a proposal for some type of canopy to diminish the bare space above the second floor openings.

Mr. Fifield noted that the health and maintenance of the balcony would be improved by covering it. Mr. Fifield moved to **defer** the application to allow the applicant to consider the comments of the staff report and make a proposal for some type of overhang. Mr. Musso seconded the motion, which passed unanimously.

709-711 Bourbon St: Tony Stafford Jr, applicant; Seven-Eleven Bourbon, LLC, owner; Proposal to correct or retain various violations including exterior gas lines, mechanical equipment, TV's, lighting, and security cameras, per application & materials received 03/31/16. **[Notice of Violation sent 09/29/15]**

With no one present to represent the application, the matter was deferred.

With no other business to discuss, Mr. Fifield moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion, seconded by Mr. Musso, passed unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 3:55 PM.