

## VIEUX CARRE COMMISSION

LaToya Cantrell  
MAYOR

CITY OF NEW ORLEANS

Bryan Block  
DIRECTOR

Minutes of the **Vieux Carré Commission** meeting of **Wednesday, September 4, 2019, 1:30 P.M.**

**COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:** Mamie Gasperecz, acting Chairperson  
Bill Keck  
Angela King  
Toni DiMaggio  
Rodney Villarreal  
Priscilla Lawrence  
Rick Fifield

**COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:** None

**STAFF PRESENT:** Bryan D. Block, Director; Renée Bourgogne, Architectural Historian  
**STAFF ABSENT:** Erin Vogt, Senior Building Plans Examiner; Nicholas Albrecht, Senior Building Plans Examiner; Marguerite Roberts, Inspector; Tony Whitfield, Inspector

### I. ROLL CALL

Mr. Block called the meeting to order and noted that as there was not currently a full slate of Commissioners, it would not be appropriate at the present time to elect officers. Mr. Block stated that legal had instructed him to have the rules suspended in order for the commissioners to add an election of temporary officers to the agenda.

Mr. Fifield moved to suspend the rules to allow for the temporary election of officers. Ms. Gasperecz seconded the motion, and the motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Fifield nominated Ms. Gasperecz to act as the temporary chairperson for the September 4, 2019, meeting. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the nomination and the nomination passed unanimously.

Mr. Block read the roll and noted that all seven of the current Commission members were in attendance.

### II. REVIEW OF MINUTES

Ms. DiMaggio moved that the minutes of the Vieux Carré Commission meeting of August 21, 2019 be approved as previously circulated. Mr. Fifield seconded the motion and the motion passed unanimously.

### III. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

Ms. Gasperecz expressed her appreciation to all Commissioners for being in attendance.

### IV. DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Block reported that Ms. Keely Thibodaux had been approved by the Governmental Affairs Committee as a new Commissioner At-Large and that her confirmation would be upheld by City Council on 9/5/2019.

### V. CHANGE OF USE HEARINGS

**519-23 Iberville St: 19-21056-VCGEN;** Raymond Bergeron, applicant; Anthony J Livaccari, Donald Jr Navatto, Geever Kevin P Mc, James M Carter, James H Farris, Condo Master, Nira Agrawal, Anthony J Livaccari, Patricia D Smith, owner; Proposal to construct new walk-in cooler and install

hood vent, in conjunction with **change of use** from *vacant* to *restaurant*, per application & materials received 07/02/19 & 08/06/19, respectively.

*\*NOTE: This application was heard after the discussion of 730 St. Louis.*

Mr. Block read the staff report. There was no one present on behalf of the application. (It was later determined that they had been misdirected by the receptionists at the One Stop Shop office and therefore missed the hearing through no fault of their own.)

With no discussion Mr. Fifield moved for the **conceptual approval** of the proposal consistent with the staff report. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion at which time Mr. Villarreal expressed concern with the total number of restaurants being proposed within the District, which he feared was displacing French Quarter residents. He stated that he found this trend to be particularly alarming as a French Quarter resident himself. He stated that he was aware that the VCC had no jurisdiction over use and that he understood other departments had more control. He further stated that there needed to be protections in place to ensure that large numbers of restaurants and bars do not detrimentally affect the *tout ensemble* of the District, which the VCC is charged with protecting.

Mr. Fifield expressed appreciation for Mr. Villarreal's position and stated that this particular case was returning a vacant commercial space to active commerce. Mr. Fifield further stated that it was not the responsibility to the Commission to dictate specific uses.

Following the discussion Ms. Gasperecz called the vote and the motion for conceptual approval passed unanimously.

## **VI. APPEALS AND VIOLATIONS**

**730 St Louis St: 19-22553-VCGEN**: Kirk Fabacher, applicant; Latval Investments LLC, owner; Appeal of Committee denial to install standing seam metal roof, per application & materials received 07/18/19.

*\*NOTE: This application was heard prior to the discussion of 519-523 Iberville.*

Mr. Block read the staff report with Mr. Fabacher present on behalf of the application.

Mr. Fabacher stated that the current metal roofing had been popular in the mid-19<sup>th</sup> century and that since the existing corrugated metal roof had been in place for such a long time it had become part of the building's history. Mr. Fabacher did agree however, that although the proposed standing seam metal roofing might be an appropriate material, the corrugated metal was not and should not be applied to green rated building. Mr. Fabacher agreed that setting such a precedent would not be optimal even if the roof was not readily visible from the street.

Mr. Block stated that VCC maintains jurisdiction over the roofs of buildings within the district whether or not they are visible from the public right-of-way. He further stated that it would be highly likely that the roof in question would be visible from top of other buildings in the surrounding area. Ms. Lawrence stated that this roof would likely be visible from the balconies of Antoine's restaurant directly across St. Louis street.

Ms. Lawrence further inquired as to the purpose of the proposed metal roofing as opposed to the more appropriate slate shingle roof. Mr. Fabacher stated that the matter was strictly cost related. Ms. Lawrence asked staff if there was an acceptable slate alternative. Mr. Block reiterated that a cementitious slate shingle would be approvable and would be less expensive than a natural slate shingle, but ultimately more expensive than a standing seam metal material. He further stated that the cementitious slate was a staff approvable item and would not require further VCC, or AC review.

Mr. Fifield inquired as to whether the sheathing beneath the existing roofing had been investigated. Mr. Fabacher replied that it had not been. Mr. Fifield stated that this would possibly provide more information as to the history of roofing materials that have existed on this building over time.

Ms. Gasperecz inquired about the exhaust fan shown on the plans and asked if the fan was different from the existing vent. Mr. Fabacher stated that it was shown on the plans as new but in the same location as the existing.

Mr. Villarreal stated that the French Quarter roofline is a very important element of VCC jurisdiction.

Mr. Fifield moved to defer the matter to allow the applicant further time to investigate the existing roof conditions and return to the Architecture Committee with an alternative proposal. Mr. Fabacher requested that if there was no evidence to support the application a metal roofing material, would staff be able to approve the installation of the synthetic slate-type shingles. Mr. Fifield amended his motion to accept Mr. Fabacher's request. Ms. Dimaggio seconded the amended motion and the motion passed unanimously.

**I. RATIFICATION** of Architectural Committee and Staff actions since the Wednesday, August 21, 2019 VCC meeting.

Mr. Fifield moved to ratify the Staff actions since August 21, 2019. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion, and the motion passed unanimously.

With no other business to discuss, Mr. Fifield moved to adjourn the meeting. Ms. DiMaggio seconded the motion, and the motion passed unanimously. The meeting was adjourned at approximately 2pm.